The Dissertation Committee for Clariza Ruiz De Castilla Certifies that this is the approved version of the following dissertation:

CITIZENSHIP CONSTRUCTIONS: RHETORIC, IMMIGRATION, AND ARIZONA'S SB 1070

Committee:

Barry Brummett, Supervisor

Dana Cloud

Teresita (Tere) Garza

Maggie Rivas-Rodriguez

Natalie (Talia) Jomini Stroud

CITIZENSHIP CONSTRUCTIONS:
RHETORIC, IMMIGRATION, AND ARIZONA'S SB 1070

by

Clariza Ruiz De Castilla, B.A.; M.A.

Dissertation

Presented to the Faculty of the Graduate School of

The University of Texas at Austin

in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements

for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

The University of Texas at Austin

May 2013

DEDICATION

For my parents, Paul, and Michelle, with love

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The support of several people in my life was required to complete this dissertation. First and foremost, I would like to thank Dr. Barry Brummett for being my advisor. His consistent and prompt feedback at each stage of this process motivated me. Second I would like to thank the rest of my committee members. Dr. Dana Cloud, thank you for your support and encouragement over all these years. Dr. Talia Stroud, thank you for your wonderful suggestions and for being a part of this project. Dr. Maggie Rivas-Rodriguez, thank you for your positive comments and insights on Spanish news media. Dr. Teresita Garza, thank you for your tremendous help not only with this dissertation but also with all the conference panels over the years. I feel so honored to have such an incredible committee. Lastly, special thanks to Laura Sanders for editing this dissertation.

I would also like to thank others at the University of Texas who have motivated me during this process. Thank you to Zazil Reyes Garcia, Samuel Palomares, Flor Madero, Keri Thompson, Preeti Mudliar, Matt Morris, and Lynsey Kluever Romo for their friendship. I am lucky to have had your encouragement over all these years.

I am tremendously grateful for that support beyond UT. I would not be writing any of this if it were not for J. Scott Rodriguez who gave me the debate and research skills necessary for graduate school. I also need to thank the following friends and colleagues: Dr. David Olsen, Bertha Perez-Lopez, Luisa Gracias, Cindy Phu, Carmen Rodriguez, Celina Zisman, Doug and Jacob Leveton, Jeff Murphy, Sabrina Fulcher, Winter Wilks, Eric D. Waters, Dr. Kevin Thomas, Astra Mahabir, Mariangela Rodriguez, Omar Vargas, Paulette Cisternas, Veronica Rodriguez, Diana and Jeff Bowen, Manny &

Selina Rodriguez, Jose and Elizabeth Villagran, Delia Hilda Rosado, and Irvin Castellanos.

Like all projects, this collective endeavor was not only possible thanks to my friends, mentors, and colleagues listed above but also my family. *Mamá, gracias por tu amor y apoyo*. Mom, thank you for continuing to support me from far away. Your unconditional love has helped me get through this process. I am lucky to have your support whether it is in my schooling or marathoning. *Papá, gracias por enseñarme el valor de una buena educación*. Dad, thank you for showing me, from a young age, the value of a good education. Thanks to Paul and Michelle for their love and support. Paul, thank you for always making me laugh and reassuring me that I could accomplish any goal I set for myself. Also, thanks for always making the time and effort to visit me in Austin. No matter the distance, I know you are always there for me. Michelle, I am so grateful for the close relationship that we have now. No matter where we are, in Miami, Los Angeles, or Austin, I always have the best of times with you two. Many thanks (*mil gracias*) to the rest of my family: Jennifer & Alexa Ruiz De Castilla, Michael Canepa, Vanessa Salinas, Jessica Olivera, Pamela & Osgui Martinez, *tía* Eva, *tía* Tina, *tía* Teresa, *tía* Olivia, and *tío* Freddy.

Finally, Dr. Jorge Peña, thank you for never letting me give up. Whenever I doubted myself, your positive attitude and words helped me change my attitude. “It is all doable” will forever be imprinted in my mind. I am a better scholar and individual because of you. *Gracias, viejo querido, por todo*.

CITIZENSHIP CONSTRUCTIONS: RHETORIC, IMMIGRATION, AND ARIZONA'S SB 1070

Clariza Ruiz De Castilla, Ph.D.

The University of Texas at Austin, 2013

Supervisor: Barry Brummett

On April 23, 2010, Arizona Governor Jan Brewer signed Senate Bill 1070 ("Support Our Law Enforcement and Safe Neighborhoods Act") into law. This legislative effort raised questions about how political and legal thought are immersed in talk of citizenship in our present time. While the Supreme Court rejected the majority of this law two years after it was signed, concerns over issues of legality, law enforcement, and citizenship still remain. The main questions posed in this dissertation are the following: How are Latinos portrayed as citizens by media? What types and tones of citizenship are advanced in SB 1070 news coverage?

To learn more about citizenship constructions, I analyzed newspaper coverage of SB 1070 by using a critical approach that combines quantitative and rhetorical analyses. I examined the following six newspapers were examined: *Los Angeles Times* and *La Opinión* (Los Angeles); *Miami Herald* and *Diario Las Américas* (Miami)*; Arizona Republic* and *Prensa Hispana* (Phoenix). They were reviewed over a six month period, specifically from December 1, 2009, to May 31, 2010. I searched each edition by using physical copies, microfilm, and internet databases, for stories on immigration, Latinos,

and citizenship as it related to SB 1070. After these newspapers were collected, a content analysis was conducted followed by a close textual analysis.

The data reveals three major findings. The first finding is that both English and Spanish newspapers tend to frame citizenship as legal status. The second finding is that Spanish newspapers require their news consumers to translate between languages (specifically English and Spanish), as well as consider different cultures (American and Latino customs) and diverse politicians (international political figures). The third finding is that Spanish newspapers provide many more photos, especially of protests against this legislative effort. The two main conclusions of this dissertation are (1) that Spanish newspapers require their readers to have a double-consciousness, and (2) that there is value in using more than one kind of methodology.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION: CONCERNING CITIZENSHIP

On April 23, 2010, Arizona Governor Jan Brewer signed SB 1070 ("Support Our Law Enforcement and Safe Neighborhoods Act") into law. This piece of legislation, which was modified a week later (by Arizona House Bill 2162), represented the "broadest and strictest anti-illegal immigration measure in the United States in decades" (Archibold, 2010, para. 3). The law was written to require: illegal aliens[1] to register with the U.S. government and to carry registration documents at all times, law enforcement officials to enforce strict immigration laws, and citizens of Arizona to curb practices of sheltering, hiring, and transporting illegal aliens.

Responses to this legislation from the American public were mixed. On the one hand, those individuals and groups who did not support SB 1070, such as the National Association of Latino Elected and Appointed Officials Educational Fund (NALEO), labeled this legislation as one that promoted racial profiling (Lakshman, 2010). Additionally, tens of thousands of individuals marched the streets of Phoenix, Los Angeles, Dallas, and Chicago to protest the law (Preston, 2010) and 70% of Latinos voiced opposition to it (Holub, 2010). On the other hand, those who supported SB 1070, such as the English First Foundation and U.S. Republican Senators John Kyl and John McCain, believed that it was a necessary step to address the issue of immigration in Arizona, a state that is known as "the nation's busiest gateway for human and drug smuggling from Mexico and home to an estimated 460,000 illegal immigrants" (Cooper & Davenport, 2010, para. 2). Immigration laws are not only pivotal for Arizonians but for

Americans as a whole: The Angus Reid Public Opinion poll, conducted nationally around the time of signing SB 1070, found that seven in ten American adults supported "arresting people who can't prove they're in the United States legally" (United Press International, 2010).

While this law focused attention on Arizona, anti-immigration laws have been proposed throughout America, targeting various ethnic groups, and in the recent past connected to Latino immigrants.[2] In 2005, the Border Protection, Anti-Terrorism, and Illegal Immigration Control Act (U.S. House Resolution 4437), also known as the "Sensenbrenner Bill," passed the House of Representatives as a result of a 239 to 182 vote (with 92% of Republicans supporting, 82% of Democrats opposing).[3] However, when it reached the Senate, it was rejected. States across the nation have proposed or endorsed hundreds of bills addressing immigration since then. In 2009, a record number of 222 laws and 131 resolutions were enacted in 48 states ("Immigrant Policy Project," 2009, National Conference of State Legislatures). All these legislative efforts demonstrated how political and legal thought were filled with talk of citizenship and immigration.

While not all immigrants may want to become American citizens, acquiring American citizenship is still considered by many to signal achievement. Citizenship, however, is a more complicated concept. For some, it identifies those individuals who have fulfilled formal and legal requirements in order to be recognized under the law. For others, citizenship is complex and requires that several factors be taken into consideration such as culture. Citizenship, in this sense, is viewed as exclusionary since it is a process

that is limited to a particular conception of a community that is exclusive. This differing nature of citizenship raises fundamental questions about who can be a citizen, how people make sense of the term, and rhetorical and political significances associated with it (Edelman, 1977).

Coverage of Citizenship

From a communication perspective, this project investigated how news coverage depicted citizenship in association to SB 1070. In addition, interdisciplinary theories of citizenship, from political science, history, and sociology, were also used in this dissertation. In the next chapter, a rhetorical theory of citizenship will be discussed to show how intended and unintended audiences, or second and third persona, were simultaneously determined in the texts I analyze.

The goal of this study was to understand the nature and functions of such citizenship portrayals in three pairs of newspapers: two from Los Angeles, two from Miami, and two from Phoenix. An examination of dominant news stories about SB 1070 revealed how citizenship was epitomized to certain audiences and news consumers. How citizenship was idealized for intended audiences (American audiences) was fundamental to understanding the second persona within the context of SB 1070 news stories. In addition, in the process of close reading, I discovered themes in the constructions, or portrayals, of ideal citizenship were noted to discover themes through close readings of these news stories and pictures. This study also reveals how citizenship was promoted in news stories during the controversy over SB 1070. In the process, I considered news frames that surfaced during the months before SB 1070 passed, as well as a month after it

was signed, to explore the multiple voices on citizenship, including certain negated voices.

Through applying theories of citizenship along with the concepts of second and third persona, I distinguished not only intended and unintended audiences but also popular and unpopular news frames. Theories on news framing will also be discussed in the next chapter. All of these theories solidified my observations of the constructions of citizenship and immigration. I hope to gain a richer knowledge of how immigrants and Latinos are portrayed by newspapers during this pivotal and political moment. With these proposed goals, my dissertation will study news coverage of this recent immigration reform effort, SB 1070, and ask the following questions: How are Latinos portrayed as citizens by media? What types and tones of citizenship are advanced in SB 1070 news coverage?

Backgrounds of English and Spanish Newspapers

For this study, six newspapers were examine: *Los Angeles Times* and *La Opinión* (both from Los Angeles), *Miami Herald* and *Diario Las Américas* (both from Miami), and *Arizona Republic* and *Prensa Hispana* (both from Phoenix). In this section, some background information on each of these newspapers will be provided.

The *Los Angeles Times* is the leading daily English newspaper of this city. "The Los Angeles Times Media Group (LATMG)…include the *Los Angeles Times*, *The Envelope, Times Community News* and *Hoy Los Angeles* and reaches approximately 5.1 million or 38% of all adults in the Southern California marketplace" (*Los Angeles Times* online). It is the fourth most widely distributed paper in the country (BurrellesLuce,

"2008 Top Newspapers, Blogs, & Consumers Magazines," n.d.). The second newspaper from Los Angeles used in this study, *La Opinión*, is, according to the Annual Report on the State of the News Media (2011), one of the two biggest Spanish-language daily newspapers in the U.S. It was founded by Ignacio E. Lozano, Sr., a Mexican national who "wanted to provide news of the native homeland as well as of the new country for the growing Mexican population in Southern California" (Subervi-Vélez, et. al, 1994, p. 318). This newspaper began publishing in Los Angeles in September of 1926, and continues to be published by the Lozano family, presently by CEO Monica C. Lozano of ImpreMedia LLC (held by Lozano Enterprises) (Guskin & Mitchell, 2011).

For the Miami newspapers, the English daily newspaper selected was the *Miami Herald*. Their mission is "[t]o be the most credible and dynamic source of information for our community" (*Miami Herald* online). As Rodriguez (1999) explains:

> Sixteen years after the first wave of Cubans settling in Miami, the *Miami Herald*…took professional notice of the Cuban community. Its initial effort was a column; 2 years later, *El Miami Herald* began publication. This began as a one-page Spanish language insert and was expanded to as many as 18 pages. *El Miami Herald* was essentially a translation of the *Miami Herald*. (p. 122)

These two, *Miami Herald* and *El Nuevo Herald*, separated in 1987. In addition to the *Miami Herald*, I utilized *Diario Las Américas* to represent a Spanish-daily newspaper. This newspaper was founded by Nicaraguan attorney Horacio Aguirre and published by the Americas Publishing Company owned by the Aguirre family (Subervi-Vélez, 2008, p.

29). As Rodriguez (1999) points out, "*Diario Las Américas* [is] one of the few Latino-owned, Latino-oriented media outlets in the country" (p. 130).

For Phoenix, I examined the *Arizona Republic*. Their objective is the following:

> Our goal is to be a technologically advanced, integrated information services company that provides people with information they need, when they need it, and through whatever medium they choose to receive it. The Internet, specialty publications, marketing and advertising services, and a 24- hour information line, have expanded our business franchise far beyond newsprint. We have a national reputation in our field as leaders in innovation and customer service. (*Arizona Republic* online)

The website of this newspaper also states the following: "The Republic is the state's largest newspaper, reaching approximately 1.5 million readers per week" (*Arizona Republic* online). The *Prensa Hispana* is the final Spanish newspaper examined for this dissertation. Published in Phoenix, Arizona, *Prensa Hispana* delivers in more than 60 communities: from grocery stores to restaurants, hospitals, colleges, local businesses, and street intersections, according to the *Echo Media* (2012) website. This newspaper has exclusive or dominant circulation in 72% of 164 zip codes in Arizona. *Prensa Hispana* reaches more readers in more areas in Arizona than any other Spanish Language publication in the state (*Echo Media* website).

Not only do these newspapers differ in obvious ways, such as in cities and languages, but also in other aspects such as their mission statements. This dissertation is mainly focused on the differences between English and Spanish newspapers overall, not

differences between each newspaper. Comparing and contrasting each newspaper would go beyond the purpose of this study.

While these newspapers are significant to the study, a more important question is why is it important to study newspapers overall? Newspapers are informative publications that update readers with current news including local and even international events. As Schudson (1995) explained: "The newspaper, as the carrier of the news stories, participates in the construction of the mental worlds in which we live rather than in the reproduction of the 'real world' we live in relation to" (p. 38). As I will discuss in chapter three, studying English and Spanish newspapers is especially important since they have been rarely studied.

Latinos and Citizenship in 2013

Why study issues surrounding Latinos and citizenship in 2013? A first reason is that Latinos are the fastest growing minority ethnic group in the United States. According to the Pew Research Hispanic Center, 51.9 million Hispanics lived in this country in 2011 ("Hispanic Population Trends," 2011), making up 17 percent of the U.S. population. By 2040, Latinos will outnumber any other minority group with a population exceeding 80 million; by that year it is estimated that more than one out of five U.S. residents (22 percent) will be of Latino ancestry (U.S. Department of Commerce, 2000). Immigration is identified as a key reason for this population increase, in the nation at large and in Arizona in particular. According to the United States Census Bureau, 40.8 percent of Hispanic or Latino origin persons lived in the capital of Arizona ("Phoenix, Arizona QuickFacts," 2013). Current population figures from 2006 found Arizona as the fastest

growing state in America with a 3.6% population growth since 2005 (U.S. Census Bureau, "Estimates of Population Change for the United States and States, and for Puerto Rico and State Rankings"). This increase in population has occurred due to net migration of 745,944 persons into the state (U.S. Census Bureau, "Estimates of Population Change for the United States and States, and for Puerto Rico and State Rankings").

A second reason to study Latinos and citizenship concerns the tensions surrounding this growth**.** Scholars have examined how waves of immigration have historically have been perceived in America.[4] There are at least three specific concerns with Latino immigrants in the twentieth and early twenty-first century. In reference to perceived economic threats, scholars have studied the blame placed on immigrants during economic instabilities in American history (Pande, 2006) as well as recent frustration and fear connected to Latino immigrant workers (Brader, Valentino, and Suhay, 2008; Chavez, 2008; Chavez, 2001).[4] For example, Hadley's (1956) critical analysis found that language used in political discourses portrayed immigrants as an economic problem affecting job security for American soldiers who returned from World War II. In reference to perceived racial threats, scholars have examined harsh vernaculars used to describe Latino immigrants in America, including Streitmatter's (1999) observations that Latinos have been regarded as a "problem" and a "disease" as well as Santa Ana's (1999) findings that Latinos have been discussed in terms of animal metaphors. In reference to perceived sexual threats, fears of immigrants' sexuality and reproductive capacities are not new. Chavez's (2008) study on Latina fertility discovered the following: "Latinas and the children are perceived as destabilizing and bringing imminent destruction to the

nation's medical and other social services" (p. 108) Economic, racial, and sexual threats have formed a fearsome triad in American history (see Mitchell, 2005), and have been linked to Latino immigrants (Gabaccia, 1994; Ruiz, 1999; Chavez, 2008). Given these tensions, it will be interesting to trace the labels and the visual images used to represent Latinos in news coverage.

A third reason to examine Latinos and citizenship relates to concerns with citizenship following the attacks of September 11, 2001 (also known as 9/11). These attacks were carried out by the Islamic group al-Queda, which crashed planes into the World Trade Center complex in New York. In addition, planes were crashed into one side of the Pentagon along and a field in Pennsylvania. These events resulted in heightened reflections about what it means to be American, who is qualified to be American, and what Americans should value, think and do (Melnick, 2009; Dudziak, 2003). The events of 9/11 raised concerns about U.S. borders and efforts to protect them. While Latinos and immigrants may or may not be labeled as terrorists, actions along the U.S. and Mexico borders, including drug cartel conflicts, raise questions of borders and security. In scholarly contexts, many academics have encouraged additional attention to heightened waves of patriotism, nationalism and legislative actions following 9/11 (Jarvis, Barberena & Davis, 2007; Perrin, 2006) as well as how "ideal citizenship" is crafted in political discourse. Murphy's (2003) research, for instance, shows how the "extraordinary" citizen is a private "hero" who opts for "individual, conciliatory and apolitical acts of volunteerism" (p. 193) instead of a collective, deliberate, or political version of citizenship. Murphy contends that such constructions "serve to marginalize the rhetorical

and political dimensions of democratic citizenship" as ideal citizens are praised for behaviors that have "little or nothing to do with democratic politics" (p. 193). Following this logic, this project examined how, when, and in what ways Latinos and immigrants were discussed as citizens in news coverage as well as what types of citizenship were praised as ideal (Murphy, 2003) versus identified as undesirable, threatening, and dangerous (see Brader, Valentino, & Suhay, 2008; Espenshade, 1997).

Literature Review

To date, much of the academic research discussing the relationship between Latinos and the news is studied from an English-language media perspective. This dissertation considered both English and Spanish language news to learn more about how Latinos were labeled and discussed as citizens and non-citizens across the languages (Subervi-Vélez, 2008; Subervi-Vélez et al., 1994). Prior research on portrayals of Latinos in media has identified at least four patterns that provide a backdrop for this study. Consider these findings from English language news coverage.

English Language News Texts

Label use in news portrayals has been cyclical. Research shows how certain immigration labels appear time and again in public discourse. Palumbo-Liu's (1999) emphasis on the (re) articulations of Mexican and Asian immigrants in the early 19th century discussed how that differential racializations of those years continued to be present in later historical periods. Historical work on labels and immigration revealed how immigrants who sought access to citizenship, at least from 1790 to 1953, were required to be legally recognized as white (López, 1996) as immigration laws were

constructed in a way that immigration populations were characterized based on their racial fitness for membership in the national body (King, 2000). Flores' (2003) attention to the portrayals of Mexican immigrants in the 1920's and 1930's during deportation drives illustrated how Latinos were referred to as "illegal aliens" (a phrase that continues to this very day). These studies suggest how labels shape the manner in which news audiences are invited to think about immigrants (often in similar ways over time). These prior studies on label use allowed me to attend to the exact words used to refer to Latinos in English and Spanish language news (and to interpret my findings in light of Flores' and Palumbo-Liu's observations).

Visual images in news portrayals have emphasized Latino men. Chavez's (2001) study tracking the visual images connected to immigration on magazine covers over a 40-year period offers a stark finding. This work showed that males accounted for almost 80 percent of the photographs on magazine covers since 1965 (for a total of 225 of 284 images) and accounted for 73 percent of the illustrations on such covers. For Chavez, at least three conclusions emerged from these statistics: immigration is identified, pictorially, as an issue involving men; immigration images emphasized the threats of men migrating to the United States; and immigration images invited and triggered deeply embedded cultural assumptions about the United States as a nation (and complex issues surrounding identity and origins). As Hall (1997) observed, the symbols individuals utilize to represent immigrants and Latinos, are "signs" that signify "or represent our concepts, ideas and feelings in such a way as to enable others to read, decode, or interpret their meaning in roughly the same way that we do" (Hall, 1997a, p. 5). This prior work

on visual representations encouraged me to attend to gender, tone and cultural assumptions in images connected to coverage of Latinos so that I could distinguish those who were "accepted" and "unaccepted" according to news media.

News portrayals have been negative. Latino immigrants and their children find themselves portrayed negatively in news coverage (Brader, Valentino, & Suhay, 2008; Hopkins, 2010; Santa Ana, 1999; Simon & Lynch, 1999). Scholars address how Latino portrayals include traits associated with isolation and polarization (Hadley, 1956), out-group cues (Brader, Valentino, & Suhay, 2008), the costs and problems of immigration (Pande, 2006; Streitmatter, 1999), and pessimistic, emotional and/or galvanizing language (Hardy, 2003; Santa Ana, 1999). As Cornelius (2009/2002) observed, news coverage features "a fairly wide range of negative cultural stereotypes and misunderstandings (that) contribute to a less than sympathetic welcome for Latino newcomers" (p. 175). It will be interesting to track the negativity across portrayals in English and Spanish language news.

News portrayals have influenced audience attitudes in varying ways. Research shows how audiences have responded to the negative portrayals discussed above in mixed ways. To begin, some survey data show that Americans who live near high concentrations of Mexican immigrants have better impressions of this group, and are less likely than their counterparts in low concentration areas to fear that immigrants are trying to take away their jobs (Pew Research Center &). This study also found that Americans who live near higher concentrations of immigrants were considerably more likely to

agree that they strengthened the United States through hard work or talent (47%) than individuals living in low concentration areas of immigrants (27%).

Citizens, as will be discussed in more depth in the next chapter, will decode portrayals, especially of immigrants, in different ways. Other studies, for example, show that, despite, location, most Americans are poorly informed about immigration, often uncertain about it, and easily influenced by mediated images (Brader, Valentino, & Suhay, 2008). One set of studies has focused on how news reports highlighting out-group cues (of immigrants, often immigrant men) can trigger anxiety in audiences (often anxiety independent of the actual threat and/or of the hard news included in coverage). The emotional reactions emerging in response to immigration coverage lead researchers Brader, Valentino and Suhay (2008) to worry that the packaging of the news may lead to distortions in public opinion about immigration, as well as may "provide incentives, or justifications, for officials to enact biased or overreaching public policies" (p. 963). Other projects argue similarly. Chavez (2001), for instance, discusses how "68 percent of all respondents said that today's immigration is bad for the country" (p. 153). Moreover, Cornelius (2009/2002) notes that:

> When a national sample [by the Princeton Survey Research Associates] of the U.S. public was asked in 1997 whether there was "any *one* nationality group of recent immigrants you think has done the most to create problems in the United States," Mexicans were the most frequently mentioned (20 percent), followed by Cubans (10 percent) whose image has been tarnished by the Mariel boatlift and its aftermath. (p. 176)

Additionally, Espenshade (1997) observes how the concentrated emphasis on Mexicans in press coverage has led to some hotbeds of anti-immigrant activism—even in places where individuals have lived experience with Mexican-Americans. This research uncovers how southern California saw greater conflicts in the early 1990s in response to emphases on Mexican immigration in the news than other some other states (a key comparison state being New Jersey—home to a diverse immigrant population, broader waves of immigrant populations from earlier eras, and a place where there is no single numerically dominant minority group).

News portrayals have emphasized (and often created) a fear of the border. Research shows how a 'fearful' aspect of immigration regards how borders are portrayed. Borders in the United States, whether real or symbolic, frequently become linked to the constructed "Latino threat" (Chavez, 2008). As Rosaldo (1997) contends: "The U.S. Mexico border has become theater, and border theater has become social violence. Actual violence has become inseparable from symbolic ritual on the border – crossings, invasions, lines of defense, high-tech surveillance, and more" (p. 33). Since my project is a descriptive study, I paid close attention to the borders to understand how it was invoked in labels, visual representations and discussions of citizenship in association to Latinos.

Spanish Language News Texts

News portrayals in Spanish language news are under-studied. While earlier sections of this literature review drew on projects examining English language news texts, less is known about how Spanish language newspapers in the United States address issues of immigration. The lack of scholarship in this area is troubling, for Latinos are

more likely than other ethnic minority groups to trust coverage appearing in their native-tongue outlets ("Ethnic Media Overview," 2004). As the Pew Hispanic Center (Suro, 2004) noted:

> Among newspaper readers, the role of English in the Hispanic electorate is more widespread still. Of Latino likely voters who regularly get news from print newspapers, 81% only read publications in English and 13% read newspapers in both languages while 6% only read Spanish-language papers. (p. 3)

Attending to both languages allowed for a stronger sense of the labels, images and portrayals of citizenship created for and about Latinos on the topic of immigration.

Adding Spanish language coverage to my dissertation not only provided more data and more evidence to compare and contrast with English language newspaper data; it also allowed for considerations of Latinos and Spanish-speaking immigrants in their native language. At present there are more questions than answers about how Spanish language journalists approach political issues and conceive of the political appetites of their audiences (Jarvis & Connaughton, 2005). And yet, as Alexandre and Rehbinder (2008) observed, "the degree to which reports try to draw out politicians' positions and parties' platforms on issues like Latin America, immigration and education are noteworthy" (p. 175) for how such topics are discussed invites Spanish-speaking audiences to understand their roles in American democracy.

Media Images

Observations of labels were crucial to my dissertation as they demonstrated the power of naming and the impacts of label use in several different areas of political and social life. Scholars have particularly observed how labels function for minority groups in political discourses (Calafell & Delgado, 2004; Chavez, 2001; Chavez, 2008, Dávila, 2001; Dávila, 2008). Flores (2003) argued that labels reflect larger cultural forces. "Contemporary images of immigrants, such as that of the illegal alien, do not emerge in a vacuum," she wrote. "Instead, they are part of our nation's history of immigration, race, and nation; they bring with them varied meanings reflecting their origins and uses" (p. 363). To understand them fully in the present, Flores demanded that scholars consider how images have been deployed in the past. Noting such labels in newspapers surrounding SB 1070 strengthened my findings and conclusions of immigrants, citizenship, and the nation.

Images in news stories offered powerful evidence and supporting material for examining immigration and citizenship discourse in American society (Hofsetter & Loveman, 1982; Miller, 1994; Subervi-Vélez, 2008). As news consumers, we scan the offerings at a newsstand. For that moment, we may stop to read the headline of a newspaper and look at the picture on the front page, and then quickly skim articles. The connotations and significance of such news stories and images revealed such themes as the complexities of American identity.

Media images are powerful because they carry an "ideological force" that "reduces the interpretations an audience can make, filling their eyes with a single,

dominating meaning" (Hart & Daughton, 2005, p. 191). Past studies have examined how Latinos are portrayed in popular, mainstream media (Rodriguez, 1997; Gonzalez, 2000; Fox, 1996; Wyner, 1988; Moore & Panchon, 1985). While such media portrayals of Latinos are important, such as in trendy *telenovelas*[6] and *noticieros*[7] little attention is paid to popular constructions of Latinos as American citizens in media. The visual representations of immigrants and Latinos describe a frame of reference of this particular group (Finnegan, 2005; LaWare, 1998). Chavez (2001) also described the way immigrants are portrayed in media (specifically in magazine covers):

> Since 1965, the magazines increasingly represented—imagined–immigrants as different, not assimilated, outside, and morally questionable Others to the community of the nation. Moreover, immigrants also were represented as threats to the nation in a variety of ways: by transgressing the nation's borders and making claims on the nation's sovereign territory, by reproducing and forming communities in the United States, by changing the racial composition of the nation, and by adding to environmental/population pressures. Immigrants also bring cultural differences that threaten "American" ways of doing things. (p. 301)

As Chavez noted, visual presentations construct how immigrants should behave and contribute to American society. I was also interested in observing how images in newspapers illuminated the idealized and negated types of citizenship.

Through visual data, 783 images, this study tried to understand how media portrays contemporary "American identity." This was challenging since immigrants are

often labeled as the "Other." In particular, one theme from the Spanish SB 1070 images, in chapter seven, will discuss this very issue of the 'Other' as it applies to Latino politicians. Studying these visual images on citizenship and immigration were supported by the insights from Gramsci's (1957/1991) *The prison notebooks 1929-1935*, specifically through his notion of hegemony since popular pictures preserve "control not just through violence and political coercion, but also ideologically, through a hegemonic culture in which the values of the bourgeoisie became the 'common sense' values of all" (p. 191). The pictures featured in these news stories, as a result, may be advocating a common sense that is hegemonic, that is internalized by the majority of American consumers.

This dissertation is a descriptive study, tracing and unpacking how Latinos were labeled, represented visually, and discussed as citizens in news coverage. I was careful to avoid broad claims of causality in my work. I draw upon on these previous studies on media to discuss potential implications for my findings. These implications are discussed at the end of each result chapter, specifically chapters four through seven.

Overview

In what follows, I examine news coverage surrounding the state immigration legislation of SB 1070 ("Support Our Law Enforcement and Safe Neighborhoods Act," signed into law by Arizona Governor Jan Brewer on April 23, 2010).[8] The ways that Arizona law makers verified citizenship caught the attention of the whole nation. Determining how citizenship was portrayed in news coverage and how they identified SB

1070 to immigrants was crucial. This project explores the rhetorical manifestations of tensions around citizenship coverage of SB 1070.

Data show that more Latinos in the United States get their news from Spanish language television than any other source (followed by Spanish language radio, then followed by newspapers, see de la Garza, Brischetto, & Vaughan, 1983; Subervi, 2008). In an ideal world, it would be exciting to study labels, visual images and discussions of citizenship in additional Spanish-language mediated discourses of these immigration reform efforts. Unfortunately, there are no historical archives of such coverage, and efforts to secure former broadcasts and radio programming were not successful.

For this project, I examine the coverage of SB 1070 by attending to newspaper texts. These choices are supported by a set of assumptions. First, I selected newspapers that had been studied in earlier projects on Latino politics (see Connaughton, 2005; Subervi, 2008), as they represented a mix of English and Spanish journalistic voices, from major cities with substantial Latino populations: *Los Angeles Times* and *La Opinión* (Los Angeles); *Miami Herald* and *Diario De Las Américas* (Miami)*; Arizona Republic* and *Prensa Hispana* (Phoenix). I reviewed these newspapers over a six month period, specifically December 1, 2009 to May 31, 2010. Each edition was searched, through physical copies of newspapers and microfilm as well as internet databases, for stories on immigration, immigration reform, and/or SB 1070.

I conducted different types of analyses on these data as will be discussed in chapter three. To learn more about label use, all texts were digitized and submitted to a wordlist software program. These procedures allowed me to both assess the most

commonly appearing terms and labels in English and Spanish as well as to see how the labels were used in context. I paid close attention to a set of key terms: citizen, immigrant, immigration, illegal, alien, and other legal terms and labels. A benefit of the wordlist software is that I was able to conduct these searches on both the English and Spanish language texts. To learn more about visual representations, all visual images connected to the stories were studied. In addition, I observe the types of citizenship (legal status, rights, political activity, collective identity) depicted as well as location, action, and alarmist and affirmative imagery. To learn more about the depictions of citizenship, a close textual analysis of the key terms located via the wordlist was conducted. Guided by Black (1970) and Wander (1984), I attended to the types of citizenship that were hailed and idealized versus ignored and negated. Also per Murphy's (2003) and Schudson's (1998) work on citizenship, special attention focused on images of the "ideal" citizen (connected to the four categories of the legal status, rights, political activity, and collective identity to citizenship). These citizenship types revealed what American characteristics were portrayed as desirable, not only among immigrants and Latinos, but potentially among us all.

In addition to analyzing projected types of citizenship, examining how these newspapers covered physical and symbolic borders was also important in this dissertation. Understanding dynamics and implications of immigrant representations in political discourse allowed for conceptualization of values, attitudes, and beliefs of citizens and non-citizens. While some fields and disciplines have examined the dynamics and complexities of Latino populations, work is still needed in border rhetorics. The

study not only of physical parameters but also psychological boundaries is what constitutes border rhetorics. This area of rhetoric not only considers spaces of borders but also those individuals who are involved with these national and symbolic parameters. While materialistic and concrete aspects are considered in border rhetoric, such as federal and state legislations and actions, the social and symbolic behaviors are also noted. For example, Ono and Sloop (2002) analyzed California's Proposition 187 through examining border rhetorics:

> Proposition 187 allows us to study the role rhetoric plays in shaping social borders and constructing immigrant identities and international relationships…Developed by a coalition of nativist Californians, together with a then anti-immigration governor, Pete Wilson, Proposition 187 sought to eliminate public health, welfare, and educational provisions for undocumented migrants. (p. 3)

The rhetoric behind Proposition 187 constructed meanings of 'nation' and its 'borders.' Ono and Sloop concluded that the rhetorical critic must consider inquiries relating to immigration from the position of those who are silenced and subordinated, not from the position of power and authority in which answers relating to borders are automatic. In my study, I analyzed rhetorical manifestations behind SB 1070 to understand physical and symbolic borders. Furthermore, by observing the parameters constructed by media, I could then pinpoint political and cultural tensions that exist. Once all the themes were discussed in chapters four through seven, I discussed these collisions, or *choques*,[9] between borders, individuals, and citizenship constructions.

This approach allowed me to understand the roles and functions of Latinos and immigrants in different social realms. It served as a catalyst for discussion on media portrayals of citizens, immigrants and Latinos. While some research has already focused on quantitative features and measuring media effects among Latinos in English coverage, more critical approaches may be insightful to this ongoing conversation on citizenship in America. My work tried to merge both quantitative *and* qualitative approaches for these discussions on citizenship and immigration. These approaches are discussed in more depth in chapter three.

The chapters of the dissertation are organized in the following manner: Chapter two reviews the rhetorical theories on citizenship, second and third persona, and news framing. Chapter three discusses the methodological approaches used for this study. Chapter four provides the results for English SB 1070 texts, and chapter five presents the results of Spanish SB 1070 texts. Chapter six provides the results for English SB 1070 image, and chapter seven provides the results for Spanish SB 1070 images. Chapter eight, the conclusion, summarizes the overall discoveries and contributions from this study.

Conclusion

Through this study, contributions were made to current political discussions on immigration and citizenship as they relate to immigrants and Latinos. By doing so, I expanded my own personal and scholarly knowledge. Furthermore, I hope my work also benefits future students, rhetoricians, and scholars of Latino issues. According to Subervi-Vélez (2008), "*the greater the perceived Latino relevancy of candidates or issues, the greater the political involvement of Latinos – even among those who seek to*

fully acculturate in the dominant United States society (p. 53). Thus, through relevant Latino identifications in media, a greater chance of political involvement and civic participation exists (Pew Hispanic Center, 2006a). This research not only provides insight on Latinos and how they are associated to citizenship, but also on Latino roles as well as their powerful portrayals in media. In the next chapter, I will discuss the theoretical foundations for this study.

Footnotes

[1] My choice of the term "illegal" to characterize immigrants that are not legal in the United States reflects my intention to be consistent with this law, SB 1070, as well as with the newspapers examined in this study. In other words, I use the term "illegal" to refer to this legislation. I do understand that other terms, such as "migrant," may be better since they leave open the diversity of motivations, statuses, and modes of mobility of these individuals who cross the border. However, to avoid confusion between terms that I would prefer to use, such as "migrant," and the common terms used by this law and media, such as "illegal" and "legal," I utilized the same words of the artifacts examined. This logic is followed for all terms in the dissertation such as "illegal," "undocumented," and "alien."

[2] In this project, I acknowledge the nuances surrounding the terms Latino and Hispanic, and use the term Latino throughout this chapter. Specifically, as Jones-Correa and Leal (1996) explain the following:

> the terms Latino and Hispanic are used, of course, to refer to persons of Latin American origin: Mexican Americans, Puerto Ricans, Cubans, Central and South Americans. But it seems that when the terms Latino and Hispanic are used, more is implied than simply a common origin. There is the assumption that those sharing this origin share other commonalities as well: a shared experience of discrimination or perhaps common health maladies or a linguistic base. It is one thing, however, to use these terms descriptively, to talk about a population with origins in a geographic area, and another to assume that this population shares

> certain characteristics, experiences, attitudes, and beliefs. There is a vigorous debate underway, then, about the very use of these terms and what they mean. (pp. 214-215)

Following this logic, it must be noted that this reference excludes Brazilians since their linguistic and colonial experiences are Portuguese not Spanish. In other words the term Latino is inclusive of Brazil. Furthermore, to avoid the cumbrous "Latino/a" and "Latinos/as," I will utilize the terms "Latinos" and "Latinas," "Latino," and "Latina" as gender-neutral descriptions, except when otherwise noted in my dissertation.

[2] These results were confirmed on the Final Vote Results webpage (http://clerk.house.gov/evs/2005/roll661.xml).

[3] As Croom (2008) contends: "...a racial epithet is a term used to characterize people on the basis of their race…Use of racial epithets are language acts that are usually harmful to the people that they target" (p. 34). Such epithets, or racial slurs, distinguish not only who the 'Other' is, but also uphold racist ideologies. Historical examples of pejorative immigrant terms include Chinese immigrants seen as "Chink"; Japanese immigrants seen as "Jap" after World War II; and Eastern European immigrants seen as "Paddy," "Polack," "Chesky" (Hughes, 2006).

[4] For additional consideration of Latino immigrants and their associations to economic threats, we may also refer to the following: Cornelius, 1998; Cornelius, 2009/2002; Guarnizo, 1997; Pastor and Marcelli, 2000; Singer and Massey, 1998; Waldinger, 1997.

[5] This Spanish word indicates Latino 'soap operas.'

[6] This Spanish word means Latino ‘newscasts’ or ‘news programs.’

[7] Originally, this law was scheduled to go into effect on July 29, 2010. However, the day before the law was to be enforced, a federal judge blocked crucial sections of SB 1070 through the issue of a preliminary injunction.

[8] A *choque* (cho-que) in Spanish means “a collision” or “an accident.”

CHAPTER TWO

CITIZENSHIP, AUDIENCES, AND NEWS FRAMINING THEORIES

In the years since the endorsement of Arizona Senate Bill 1070, the notion of citizenship has been questioned, specifically with the "show me your papers" clause requiring individuals to demonstrate proof of legality.[1] This questioning, before and after the enactment of this law, was linked to the topic of *immigration*, as Americans contemplated immigration policy and what it meant to be (and look like) an American. This questioning was also linked to *nationalism*, as Americans protested in the streets for (and against) the rights of immigrants, focusing on the U.S.-Mexico borders. These are just two examples in which citizenship has become a prominent and puzzling construction in the United States.

When a citizen is identified, a non-citizen is also identified. Identification, among citizens, results in the simultaneous action of association and separation. Burke (1962/1969) posited this concept of identification: "Thus he is both joined and separate, at once a distinct substance and consubstantial with another" (*A rhetoric of motives*, p. 21). He continued: "Identification is affirmed with earnestness precisely because there is division. Identification is compensatory to division" (p. 22). Identification allows one to associate with a certain group, based on a shared belief, idea, or value, or to separate from them. Thus, the manner in which citizens are identified (in this case, in newspapers) can illuminate such moments of unification and separation, as well as mediated constructions about citizenship. More importantly, these identifications reveal hierarchies that exist. This concept will be discussed throughout this chapter as well as in the conclusion

chapter. By specifically studying if and how Latinos were invited to be citizens by media in SB 1070 news coverage, a more holistic understanding of citizenship can occur.

This project investigates how news stories constructed citizenship by attending to theories and thoughts through rhetoric. In addition, "folk" theories, or numerous explanations held by the public, were also used. In other words, I describe rhetorical theory and additional interdisciplinary theories, such as from history and sociology, to inform my methodology. In addition, I also use theories of news framing. By utilizing these theories, I could evaluate the dilemma between citizenship and immigration, between citizens and immigrants.

Considering this rhetorical theory on citizenship raised issues of who could, and who couldn't, be a citizen as well as how citizenship was constructed by media. Addressing such constructions is important, specifically noting how marginalized groups, specifically Latinos, struggle over citizenship and rights in order to improve their quality of life. Furthermore, on what terms citizenship is constructed permits us to observe not only a legal scope, but also political, cultural, and social scopes. Applying rhetorical theory to news framing will allow us to see how immigration and citizenship, as well as citizens and immigrants, are popularly constructed by media. Utilizing these theories will begin to answer fundamental questions about citizenship in America such as who is, and who isn't, welcomed to become a citizen.

Rhetorical Theory of Citizenship

Historically, the foundation of citizenship lies in Ancient Greece. In Aristotle's *Politics* (trans. 1959), citizenship pertained to the ruling class of the city-state. Moreover,

Aristotle defines the citizen as a person who has the right (*exousia*) to participate in genres of rhetoric, including deliberative or judicial office (Book Three). As we can see from this historical example, citizenship is filled with tradition. "To the Greeks and the Romans citizenship was both a legal term and a social status: citizens were those who had a legal right to have a say in the affairs of the city or state, either by speaking in public or by voting, usually both" (Crick, 2000, p. 4). Citizenship is a notion, a process, as well as an ideal. The world sees it as a marker. It labels who is, and who is not, associated to a common national identity. However, in recent years, citizenship has become a questioned construct. A prime example of this is Arizona's SB 1070 which contests one's legality through authoritative means (law enforcement). Other recent examples may include the DREAM Act (which provides education for non-U.S. born students who have lived in this country over a certain amount of time) and G.W. Bush's proposal of the Guest Worker Program (which would have provided work sponsorships for non-U.S. citizen workers). The rhetorical aspect, in both cases, involves the contestation of who can have certain opportunities under particular conditions and limitations. Consequently, it may raise concern as to the special circumstances of citizenship[2] in this country.

Whether cynical or not about the current state of civic life, whether interested in conventional or new types of civic participation, whether studying voting in individual or group situations, discussions of citizenship are highly contested. Communication scholars tend to regard citizenship as rhetorically constructed, as provided in the literature review in the last chapter. More communication scholars will be provided throughout this chapter as well. In particular, rhetoricians have begun to examine performances and

practices of what constitutes a citizen and what does not, specifically along the U.S.-Mexico border (Flores, 2003; Ono & Sloop, 2002). Through critical examination of theories of who is included and excluded in the realm of citizenship, one could attend to the vigorous interplay between audiences as well (which will be discussed later in this chapter).

Before discussing inclusion and exclusion in citizenship theory, noting that citizenship is performative must be discussed. Citizenship, as some of these SB 1070 images displayed, was visually performed through a protest or images of law enforcement officials. Such visual performances reveal what stance is promoted or what argument is being made by those pictured actors or individuals associated to SB 1070. Asen (2004) argues that communication scholars ought to ask the following: "How do people enact citizenship? Reorienting our framework from a question of *what* to a question of *how* usefully redirects our attention from acts to action" (p. 191). Analyzing not only the acts of citizenship per se, but also the processes that are embraced is fundamental. Take, for example, the popular phrase, "the pathway to citizenship." This phrase encompasses a rigorous process that immigrants must undergo in order to obtain legal status in this country. This process not only involves paying high amounts of money, but also submitting health results and documentation. Not only does citizenship entail a symbolic identification ("I am an American citizen") but also particular economic ("I can afford to become a naturalized American citizen") and physical ("I am healthy enough to be in this country") requirements of this process. Such performances of citizenship will be more evident in SB 1070 photos (for example, the flags displayed in a

photo will reveal what nationality or race is being performed). Thus, it will be interesting to note how English and Spanish newspapers advance citizenship through legal, financial, and health issues associated to citizens and immigrants.

Citizenship as Inclusion

This subdivision of a rhetorical theory of citizenship is important to note as it reveals the rationale behind popular constructions of citizenship as well as what citizens and immigrants are idealized. Later in this section, the theory on second persona will be discussed to explain intended audiences. Moreover, analyzing this inclusionary aspect involves analyzing borders which, to some degree, are also rhetorically constructed and symbolize the political and cultural compositions of civic life. Citizenship theories, popularly, consider the partaking in or membership of a community.[3] Different types of citizenships (as will be discussed in the next chapter) are based on different political communities. One historical example of citizenship within certain communities is the Native Americans. Robertson (2013) explained how this indigenous group acquired and practiced citizenship within their populations. They upheld a notion of adoptions to show a kind of belonging to a community that was perfomative and fluid. While focusing citizenship theory as a legal status permits us to examine the form and content of the recognized rules of social order, it also allows for an understanding of membership into a certain community as described in the previous example. Furthermore, citizenship as a legal status is beneficial due to observations of hierarchal organizations such as authoritative powers to enforce legal status and citizenship verification. In other words,

using citizenship theory as legal status sharpens our understanding of the rule of citizenship in social orders.

Borders, to some degree, rhetorically construct and symbolize the legal and social composition of civic life. When pinpointing definitions and social orders of citizenship, whether in the past or present, borders must also be taken into consideration for they influence, and are associated with, one's citizenship or residency. Borders and bordering are not only physical markers, but symbolic ones as well. Gloria Anzaldúa defined borders in the following: "Borders are set up to define the places that are safe and unsafe, to distinguish us from them…A borderland is a vague and undetermined place created by the emotional residue of an unnatural boundary" (*Borderlands*, p. 25). In the field of communication studies, border rhetorics remains in its infancy. Interest is growing in citizenship and patriotic boundaries, not only in the physical sense of how and who draws the parameters (of certain states and countries), but also in the sense of social borders that exists. Bosniak (2006) explains,

> Politically, borders are neither fixed nor static; what counts as part of the inside or outside is subject to ongoing negotiation and contestation. And whatever the prevailing understanding of their character and location, as practical matter national borders are very often tested, stretched, permeated, or breached. (p. 7)

Borders are contested not just on physical grounds but symbolic ones as well. DeChaine (2009) states that analyzing "the rhetorical dimensions of the border require a shift in focus from borders to bordering, from a consideration of static entities to an analysis of a

dynamic practice" (p. 46). By examining citizenship exclusively in relation to physical and geographical borders, identifications are strictly nationalistic. A rhetorical theory on citizenship not only considers citizens but also non-citizens; it permits for examinations that are not only inclusionary but also exclusionary.

Citizenship, in legal research, has been applied in numerous ways including "self-governance," "the entity that both guarantees rights and defines legal status," "the assurance of community recognition despite difference, or as recognition of 'the right to be different,'" and the acknowledgement of "social and cultural….group identities" (Bosniak, 2006, pp. 21-23). These labels reveal the persuasive appeals utilized in citizenship discourse. Such divisions reveal underlying hierarchies, which mainly consist of those who are citizens (who are placed at the top) and those who are non-citizens (who are placed at the bottom). Not only are these preferences applied to American citizens, but also to those who are not citizens.

British sociologist T.H. Marshall (1950) in *Citizenship and social class* analyzed the social system found in citizenship. Marshall contends that capitalism provokes a social system, or a hierarchy. As the class arrangement advances, so does citizenship change from providing a structure of rights (which results from and supports market relations) to a structure of rights that upholds an oppressive relationship between labor and class systems.

Traditionally, for Marshall, citizenship is two-fold: first, citizenship is a category attached to complete membership of a community; and, second, those who fall under this category receive the rights and duties that pertain to the specified citizenship. His

research (1950) identifies three theoretically and historically distinctive elements of citizenship: the civil, the political, and the social.

> The civil element is composed of the rights necessary for individual freedom…By the political element I mean the right to participate in the exercise of political power…By the social element I mean the whole range from the right to a modicum of economic welfare and security to the right to share to the full in the social heritage and live the life of a civilized being according to the standards prevailing in the society. (p. 94)

By concentrating citizenship theory in these three categories, central characteristics of the modern state may be noted, as well as the intersectionality that citizens, and non-citizens, face. As these SB 1070 texts and images will reveal, intersections found in constructions will reveal how citizenship is complicated, not traditional.

By pinpointing who is and isn't a citizen, or who is and isn't included, social orders may also be noted. Social orders associated specifically to advocacy groups demonstrate an effort to promote social change. However, orders that are strongly aligned to forms of discrimination, such as Arizona's SB 1070, prevent social change from occurring. In the case of this legislative effort, inequality stems from historical cultural practices and legislations.[4] Thus, the challenge becomes to spark the circumstances for citizenship not just within a legal sphere, but through means that can produce a fundamental change of social customs at all levels of society. This is rhetorically accomplished at linguistic and visual levels as will be seen in this SB 1070 news coverage.

Moreover, this order not only describes the type of citizen that is privileged but also the type of immigrant that is preferred. Williams and Marin (2010) analyze the rhetorical constructions of Russian President Vladimir Putin, specifically his construction of the persona of 'citizen' and 'citizenship':

> "Citizenship" within the Russian Federation thus emerges from Putin's presidential addresses as a distinct idealization, one crafted to fit the Russian experience and by extension of the new Russian democracy. In other words, through the idealizations of the second persona in Putin's presidential addresses we can garner a glimpse of the image of the Russian "citizen" as seen through Putin's eyes. (p. 559)

Particular citizens are romanticized, especially as part of an extension of Soviet times. Putin's discourse imagines an audience that consists of citizens who love a new "Mother Russia" and, yet, uphold a "Soviet-flavored sublimation of the self for the benefit of the State" (p. 560). In this study, the ideal citizen of Russia was traditional yet futuristic. Similar idealizations of particular citizens will be noted in Arizona's SB 1070 news stories and images, to understand which media outlets may, on the one hand, promote citizenship of a new land, yet simultaneously not allow their audience members to forget their background and cultural ties to Latin America. In other words, the manner in which news media describes and depicts citizens, as being included or excluded in this country, will surface here.

Not only is it crucial to know which citizen is included in discourse, but also which audience is intended overall. In other words, determining the intended readers of

citizenship constructions is necessary. The decoders of these rhetorical constructions must be taken into consideration. To do so, the "second persona" must be included under this theoretical approach of citizenship.

In 1970, Black wrote a landmark essay, "The second persona," in which he invites rhetorical critics to question the audiences embodied in texts and consider audiences who are implied in communication processes. Rhetorical scholars have utilized this in order to analyze the implied audiences and, as a result, sharpen the focus and attention of texts. Through examination of intended audiences and identities, dominant news stories and images about citizenship (and possibility of Latinos as citizens) will surface.

Considering different audiences, as well as different languages, is vital since media consumption changes as demographics do as well. Charland (1987) examined how the nationalist movement in Quebec went above and beyond when inventing an image for its audience; it produces possibilities that can influence the identity of those to whom it is addressed. Charland posited:

> Interpellation occurs at the very moment one enters into a rhetorical situation, that is, as soon as an individual recognizes and acknowledges being addressed. An interpellated subject participates in the discourse that addresses him. Thus, to be interpellated is to become one of Black's personae and be a position in a discourse…Note, however, that interpellation does not occur through persuasion in the usual sense, for the very act of addressing is rhetorical. (p. 138)

Charland supports Black's notion of the second persona as ideologically dependent by explaining that audiences are constructions, created by the thought that the rhetor promotes in his or her discourse. In this study, examining how newspapers constructed intended audiences becomes vital to understanding how citizenship is presented and idealized.

Idealizing certain citizens requires the intended audience to envision certain portrayals in discourse. Kurtz (2001) analyzes American essayist Ralph Waldo Emerson and his 1854 oration, "Fugitive Slave Law." Emerson clashed with Massachusetts Senator Daniel Webster over federal support for escaped slaves. "The speech [by Emerson] imagines an audience positioned to play a role in the interpretation and judgment of Webster's betrayal. Auditors are invited to assume the risks and commitments of antislavery as Emerson has interpreted them" (p. 288). Envisioning the audience is not enough: moral character, in certain contexts, is taken into consideration. Webster's moral quality was what Emerson urged audience members to consider. Moral justification is also examined by Terry (2007) who analyzed Frederick Douglass and his Biblical references to understand how he attained not only the audience's attention but their justification for the abolition of slavery as well. Douglass had curtailed his audience's expectations by providing strong criticism of the United States' guidelines on slavery as well as noting the contradictory stance of the Christian church in tolerating such policies on slavery. Noting such words and images surrounding Arizona's SB 1070 will reveal each specified audience of each newspaper, as well as what expectations are sustained (or not).

In certain situations, rhetors may motivate other audiences that were not intended. A particular example is Robert Parris Moses, a civil-rights leader whose discourse was studied by Jensen and Hammerback (1998). Although his intended audience was regional Southerners and youthful volunteers, others such as civil-rights advocate Dick Gregory (1965), contended that Moses had "done more for my life without even knowing it to make me commit my life for right over wrong. Thank goodness I happened to be in the right place at the right time when he was speaking in his own little way" (p. 149). Morality, itself, is questioned in relation to the intended audience, as well as other audience members not originally intended for it. Therefore, determining which citizenship constructions are intended for certain audiences will be observed.

These exemplar studies, through the use of Black's second persona, focus not only on who the 'implied auditor' is but also how the rhetor engages the intended audiences through the context, text, and persuasive appeals. This analysis demonstrates how rhetoric creates a sense of direction as the audience undergoes the process of becoming: "the critic can see in the auditor implied by a discourse a model of what the rhetor would have his real auditor become" (Black, 1970/1999, p. 335). I, as the critic, will note what these newspapers want their readers to become and what they want their audience to transcend in terms of citizenship.

Dominant news stories about Arizona's SB 1070 may reveal how citizenship is epitomized to American audiences and consumers. The ways that citizenship is romanticized for intended American audiences is fundamental to understanding the second persona within the context of these news stories. Murphy's (2003) research, for

instance, shows how the "extraordinary" citizen is a private "hero" who opts for "individual, conciliatory and apolitical acts of volunteerism" (p. 193) instead of a public, collective, or deliberative version of citizenship. Murphy contends that such constructions "serve to marginalize the rhetorical and political dimensions of democratic citizenship" as ideal citizens are praised for behaviors that have "little or nothing to do with democratic politics" (p. 193). It will be interesting in this dissertation to study how, when, and in what ways Latinos are constructed as citizens, as well as non-citizens, in news stories including what citizenship acts are praised as ideal versus those identified as undesirable, threatening, and dangerous (see Brader, Valentino, & Suhay, 2008; Espenshade, 1997). The observations made in this dissertation are not just of the intended audience, but of actual citizens.

The implied, ideal citizen not only depends on the construction itself but the context as well, as will be seen with English and Spanish media outlets. Schudson (1998) argues that the role of the citizen in American life has always been more restricted in practice than idealized exemplars of 'rule by the people.' The current condition of American life, Schudson contends, is at a minimum or no less vibrant than in past historical periods, resulting in a combination of elite and mass democracy.

> Citizenship during a particular political season may be for many people much less intense than in the era of parties, but citizenship now is a year-round and day-long activity, as it was only rarely in the past…There should be more attention, not less, in our schools and in our homes to explaining the rights and responsibilities of citizenship. (p. 311)

Not only, then, is it enough to consider the audience for discussions on citizenship but also the environment, or rhetorical setting, where such discussions should be taking place. Thus, determining the context of these news stories will solidify the assignment of the second persona, or intended audience.

Whether idealized and degraded, or public and private, citizenship constructions will vary from audience to audience as Harvard political scientist R. Putnam (2000) contends. Citizenship, and its connections to the audience, may be performed formally or informally, traditionally or non-traditionally. For example, some citizens not only verbalize that they participated in a civic act of voting, but also *who* they voted for while others verbalize neither the act nor politician for whom they voted for during an election. What maintains democratic politics, Putnam argues, is the inspiring vigor of social ties that people may employ to engage them, and keep them involved, in civic and citizenship affairs. Such social ties are dependent on the characteristics of each audience. This is also a fundamental concern for this study: the manner in which the audience is linked not only to citizenship, but to one another. The traits that unify readers of the intended audience will also be noted.

Citizenship as Exclusion

Just as citizenship reveals who is accepted, it simultaneously reveals who is rejected. This rejection is noted not only in the written texts, but also in the images of SB 1070. In legal scholarship, critical scholars have argued that citizenship has always meant more than just legal identification and verification. One criticism of the theory of

citizenship as legal membership was provided by K. Marx (1975/1843). He argues the following:

> The state in its own way abolishes distinctions based on birth, rank, education, and occupation when it declares birth, rank, education, and occupation to be non-political distinctions, when it proclaims that every member of the people is an equal participant in popular sovereignty regardless of these distinctions, when it treats all those elements which go to make up the actual life of the people from the standpoint of the state. Nevertheless the state allows private property, education and occupation to act and manifest their particular nature in their own way, i.e., as private property, education and occupation. Far from abolishing these factual distinctions the state presupposes them in order to exist. (p. 219)

Marx is not discarding the accomplishment of citizenship since he describes it as "a big step forward" as well as the greatest achievement "within the prevailing scheme of things" (p. 221). Yet this is Marx's precise point: that sheer political liberation in citizenship is ineffective and promotes broad human liberation instead. This general liberation involves people who are emancipated from the governing control of private property and its accompanying institutions. The restrictions of citizenship, for Marx, are the political change that ascends, particularly through a social revolution where the class base of discriminations in social conditions and power is dethroned. Marxist thought, then, noted the exclusion of certain people due to unequal distribution of resources. In

other words, Marx juxtaposed citizenship to the economy by highlighting that the formal rights of citizens disguises the inequalities of non-citizens.

Specific groups, in the past and present, have been denied not only the tangible financial benefits (such as labor) of citizenship, but the ideal itself has also been negated. Such perceptions of immigrants are, and have historically been, made up of hostility. Consider Ono and Sloop's (2002) study on California's anti-immigrant law from the 1990's:

> Proposition 187 is a contemporary example of popular public policy issues that produced a sustained rhetoric of nativism and xenophobia…Proposition 187 allows us to study the role rhetoric plays in shaping social borders and constructing immigrant identities and international relationships…Developed by a coalition of nativist Californians, together with a then anti-immigration governor, Pete Wilson, Proposition 187 sought to eliminate public health, welfare, and educational provisions for undocumented migrants. (p. 3)

The rhetoric behind Proposition 187 constructed the meanings of 'nation' and its 'borders.' Ono and Sloop concluded that rhetoric critics must consider citizenship from the position of those who are silenced and subordinated, not from a position of legality and power in which citizenship questions are answered automatically and traditionally. Just as citizenship unifies legal citizens, it simultaneously separates those who are not legal. The scope of citizenship requires the consideration not just of those included, but also of those excluded. While this dissertation cannot consider every single person

excluded by formal citizenship, it will at least begin to consider the largest demographic group that is ignored: Latinos.

In addition to Ono and Sloop, Hasain Jr. and Delgado (1998) note the immigrant connotations within the citizenship realm of Proposition 187: "The typology of illegal immigrant becomes a signifier meaning Mexican (collapsing distinctions among Mexicans, Mexican Americans, Latinos) in a stereotypical manner similar to the social construction of welfare mother as African American female" (p. 257). The depictions of 'immigrant' were also constructed through certain persuasive appeals, thus categorizing illegal immigrants as being "un-American" as well as a "societal ill" that needs to be fixed. This historical anti-immigrant law exemplifies how citizenship theory may take into consideration how non-citizens, or non-Americans, are identified. It is these constructions of non-American citizens that cause suspicion and fear in the eyes of citizens.

In Cisneros' (2012) study on Arizona's SB 1070, rhetorical affects that result from the physical bodies of suspicious immigrants were examined. Specifically, notions of affect and "affective economies" were utilized to argue that Latino bodies are prescribed citizenship based on racial indications and performances. Cisnero contends: "To be legal (a citizen) means to display the right feelings, through skin color and demeanor; to be illegal means to spur feelings of suspiciousness, threat, and out-of-place-ness" (p. 137). Those excluded of citizenship are those who lack access or resources to complete this process. In other words, immigrants who do not complete the naturalization process are the ones excluded.

"Immigrants are reminders of how Americans, as a people, came to be, and immigration is central to how we view ourselves as a nation" (Chavez, 2001, p. 3). While many Americans can relate to immigration through a historical context, Latinos view immigration and citizenship in different manners. Since Latino immigrants are typically newcomers, they notice how their differences, or "otherness," affect their lives. Latino immigration provokes questions and inquiries regarding population growth, financial competition (and survival), and several verbal and nonverbal "cultural" pressures. Therefore examining citizenship not only from a particular moment in American history but also from different languages will permit for a more holistic application of citizenship theory.

To consider an immigrant perspective, evaluating the unintended audience, or those who are negated, is required. These individuals may include those who do not belong (in the legal sense) to this country. Specifically they are members who rhetoricians cannot, nor should not, forget. Thus, by analyzing this legislative effort from a Latin American perspective, through Spanish newspapers, we can recognize who is reported as 'the Other' as well as how Latinos and immigrants are informed, and even alerted, about SB 1070.

Inspired by Black, Wander (1984) wrote a seminal essay of his own in which he invited rhetorical scholars to attend to the third persona, the audience who is negated through discourse. Too often, according to Wander (1983), does "rhetorical theory oblige[s] us to ignore audiences not addressed, unable to attend, and unable to respond to

the 'text'" (p. 12). Wander distinguishes between the observed and unobserved, between the second and third persona:

> This link [between Heidegger and art] calls for an argumentation of the concept of audience in rhetorical theory to include audiences not present, audiences rejected or negated through the speech and/or the speaking situation. This audience I shall call the Third Persona…The Second Persona- being commended through discourse- is meaningful in a society made up of competing groups and rival ideologies…Beyond the rejection and ridicule, the Second Persona exists as a fact and an invitation…What is negated through the Second Persona forms the silhouette of a Third Persona – the "it" that is not present, that is objectified in a way that "you" and "I" are not. (p. 209)

While the second persona consists of an implied audience(s) who the rhetor addresses and constructs within their discourse, the third persona is that audience which is excluded or omitted by the speaker's discourse. Wander urges us to unpack the audiences that a rhetor's ideology negates.

This concept of the third persona is placed under ideological criticism, according to Wander (1984). He postulates that this new application to discourse focuses on ideology's application in daily situations with attention on history and humanity to assist scholars in critiquing "rhetoric legitimizing actions, policies, and silences relevant to the great issues of our time" (p. 199). Wander was fascinated by how discourse contained ideology that favored certain audiences, experiences, and concerns over others who were

ignored by the same ideology. Furthermore, noting the rhetorical "stylistic devices" is also fundamental. Wander argues that the manner in which language is utilized contextualizes the rhetor's ideology as well as ethical considerations of the audience. Through analyzing SB 1070 news texts and images, political and cultural ideologies on citizenship, as well as immigration, surfaced. These ideologies will be discussed in chapters four through seven.

Wander (1983) urges critics to examine disputing ideologies by considering the third persona during "emancipatory moments" in the past. In doing so, "stylistic devices" within discourse, as well as the rhetor's frame of mind in association to historical circumstances, surface to reveal the rhetor's ideology and principles (p. 12). For this study, the historical context is 2010, the year that Arizona's SB 1070 passed, the year that Latinos and immigrants tried to free themselves of a law that penalized them for simply being who they. In addition, unpacking these news stories permits us to observe not only the historical context but also the conflicting ideologies at linguistic, visual, and political levels.

Past scholars have articulated how the third persona can be used to evaluate texts and analyze audiences who are negated by omission (Campbell, 2005; Turner & Ryden, 2000; Moody, 2009; Lee, 2006; Stanfill, 2008). Cloud (1999) demonstrated the importance of these third persona components (rhetor's ideology, stylistic devices, and historical context) in her study on the silence of cotton mill workers. These mill workers were silent with a purpose: they knew if they spoke up against horrid work conditions,

that they would suffer consequences including the loss of their jobs. Cloud, too, argues that rhetoric critics must not ignore the ignored:

> For this reason, among many others, we should not mistake silence on questions of solidarity for lack of common cause. Paying attention to what cannot be said in certain material contexts reveals that the crafting of consciousness may not be the Alpha and the Omega of social change. The silences of the transcripts are matched by silences in the field of communication studies, which has, largely, ignored the labor movement. The silence represents a missed opportunity to explore the interaction between economic and symbolic power. (p. 199)

Just as Cloud analyzes the patriarchal ideology that promoted racism in mill towns in order to hush African American workers, I analyzed how such related mediated discourses silenced Latinos and immigrants during Arizona's SB 1070. For example, whether or not immigration advocacy groups were mentioned in news coverage was examined. If groups, like the League of United Latin American Citizens (LULAC), are mentioned in news stories, then a political ideology may be revealed. If, however, no advocacy group is provided, then a silence may be revealed: a silence that may result in leaving Latinos in the dark when it comes to the citizenship process and, more importantly, organizations and groups that may support them.

Aside from the politics associated with citizenship, critics have also examined differing ideologies among unintended audiences. Kendall (2008) in discussing environmental issues, explains how discourses silence unintended audiences. "… [The]

persuasive framing … specifically the problem of sustainability, in natural capitalism is what enables the marginalization of the third persona" (p. 74). Environmentalism and capitalism work simultaneously based on the values of sustainability and economic profit from "financial and manufactured capital" (p. 61). Before this merge, each ideology would have had not only a second and third persona, but also different manners of reinforcing such values. This was also observed in this study: how frequently English and Spanish newspapers state "legal status" in coverage which, as a result, silences those who lack it.

In this project, I was interested in studying both the audiences who were acknowledged as citizens in English and Spanish news coverage as well as those who were not recognized as such. This lack of voice may be due to the inability to speak up for one's self. However, as seen in Cloud's study, silence may be required as it may provide economic security, political safety, and stability. In the case of this legislative effort, news stories may, on one hand, may have revealed much about conventional citizenship values; and on the other hand, these news stories may also have revealed an audience that perceives or values citizenship from a non-traditional manner. Therefore, the way in which citizenship and immigration are theorized as values and identities in discourse may raise questions about motives of journalists when addressing audiences. How journalists address immigration and citizenship issues, within this rhetorical situation of Arizona's SB 1070, displays an obvious exigency: the necessity to address the content of news provided to, and aimed for, the largest minority group in the United States.

While Latinos may be instrumental due to their large numbers, this dissertation investigated how this significant demographic group is constructed in news stories in terms of citizenship and Arizona's SB 1070. News stories about citizenship and immigration are the focus of national and state debates where immigration discussions are followed by questions on civil rights, public welfare, and national security. However, these immigration issues, especially in today's political debates, may be too often motivated by those who use their power to promote their own political ends and agendas. Whether their influence is conscious or not, journalists are not excluded from such motivations (Edelman, 1979; Gans, 1979; Tuchnan, 1978). Thus, noting which audience, or persona, these journalists are writing for is fundamental in this study. This will reveal who is considered to be inside, or accepted, and who is considered to be outside, or not accepted (at least not up to this point).

All these rhetorical thoughts and theories regarding citizenship will help critics understand the dialectic relationship that exists between media and the unintended audience in issues of citizenship and immigration. Using second and third persona will permit for extrapolation of the type of audiences targeted by English and Spanish newspapers during this rhetorical situation. Furthermore, this study may help the reader understand not only which audiences exist but how they differ.

News Framing as Theory

Brummett (2000) contends the following about our selection of media intake: "In short, we know that we often pick and choose among the media available to us because the media themselves have differing rhetorical effects above and beyond the messages

conveyed through them" (p. 9). The majority of Americans will select a news source that is not only in English, but also congruent with their political ideologies (Stroud, 2011). And vice versa: news media will develop stories and reports based on their intended audience. For this reason, not only is it important to consider the subject matter and audience, but also the frame in which it is presented. The *matter* and *manner* of each frame is rhetorical, for it is promoting an ideology of citizenship through predilections of certain words and images. An example of this is the border fence: the advancement of this construction is more likely to result in negative sentiments, such as fear, xenophobia, and alert, instead of positive sentiments. The frame will reveal the citizenship stance of each news story.

Gitlin (1980) tells us that frames are the following:

> Frames are principles of selection, emphasis and presentation composed of little tacit theories about what exists, what happens, and what matters…[They are] largely unspoken and unacknowledged, organize the world both for journalists who report it and, in some important degree, for us who rely on their report. (pp. 6-7)

He continues by explaining that media frames function as a manner of identifying and classifying information, as well as promoting it "for efficient relay to their audiences" (p. 7). As Goffman (1974) explains, frames are fundamental cognitive structures which guide the representation and perception of reality. A frame is a perspective, or an angle, utilized to present a subject or an issue. Not only is the frame's subject matter vital, but so is its manner of being presented (such as the 'stylistic devices' discussed earlier).

Likewise, Entman (1991) distinguished media frames as "attributes of the news itself" (p. 7). He continues:

> [t]o frame is to select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in a communicating text, in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/ or treatment recommendation. (1993, p. 52)

Framing, as well as the process of presenting such news frames, affects the receivers of news stories. When applying frames to the model of communication (Weaver & Shannon, 1963), the encoder (in this study, journalists) and the decoder (the audiences) simultaneously influence one another. Thus, news framing offers a language that parallels differing worldviews.

Framing may also reveal what agenda is advanced by these newspapers for political engagement and call to actions. Studies have examined framing in amalgamation with other theories such as agenda setting or priming (Iyengar & Kinder, 1987). In addition, some scholars have argued that framing and its effects are an extension of agenda setting theory (McCombs, Shaw, & Weaver, 1997). Discovering certain themes in SB 1070 news coverage also permitted for explorations of agendas for target audiences. Furthermore, as will be explained in the last result chapter, sometimes it will be the audience which determines the agenda for what journalists will cover in their news stories.

Whether in Spanish or English, news media has influenced worldviews associated to immigration. When immigration is discussed, it is usually polarizing (Hadley, 1956).

Both sides of immigration are framed in media through the utilization of emotional and threatening language (Hardy, 2003; Santa Ana, 1999). The language and rhetoric appearing in newspaper coverage of immigrants and immigration is a fundamental characteristic for understanding citizenship frames and constructions. In addition to the framing in news language, the framing in news images will be vital. The frames constructed for the aural and visual channels of audience members will reveal not only citizenship substance, or the matter, but also the style of such citizenship constructions, or the manner.

Debates about immigration in media have existed for a long time now. Streitmatter's (1999) examination of the language utilized in four newspapers, during the final decade of the nineteenth century, found that the press conspicuously provided anti-immigration frames. Additional examples of legislation include forcing immigrants to pass stringent language tests before attaining employment in America and approval of admission into this country by American consuls (Higham, 2002). When considering the historical context of this immigration debate, news frames convey (and possibly create) public sentiment that may lead to support (or opposition) for new legislation. News frames try to prescribe, to their audiences, what they should and shouldn't believe, what they should stand up for and shouldn't stand up for. These frames can be powerful if effective. Effectiveness will not only result in a news frame staying in one's mind but, more importantly, engaging one in a call to action. For this reason, analyzing news frames of Arizona's SB 1070 is crucial to observing and contextualizing these rhetorical

citizenship constructions, as well as whether or not anything has changed in immigration news stories.

During the mid-20th century, Hadley's (1956) analysis of news reports, as well as Congressional hearings, observed the language used to express xenophobic, fearful sentiments. Through studying archival records, the "wetback decade," an upsurge of immigration between 1944 and 1954, was examined. This pejorative term, "wetback," was used for labeling immigrants who arrived to the United States illegally, historically someone from Mexico. While newspapers today do not use such derogatory terms, my analysis also discovered some critical and uncomplimentary labels that still exist for immigrants and Latinos such as "illegal." Unraveling negative connotations of immigrants, in news frames, revealed popular portrayals, as well as misconceptions, of citizens and immigrants. Furthermore, these news frames disclosed which preferences, as well as attitudes, were desired for the intended audience members.

As past studies on news frames (discussed above) have shown, Latinos and immigrants are discussed in cultural and economic contexts. Current research continues to examine how immigrants are constructed as social and economic foreigners (Coutin & Chock, 1995; Chavez, 2008), while other studies have examined the identification of immigrants past those contextual frames, identifying them as noticeably non-American (Fishman & Casiano, 1969). Observing how news frames tie Latinos to American social, economic, racial, and cultural issues will be crucial in pinpointing popular frames. News frames may, for instance, consist of "legal" and "illegal" frames as well as "citizen" and

"noncitizen" frames. These frames provide a specific language that draws the audience into a particular worldview.

More contemporary news media analysis on immigration has been firm in distinguishing "American" and "immigrant." Hardy (2003) studied metaphors associated to Latinos in newspaper coverage of the 1986 debate about Proposition 63, a legislative effort that made English the official language in California. By analyzing these repetitive metaphors through media framing in national and California news stories, Hardy found that Latinos and immigrants were framed as "lazy," or as collective "waves" that flooded this country. In addition, metaphors relating to Latinos and immigrants have been studied in the *Los Angeles Times* (during the coverage of California's Prop 187) by other scholars (Santa Ana, 1999; Santa Ana, Morán, & Sánchez, 1998). Beyond metaphors, scholars have continued to examine additional negative, linguistic devices used in newspapers to construct Latinos and immigrants in negative frames, such as criminals and opponents of American ideal citizenship (Coutin & Chock, 1995; Padín, 2005; Flores, 2003). These frames allow us to contextualize the agons of citizenship, or where citizenship tensions, such as race, lie.

Research on immigrants and Latinos in news frames, from the past and present, not only shed light on how this demographic is portrayed by media, but, more importantly, the role and power of language and rhetoric in the molding of citizenship discourse. While news stories of immigrants in the United States are important, none compare to the coverage between English and Spanish newspapers. Such a comparison would be beneficial, since immigration affects different states in different ways. While

immigration is viewed as a national concern with national implications, my analysis focused on how citizenship and immigration were framed in the news stories from the states of California, Arizona, and Florida, all which have high populations of Latino immigrants. Due to the lack of literature comparing English and Spanish news coverage (Subervi-Vélez, 2008), my study was focused on the news framing Arizona's SB 1070 across English and Spanish languages. Specifically, it was interested in studying these news frames on citizenship in both print and visual coverage across the languages. These frames not only revealed political and ideological differences, but cultural and linguistic distinctions as well.

Since this project was interested in how news stories framed citizenship in the wake of Arizona's SB 1070, critical work on framing informed my efforts. For my purposes, I was most interested in how those following the sociological tradition, as well as critical communication scholars (Ewen, 2001; Gitlin, 2002; Hall, 1997a; McLuhan, 1994), have used this approach.

McQuail (1994) explained the following: "The entire study of mass media is based on the premise that the media have significant effects" (p. 327). Furthermore, McQuail (1979) divides the history of media effects research into four stages. The first stage, which was led by strategic propaganda during World War I, was from turn of the 20th century to the late 1930's. The second stage consisted roughly from the 1940's to the 1960's. During this time, Klapper (1960) explained that 'mass communication does not ordinarily serve as a necessary and sufficient cause of audience effects, but rather through a nexus of mediated factors' (p. 28). The third stage, starting in the 1970's, aimed at

considering new and undiscovered perspectives of media effects. One prime example of this stage is Noelle-Neumann's (1974) concept on the spiral of silence which considered not only the opinions of the majority, but especially those of the minority.[5] The fourth, and current, stage is that of "social constructivism" which is utilized in the realm of political communication. McQuail (1994) points out that mass media impacts social constructions "by framing images of reality…in a predictable and patterned way" (p. 331). However, "social constructivism" also accounts for the producers of such mediated constructions: "*Society is a human product. Society is an objective reality. Man is a social product*" (Berger & Luckmann, 1966/1967, p. 61). As scholars, observing the *encoders*' (in mass media) impact on social constructions but also to the *decoders'* (recipients) influence is crucial. In the case of this study, these newspapers produce different news frames based on the realities of their audience members.

Not only do we, consumers, turn to mass media to view such social constructions but also to make sense of them. "Media discourse is part of the process by which individuals construct meaning, and public opinion is part of the process by which journalists…develop and crystalize meaning in public discourse" (Gamson & Modigliani, 1989, p. 2). However, the manner in which this crystallization will take place depends, in part, on the audience: "They [mass media] give the story a 'spin'…taking into account their organizational and modality constraints, professional judgments, and certain judgments *about the audience*" (emphasis added; Neuman, Just, & Crigler, 1992, p. 120). In the case of Arizona's SB 1070, English and Spanish news stories emphasized certain

words and images over others. These preferences, or words and images in news stories, was observed in my study.

Notions of citizenship in relation to media framing were especially helpful in my study since news frames of Arizona's SB 1070 were observed. Haas (2008), Haas and Dixon (2008), and Lakeoff and Ferguson (2006) contend that issues of immigration are covered in negative manners such as "the illegal frame," "the security frame," "the undocumented worker frame," and "the amnesty frame." In my dissertation, I analyzed the frames that were advanced in news stories to understand how citizens and citizenship were contextualized.

Not only will ubiquitous English and Spanish news frames be analyzed, but so will those news frames that counter, or oppose, popular frames. This counterframe can be determined by considering the exact opposite of a stance or issue. For example, if one frame is pro-immigrant, then the counterframe would be an anti-immigrant frame. Furthermore, I employed Entman's (2004a) criterion of "counterframing" which takes place when media gives "enough information independent of the executive branch that citizens can construct their own counterframes of issues and events," which necessitate a different frame in order to reach "significant magnitude to gain wide understanding…" (p. 17). Another study that examines this concept is a study by Bennett, Lawrence, and Livingston (2006) on the absent frame in the 2004 news coverage of Abu Gharib. Their study on the popular framing of the Abu Gharib event found that newspapers did not counterargue this event in a manner that questioned the Bush administration. In their words, Abu Gharib was an event-driven story that did not tell the whole story.

> It is important to make clear that we do not claim that torture was the only correct label for the events at Abu Ghraib. Nor do we argue that competing available frames for Abu Ghraib "should" have had absolutely equal footing in the news. However…"torture policy" was a counterframe worthy of public discussion… The weakness of the torture frame is not attributable merely to this administration's news management campaign but to the absence of a strong democratic challenge either from Congress or from the presidential campaign" (p. 481).

Thus, if there is an absence of a counterframe that challenges the official version of events, then a silence would be displayed. In the case of Abu Gharib, this absence of the counterframe signified a lack of challenging the actions of the soldiers and government officials.

This counterframe is the frame that would be critical of dominant news frames in SB 1070 news coverage. English newspapers reach out to different audiences so a counterframe in English coverage would be different from a counterframe in Spanish coverage. These counterframes are described and detailed in chapters four through seven. This silence parallels that of a negated audience. The counterframe is associated to the third persona or to those who are excluded, no matter in which coverage. Following this logic, a counterframe would have criticized SB 1070 as "anti-immigrant." My findings considered not only those frames that were idealized, but also how such frames opposed the dominant frames. In addition, I considered the extent to which counterframes were or

were not presented. By determining the counterframe, I could align the popular frame for the intended audience with the counterframe for the unintended audience.

When considering framing in news coverage of Arizona's SB 1070, it was important to note how such mediated discourse contributed to discussions on immigration. Regional and national media impact the framing of immigrants and immigration (Hofsetter & Loveman, 1982; Mondello, 1967). In my dissertation, I considered news frames that surfaced during the process of Arizona's SB 1070 to explore the multiple frames on citizenship, especially those associated to negated audience members.

A strength of news framing theory is that it allows for further understanding not only of the actual representations of citizenship, but, as discussed earlier, the process of citizenship. For example, in April and May of 2010 (which was close to the time when Arizona's SB 1070 was enacted), there were more news stories as well as more news images in comparison to the previous months (December 2009 until March 2010). This process would reveal that citizenship is heavily endorsed right before a significant historical moment. Furthermore, using this theory on news framing contributed to an area which is lacking in our field: cross-cultural analysis, as well as an analysis at a textual and visual level (usually one or the other is studied, not both). The formation, and process, of frames will bring attention to popular mediated discourse and, more importantly, to ideologies that privilege and ignore certain audiences and populations.

Conclusion

To review, I have provided a rhetorical theory of citizenship. I have included theory and perspectives from different disciplines to support the notion of citizenship as rhetorical constructions, specifically in news coverage and frames. I have provided an array of citizenship theories and thoughts that assisted my specific analysis of SB 1070 news coverage. In the following chapter, I will discuss the specific methods I utilized to analyze all the news stories and images. By doing so, I provide a more complete picture of citizenship as it pertained not only to general English speaking news consumers, but to Spanish speaking ones as well.

Footnotes

[1] In 2012, the U.S. Supreme Court concluded that Arizona's SB 1070 was unconstitutional except when it came to the "show me your papers" clause. Justice Kennedy contended: "The National Government has significant power to regulate immigration. Arizona may have understandable frustrations with the problems caused by illegal immigration while that process continues, but the State may not pursue policies that undermine federal law." (Arizona et al. v. United States, 2012, p. 25)

[2] An example of special circumstance citizenship is explained by the U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (2011) through this specific consideration: "Haitian child paroled under special circumstances" (online). This agency explains the unique ways in which these children can apply for citizenship in this country.

[3] The *Oxford English Dictionary* defines citizenship as "the position or status of being a citizen, with its rights and privileges." (online)

[4] One historical example of this is California's Proposition 187 (also known as the Save Our State initiative) in 1994. One ban was the following: "First, it bars illegal aliens from the state's public education systems from kindergarten through university, and requires public educational institutions to begin verifying the legal status of both students and their parents" ("Prop 187 approved in California," 1994). This legislative effort tried to deny non-American citizens, and their children, access to school sites.

[5] Other examples in this third stage include the questioning of opinion surveys in the news (Bogart, 1972), silence of reference groups (Oshagan, 1996), and isolation as a result of silence (Scheufele & Moy, 2000).

CHAPTER THREE

METHODS FOR STUDYING CITIZENSHIP CONSTRUCTIONS

"It took a fairly long time for critics to look at the news rhetorically."

(Hart & Daughton, 2005, p. 199)

Just as it has taken a long time to analyze news rhetorically, it has also taken some time to evaluate news culturally or racially. While rhetoricians have produced an adequate body of literature on news stories, they have not taken into consideration crucial cultural aspects including language (ie, non-English newspapers) or audience (ie, non-English speaking news consumers). This chapter presents the methods for obtaining the key findings of a systematic and quantitative analysis of SB 1070 coverage in six newspapers: two from Los Angeles (*LA Times* and *La Opinión*), two from Miami (*Miami Herald* and *Diario Las Américas*), and two from Phoenix (*Arizona Republic* and *Prensa Hispana)*. These six newspapers were purposely selected because they are located in cities that had at the time of the study, and still have today, the largest populations of Latinos.

My specific focus of these newspapers is to determine whether and how Latinos are invited to think of themselves as American citizens.[1] The frequency of words provides evidence of the type of citizenship that is constructed the most often as well as the intended and unintended audiences that these newspapers attempt to engage. In addition, the frequency of photos provides evidence of the visual messages and constructions on citizenship. In this chapter, I will explain the sequential process I went through, from collecting SB 1070 news texts and images to quantifying and qualifying it.

I will discuss the specific quantitative (content analysis) and qualitative (close textual) methods utilized for noting the frequencies and popularity of texts and images.

Word frequencies have been regarded as a beacon in human cognition (Dewhurst, Holmes, Brandt, & Dean, 2005; Stenberg, Hellman, & Johansson, 2008; Chalmers, Humphreys, & Dennis, 1997; Reder, Nhouyvanisvong, Ayers, Angstadt, & Hiraki, 2000). Furthermore, frequency allows for the interpretation of a measure of emphasis (Cohen, Tsfati, & Sheafer, 2008; Valenzuela, 2009). For SB 1070 news stories, frequencies of popular words, as well as popular pictures, displayed an emphasis on citizenship by English and Spanish news media. The words that appeared most often in newspapers signified frequency, as did the pictures that appeared the most.

Frequency is what was investigated in this dissertation. Frequencies are the rate of repetition of a word or picture. In each chapter, I note the differences and similarities between such frequencies. In other words, differences among the frequencies were noted because they all matter. Even subtle differences can be important. Pan and Kosicki (1993) support this logic: "…short-term, issue-related frames of reference can have a significant impact on perceiving, organizing, and interpreting incoming information and on drawing inferences from that information (p. 56). While my data analyzed newspapers over a short-term of six months, all textual and visual frames were important to consider. Recognizing all the differences in these frequencies, no matter how big or small, are fundamental to this study. They are all significant because worthwhile contributions are made by using news framing and citizenship as theories. My data is "an initial step

towards analyzing news discourse as a whole" (Pan & Kosicki, 1993, p. 55). All differences in this study, whether at the macro- or micro- level, were worthy of attention.

Specifically, for the SB 1070 texts, I first conducted the content analysis through utilizing the Concordance program, known as Word Smith,[2] which then allowed me to note the frequencies and, thus, create and solidify categories on citizenship and immigration. For the SB 1070 images, intercoder reliability was achieved (which will be discussed later in this chapter). After this was secured, I conducted close textual observations to find the central themes of these photos.

This dual method (of numerical content analysis and close textual analysis) as well as observation of two newspaper traits (texts and images) was utilized by Subervi-Vélez, Brindel, Taylor, and Espinosa (2008). In their study, texts and images exclusively from Spanish daily newspapers were examined in the 1984, 1988, 1992, and 1996 election periods. Furthermore, Duriau, Reger, and Pfarrer (2007) state that content analysis is "a class of methods at the intersection of the qualitative and quantitative traditions" (p. 5). While this binary methodological approach has been utilized in the past, it has not been done from 1) a rhetorical viewpoint, and 2) an intercultural perspective (a comparing and contrasting of two different language newspapers). For these reasons, this study contributes to the manner in which these methodologies are utilized in our field.

Following the content analysis, a close textual analysis involved detailed interpretations of these mediated discourse. In order to support my categorical claims achieved through close textual analysis, I needed evidence which I obtained through

content analysis. After reviewing the content analyses, I could determine central themes based upon word frequencies. In this chapter, I will first discuss specific types and tones of citizenship that were chosen early on for this study. Second I will provide an overview of all SB 1070 texts and images that constituted this data. Lastly, I will elaborate on my content analysis to explain how the close textual analysis was possible on top of it. By doing so, I hope to demonstrate how both these methods complimented one another.

Types and Tones of Citizenship

When examining SB 1070 news stories I had to interpret signs, both in texts and images. Before I collected my data, types of citizenship were considered to pinpoint the inclusionary and exclusionary aspects, as discussed in the last chapter. Furthermore, once the types of citizenship were determined, I could pinpoint the intended and unintended audiences.

Instead of considering the vigorous process of citizenship that immigrants undergo, many constantly (and almost automatically) consider citizenship to be linked to where it was conferred at birth. However, citizenship is much more than this: it is a dynamic and fluid concept that continues to be challenged today. For this reason, it was necessary to pinpoint the most popular types of citizenship. The four types of citizenship that will be discussed here are the following: legal status, rights, political activity, and collective identity. These are also detailed in Appendix A.

The first understanding of citizenship is the most basic understanding of it: legal status. As discussed in the last chapter, many historical examples demonstrate how legal status has functioned in other cultures and communities. Legal status is an association

between an individual and the nation-state that defines the terms of their political membership and outlines (Barbalet, 1988). Currently, the U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS) upholds the value by stating that citizenship demonstrates one's "commitment to this country and our form of government" ("Citizenship Rights and Responsibilities," USCIS website). One's birth place signifies where he or she may be included. In other words, it indicates which nation they belong to.

Under this framework, citizenship is all about legal acknowledgment. Citizenship, in this realm, indicates conventional and national membership in an organized political community. However, problems surface over describing who is entitled to obtain citizenship, and determining the boundaries and limits of rights and privileges between citizens and "aliens" (Bosniak, 2000). Today, many immigrants have much trouble obtaining legal status (citizenship) mainly due to the lack of resources, as well as lack of timely processing. In particular, Latinos and immigrants are especially treated harshly because they are viewed as people who lack legal status and commit crimes, thus advancing notions that America is granting criminals access to citizenship. Thus, by considering who can attain this citizenship, we can determine who is included in this nation.

In the context of SB 1070, legal status was fundamental. Obligating immigrants and Latinos to prove their legal status at any time, specifically to any law enforcement official, was the main purpose. This controversial clause (also known as the "show me your paper" clause) was the part of this law that the Supreme Court upheld. In other words, legal status rules at every level (local, state, and federal). As a result, individuals

who have obtained legal status are ideal members of society. Those immigrants, who made it through the difficult process not only to obtain legal status but to prove that they achieved the American Dream, are popularized. To what extent this idealizing takes place is observed here, which simultaneously reveals the intended and unintended audiences. For example, examining the frequency of times legal status is mentioned in the texts of these newspapers is crucial for understanding citizenship. A visual example of legal status includes government officials such as Arizona Sheriff Joe Arpaio, and Arizona Governor Jan Brewer. These political figures represent the American government which enforces legal status. Police officers would also be considered members who can validate legal status. Both of these examples demonstrate not only how legal status is textually and visually constructed, but also which frame is popularized and for which audience.

A second understanding of citizenship connects to rights, which is usually a result of citizenship being exclusionary. This approach can be traced back to the post-World War II period (Oboler, 2006). It was during this time that individuals saw various minorities' struggles for inclusion. The best, and most successful, example of this is the Civil Rights Movement of the 1960's and 1970's. This struggle was fundamental because it resulted in a development of civic, political, and social rights for several sectors previously excluded from political membership in the sense of belonging. This included African Americans, Latinos, other racialized populations, women, homosexuals, and the handicapped. These struggles for political, civil, and social rights were waged by specific groups and corresponded to the unique realities of their members. As a result of fighting for rights, such as voting and equality, many of the changes benefited the entire society

through the expansion of the scope of individual rights. Thus, political moments can symbolize a political change of meanings. These historical examples also resulted in improved daily experiences of citizenship for these groups. These political struggles also allow us to understand who can have such rights, or those who are included, and who cannot, or those who are excluded.

A third understanding of citizenship involves political activities which, depending on certain traits such as actors and settings, can display belonging or non-belonging. Considering citizenship as a political activity dates back to Aristotle, and its meaning in this realm refers to "active engagement in the life of the political community" ("Poetics," Trans. 1985). This perception of citizenship offers an opening for immigrant practices of citizenship because immigrants, whether documented or not, continue to participate in political coalitions and movements, signifying political citizenship within their communities. Regardless of the political ideology, political activities symbolize not only a civic exercise but also a disclosure of political opinions. For example, if a news frame displays a protest, then the reader might also be able to determine the political stance (for or against SB 1070) promoted in the frame. Rejection of citizenship from the state has resulted in an adoption of a more pluralistic view of citizenship located in groups and communities where people live.

An example of this approach comes from Thomas' (2006) study on how Puerto Ricans created a new framework during the New Deal era, based on the assumption of "a necessary relationship between, on the one hand, their social rights as US citizens in a local arena (New York City) and, on the other hand, their political and civic rights as US

citizens in a national/international arena (Puerto Rico)" (pp. 43-44). This new consideration of citizenship offers an invitation for practicing of citizenship today. Another example of citizenship as political activity is Brouwer's (2001) study on the struggles that AIDS activist group ACT UP confronted as they testified before various congressional meetings. In the process of this political activity, this group was able to not only practice their rights as citizens, but also pushed for public health reforms that may not have passed had ACT UP not gone through this process. Whether citizens are different due to their ethnicity, political ideology, or other traits, there is no reason why they should not exercise their rights to voice their opinions and make government demands. Under this framework, citizenship is defined through social activity, through an active process of obtaining rights, rather than legal status or law. In other words, the matter and manner in which Latinos are constructed and linked to citizenship will also be noted here.

A fourth understanding of citizenship is as collective identity which is associated to the exclusion and inclusion that certain immigrant groups experience as well as American citizens. Greene (2002) advocates for communication scholars to consider the cultural layers of citizenship. He urges scholars not only to consider processes by which individuals are labeled as "the Other" or "different" but also how they are negated access to civic sites. This viewpoint recognizes that subjective experiences influence how people comprehend the concept of citizenship. The experiences and practices of immigrants create citizen-subjects who have emotional connections of identification with social groups preserved through daily contact or simply imagined as communities (Anderson,

1983; Menjívar, 2006; Turner, 1993; Brettell, 2006). These sentiments of citizenship and solidarity can range from local to global. Coutin (2000) contends that sentiments of belonging surface despite the "legal nonexistence" of undocumented immigrants. In other words, immigrants experience belonging, in this country, not only due to their legal status but also through interpersonal relationships, cultural values, and actions.

This realm of belonging, or inclusion, and community is linked to the notion of cultural citizenship, which Flores and Benmayor (1997) describe as "a range of social practices which, taken together, claim and establish a distinct social space for Latinos in this country…In our perspective, difference is seen as resource, not a threat" (pp. 1-5). Noting differences in the news stories of SB 1070, not only of citizens but of communities, will be crucial in understanding the agons among citizenship. These observations will then allow me to understand how Latinos are unified and separated from Americans (in both English and Spanish newspapers).

For the SB 1070 texts, the Wordsmith program allowed me to calculate the frequencies and then apply the type of citizenship from the four discussed above. However, for the SB 1070 images, there was no computerized program that could determine the frequencies of images. For the pictures, I coded them into two types of categories: citizenship type and citizenship tone. The citizenship variable was made up of five exclusive categories previously discussed (legal status, rights, political activity, and collective identity, and unclear; see Appendix A). Similarly, the tone variable was comprised of three different categories (affirmative, alarmist, and neutral; see Appendix B). This specific variable was modeled after Chavez (2001) who applied these tones to

magazine covers. Affirmative images celebrated citizenship among immigrants, commonly connecting Latinos and immigrants to the nation's distinctiveness. In other words, they were included in American identity. Cultural diversity and acknowledgement may be considered to be affirmative. Examples of this consist of picturing and constructing America as a nation of immigrants as well as presenting images that appeal for empathy for Latino families as will be seen in chapter six. These affirmative images show an inclusion or acceptance of immigrants. Alarmist images raised concern over Latinos or immigrants through such persuasive appeals as danger, fear, and caution toward this demographic. If police officers are photographed monitoring U.S. and Mexican borders, then this may alert the reader of potential criminal activity. Examples of this include surge in population (due to immigrants), non- assimilation by non-U.S. citizens, and other discourse that displayed Latinos and immigrants as a threat to America. Alarmist images, then, displays immigrants as people who do not belong to this country. A neutral news image does not make an evident statement of affirmation or alarm; instead, these include images with, what appeared to be, balanced messages. If a news frame was not clearly distinguished as pro- or anti- SB 1070, then it would be labeled as neutral. If the picture was not obviously affirmative or alarmist, then it was designated to this neutral classification. The justification for this is that it is more preferable to be careful when uncertain. Appendix B also describes these tones.

In short, I coded each picture according to their type of citizenship and type of tone represented. The following is an example of 4 (Citizenship) x 3 (Tone) categories:

(1) What type of citizenship is constructed?

0 – Legal Status

1 – Rights

2 – Collective Identity

3 – Political Activity

4 – Unclear

(2) What tone of citizenship is included?

0 – Alarmist

1 – Affirmative

2 – Neutral

(3) Which language newspaper is included? (this was added to separate language)

0 – English

1 – Spanish

Texts

Once the types and tones were determined, I could proceed to collect SB 1070 texts. Media texts, specifically newspapers, were the first consideration for locating constructions and meanings of citizenship among Latinos for this study. In association to the words, my close textual analysis found certain categories such immigration, legal and statutory terms, politicized terms, citizens, and citizenship. While it varies from newspaper to newspaper, these were the main categories (which will be discussed in more depth in each results chapter).

As stated earlier, I specifically analyzed English and Spanish newspapers in cities with high populations of Latinos. The articles selected were published over a six month time period, specifically five months before the law was enacted (April 23, 2010) and a month after the law was signed (May 2010). An initial search using the terms "citizen" or "citizenship" (as well as "immigrant" and "immigration") was conducted.

These articles were further parsed by searching the text of each article for a number of subjective criteria. First, the news articles must have referenced Latino immigrant groups or individual immigrants. Second, these news articles must have subjected these groups or individuals to this legislative effort in Arizona. Third, the references had to be central to the article, not simply side-tracked or briefly mentioned. In the beginning, while these news articles were gathered, hard copies were collected and then scanned. I omitted more articles based on a set of objective criteria. First, I omitted all editorials, letters to the editor, and commentaries. Second, each article (as well as each image) was only counted once (per article) even if it appeared in the same (or another) newspaper again.

After digitized versions of these articles were completed, they were submitted to WordSmith where wordlists were created for SB 1070 news stories. These wordlists were studied to search for the most commonly appearing terms used to refer to citizenship, immigration, and Latinos. Table 3.1 indicates the total number of articles examined for this dissertation. All six newspapers together published a total of 759 articles that discussed Arizona's SB 1070 and Latinos. In order to determine what totals to divide based of the word lists from WordSmith, I divided the selected terms by the overall

words found in these texts. In other words, I divided specific words by the *tokens (running word in texts)* and not the *tokens used for word list*.[3] For example, for the term "citizenship" (which will be discussed in the next chapter) I referred to the WordSmith list to obtain the total instances of this word. Once I had this total, I divided it by the total of all the words, or tokens (running words in texts), to determine the frequency of that particular newspapers. I followed this procedure for each term investigated in each newspaper. Following this example, once I had the total for "citizenship" of English or Spanish newspapers, I divided the total of "citizenship" by the grand total tokens of all three newspapers.

Table 3.1

Newspaper articles covering SB1070 and Latinos

LA Times n	La Opin. n	Mia. Her. n	D. Las Amér. n	Ariz. Rep. n	Pren. Hisp. n	Total n
125	212	63	50	184	125	759 articles

Note: n = total number of articles

The newspaper with the most Latino-related stories was Los Angeles' *La Opinión*: 212 news articles (n= 124,104 total words). Phoenix's *Arizona Republic* came in second with a total amount of 184 news articles (n= 140,892). A tie existed for third: both the *LA Times* (n= 94,278) and Phoenix's *Prensa Hispana* (n = 42,159) resulted each in 125 news stories. The *Miami Herald* published barely half of that amount: 63 (n=

37,157). Miami's *Diario Las Américas* (n= 25,553) had the least amount of news stories with only 50 news stories. All issues of these six newspapers were (electronically and physically) searched for articles addressing aspects of Latinos and Arizona Senate Bill 1070 (such as the law itself, protests as results of the law, and actors involved in this law such as Arizona Governor Jan Brewer or Arizona Sheriff Joe Arpaio).

Images

After the texts were collected (most of them through online databases), I obtained the images of these SB 1070 news stories (which, with the exception of one newspaper, were accessed through microfilm). Along with examining words in SB 1070 news stories, the images that accompanied them were also analyzed. The rhetorical tradition has been concerned with "the power of the word" (Lucaites & Hariman, 2001, p. 40). However, what has been recently recognized is that "visual images provide access to a range of human experience not always available through the study of discourse" (Foss, 2005, p. 143). To be clear, all the images analyzed were photographs that accompanied SB 1070 news stories. According to Hariman and Lucaites (2007):

> A photograph captures a tiny sliver of time and space yet can reveal in a flash the social order. Photojournalism shows what can be done in public, and it allows one to think that what is not shown cannot be done. Any photo can be an invitation to participate in a way of life and also a vivid reminder that others –you, perhaps- are not welcome, perhaps not even thought possible. (p. 287)

When it comes to citizenship, not only must one consider who is, and who is not, invited to be an American citizen but also the linguistic *and* visual language used.

While visual rhetoric continues to grow, much research is still needed (especially that research which compares and contrasts written language with visual language). Studies on visual rhetoric include Cloud's (2004) examination of Afghan women photos in national news magazines and their websites; Chavez's (2001) analysis of immigrants on national news magazines; Horwitz and Swyers (2009) contend that television images serve as a 'cultural forum'[4] as to who may (ie, men) and who may not (ie, women) be promoted for American president; and Bystrom, Banwart, Kaid, and Roberston (2004) examined female and male political candidates in over 1,300 political spots, 48 websites, and 1,800 newspaper articles between 1990 and 2002. Further research is needed to understand how pictures are rhetorically constructed by media.

These pictures are valuable evidence of how SB 1070 news stories visually intrigue readers about citizenship. This 'visual public sphere' requires critical reason. While this type of reasoning has traditionally been associated to language, it differs for news images as it requires one to "negotiate more directly with intuition, for intuitive reactions are activated, directed and represented by the verbally mute image" (Hariman & Lucaites, 2007, p. 298).

Tables 3.2 through 3.7 demonstrate the 783 news images that were examined. The newspaper with the most photos was Phoenix's *Prensa Hispana* with a total of 254 photos. Los Angeles' *La Opinión* came in second with a total of 233 photos, followed by Phoenix's *Arizona Republic* with 136 photos. In fourth place was *LA Times* with 85

photos. The two newspapers with the least amount of news photos were *Miami Herald*, with 53 photos, and *Diario Las Américas* with only 22 photos. Of these 783 photos collected, only 274 photos came from English newspapers, a significant difference when considering that over 500 photos were provided by Spanish SB 1070 news stories.

Table 3.2

Newspaper photos covering SB 1070 and Latinos

Los Angeles Times

	Affirmative	Alarmist	Neutral	Total
	n (%)	n (%)	n (%)	n (%)
Political Activity	16 (18.82)	2 (2.35)	13 (15.29)	31 (36.47)
Unclear	0	0	19 (22.35)	19 (22.35)
Collective Identity	4 (4.71)	1 (1.18)	13 (15.29)	18 (21.18)
Legal Status	0	13 (15.29)	4 (4.71)	17 (20)
Rights	0	0	0	0
Total	20 (23.53)	16 (18.82)	49 (57.65)	85

Note: % = number of instances of term / total terms per paper (x 100)

Table 3.3

Miami Herald

	Affirmative	Alarmist	Neutral	Total
	n (%)	n (%)	n (%)	n (%)
Collective Identity	8 (15.09)	1 (1.89)	10 (18.87)	19 (35.85)
Unclear	0	0	18 (33.96)	18 (33.96)
Legal Status	0	6 (11.32)	2 (3.77)	8 (15.09)
Political Activity	5 (9.44)	0	2 (3.77)	7 (13.21)
Rights	1 (1.89)	0	0	1 (1.89)
Total	14 (26.42)	7 (13.21)	32 (60.38)	53

Note: % = number of instances of term / total terms per paper (x 100)

Table 3.4

Arizona Republic

	Affirmative	Alarmist	Neutral	Total
	n (%)	n (%)	n (%)	n (%)
Unclear	0	3 (2.21)	48 (35.29)	51 (37.50)
Legal Status	0	10 (7.35)	28 (20.59)	38 (27.94)
Political Activity	14 (10.29)	6 (4.41)	16 (11.76)	36 (26.47)
Collective Identity	6 (4.41)	0	3 (2.21)	9 (6.62)
Rights	1 (0.74)	0	1 (0.74)	2 (1.47)
Total	21 (15.44)	19 (13.97)	96 (70.59)	136

Table 3.5

Prensa Hispana

	Affirmative	Alarmist	Neutral	Total
	n (%)	n (%)	n (%)	n (%)
Political Activity	40 (15.75)	1 (0.39)	59 (23.23)	100 (39.37)
Unclear	1 (0.39)	2 (0.79)	71 (27.95)	74 (29.13)
Collective Identity	8 (3.15)	1 (0.39)	41 (16.14)	50 (19.69)
Legal Status	0	19 (7.48)	7 (2.76)	26 (10.24)
Rights	3 (1.18)	0	1 (0.39)	4 (1.57)
Total	52 (20.47)	23 (9.06)	179 (70.47)	254

Note: % = number of instances of term / total terms per paper (x 100)

Table 3.6

La Opinión

	Affirmative	Alarmist	Neutral	Total
	n (%)	n (%)	n (%)	n (%)
Political Activity	55 (23.61)	9 (3.86)	56 (24.03)	120 (51.50)
Unclear	0	0	71 (30.47)	71 (30.47)
Legal Status	0	20 (8.58)	8 (3.43)	28 (12.02)
Collective Identity	6 (2.58)	0	8 (3.43)	14 (6.01)
Rights	0	0	0	0
Total	61 (26.18)	29 (12.45)	143 (61.37)	233

Table 3.7

Diario Las Américas

	Affirmative	Alarmist	Neutral	Total
	n (%)	n (%)	n (%)	n (%)
Political Activity	7 (31.82)	0	2 (9.09)	9 (40.91)
Unclear	0	0	6 (27.27)	6 (27.27)
Legal Status	1 (4.55)	1 (4.55)	3 (13.64)	5 (22.73)
Collective Identity	1 (4.55)	0	1 (4.55)	2 (9.09)
Rights	0	0	0	0
Total	9 (40.91)	1 (4.55)	12 (54.55)	22

Note. % = number of instances of image / total images per paper (x 100)

After all the SB 1070 images were assigned types and tones by me, I could conduct the intercoder reliability. Intercoder reliability was established with the assistance of a second coder who is also a communication studies graduate student in our department as well as myself. To assess the reliability of the coding, a sample of 10 percent of the SB 1070 images was drawn at random and coded by the second coder, a total of 78 news photos. Krippendorff's alpha was computed.[5] Our range of agreement on photo coding was between .76 (for the tone of citizenship) and .86 (for the type of citizenship). This is satisfactory and standard practice as explained by Krippendorff (2004):

> To assure that the data under consideration are at least similarly interpretable by two or more scholars (as represented by different coders), it is customary to require $\alpha \geq .800$. Where tentative conclusions are still acceptable, $\alpha \geq .667$ is the lowest conceivable limit. (p. 241)

Content Analysis

Once the word lists, statistics, and intercoder reliability were determined through these computer programs, I could then calculate the frequencies for the texts and images. These frequencies will be provided at the end of each results chapter through tables that I have created through this first method of content analysis. Content analysis is a skill that permits researchers to categorize discourse accurately in accordance with specific rules and criteria.

> Content analysis has an important place in the methodology of investigative tools. It is capable, first, of accepting relatively unstructured symbolic communications as data and, second, of analyzing unobserved phenomena through the medium of data connected with the phenomena, regardless of whether language is involved or not. (Krippendorff, 1980, p. 33)

This method is especially important in this study because it can assist in evaluating communication messages at a particular moment in time (in this case, from December 2009 to May 2010). By comparing multiple sources (six newspaper sources to be exact) the substance and style depicted in SB 1070 news stories emerged to view the portrayals, and constructions, that are advanced in regards to citizenship and Latinos. Basic benefits of this method include: 1) examining communication messages and attributes; 2) to commercially assess corporate and personal media images; and 3) to make inferences about message manufacturers (Stroud & Higgins, 2009, pp. 124-125). Once I ran my data through the specified computer programs discussed above, I could calculate the frequencies and percentages to create all the tables needed.

Scholars specifically note how content analysis allows us to observe message and symbolic communication through content analysis. Stone, Dunphy, Smith, and Olilivie (1966) states: "Content analysis is a research technique for making inferences by systematically and objectively identifying specified characteristics within a text" (p. 5). For Berelson (1971), content analysis exposes the motives, purposes, and other traits of communicators as they are "reflected" in the subject matter of communication messages.

Certain scholars employ content analysis for focused case studies (Althaus et al., 1996, Entman & Page, 1994, Entman, 1992). Through application of this method, mediated constructions of citizenship and immigration associated to this legislative effort could be noted.

Content analysis, most importantly, provided a means for identifying and indexing all this data. With nearly 700 news stories, along with nearly 800 news photos, it was necessary to find a systematic manner of organizing all this data. Analysis of this data, once organized, made the close textual analysis much more effective and easier to conduct. As past scholars have noted, organization is fundamental and content analysis becomes a means not only for retrieving good access to words but also for understanding how encoders, or those creating messages, perceive their social worlds (Glassner & Loughlin, 1987). In my study, applying content analysis to SB 1070 news stories allowed me to locate what messages were popularized and which ones were not. In addition, I could determine where tensions lied (such as between the Republican and Democratic Parties).

Communication scholars have acknowledged content analysis as a major method for "identifying and quantifying certain words or content in text with the purpose of understanding the contextual use" of such words or content (Hsiu-Fang & Shannon, 2005, p. 1278). This is the approach with which content analysis was used in this study: as a way of quantifying and identifying instances in which specific, intuitive key terms associated with citizenship and Latinos appear. In brief, content analysis was utilized to

identify the most frequent words of citizenship in newspapers. As a result, this approach allowed me to create the necessary tables to demonstrate evidence through frequencies.

Close Textual Analysis

After the data was quantified, I could conduct meticulous observations of the SB 1070 texts and images. A close textual analysis was conducted on these news stories—both to interpret the appearance of the words and photos in context and to compare and contrast themes across the English and Spanish language texts. The close textual analysis classified broad ideas and messages in each news story (theme), the types of words utilized to address immigrants as well as the context (rhetoric), actors (specifically political and law officials associated with SB 1070), and other observations. I will address the word elements in further details in the following two results chapters.

This second method was used to determine the critical themes that surfaced. As Brummett (2008) states, "identity thus stems from our long and repeated engagement with the language and signs of texts" (p. 84). To this end, I argue that one way the public gets to know Latinos as citizens is via the repeated, or frequent, use of words in newspaper texts and images; therefore, I look to the themes of English newspapers first, followed by the themes found in Spanish newspapers. Through the content analysis (via WordSmith and intercoder reliability), I could locate the most commonly used texts and images. Along with the frequencies, I had the statistical data needed to calculate the percentages (which can be found in the tables at the end of this chapter as well as in the following four results chapters). After all the results and tables were made, then the close observations could be made. In other words, content analysis is what helped me quantify

my data set, thus permitting me to qualify my close textual analysis on top of that. Looking at the most repetitive texts and images allows for an investigation not only on SB 1070 but also of popular frames of Latinos, immigrants, and citizenship.

Furthermore, close textual analysis investigates the relationship between the internal workings of discourse and its context in order to discover what makes a particular text function persuasively. To a degree, close textual analysis, or "close reading," is a response to theoretical approaches to rhetorical criticism in the 1970's (Ehrenhaus, 2001; Lucas, 1990; Leff, 1986; Leff & Mohrmann, 1974). Close textual analysis attempts to reveal the detailed, often concealed, tools that give a particular text artistic consistency and rhetorical effect. By conducting a close textual analysis, hidden mechanisms (such as the counterframe or absent frame, as discussed in the last chapter) may surface.

Close textual analysis also reveals what ideology is being imposed on news consumers. Past studies have examined the rhetoric of news and its implications (Patterson, 1993; Hart, 1984; Kenski, 1996; Griffin, 1992). While news outlets claim to be neutral and objective, this is not always the case. By closely looking at news stories in media we can be aware of what persuasive appeals are used and how the news authorizes, qualifies, and supports their claims and viewpoints on citizenship and immigration. When it comes to SB 1070, close textual analysis will not only reveal the rhetoric from each newspaper and its differences, but also how certain ideologies are maintained in subtle manners. For example, by noting (in SB 1070 texts and images) which political figures

are mentioned more frequently (as well as in what particular context(s), we can note what party affiliation and/or individuals are upheld and preferred.

A close textual analysis serves as a suitable method because it can analyze relationships of citizenship – in this instance, it can shed light on whether the dominant discourse of American (white) citizenship outshines the citizenship constructions of Latino immigrants in print media. One advantage of critical textual analysis is that it permits us to detach different structures of a narrative to recognize which elements of a story have been eliminated (or in the case of this study, different populations or citizenship constructions) (Lester-Roushanamir & Raman, 1999). This method goes hand in hand with the second and third personae theoretical discussion from the last chapter: popular constructions and portrayals of citizenship will allow us to understand the mainstream audience; unpopular constructions and portrayals of citizenship will allow us to understand the excluded audience.

The comparison between citizenship constructions of the newspaper stories and the subjective elements embedded within those stories is revealing. This is true for two reasons: first, the issue of immigration may affect different states of the country in different circumstances; and second, while newspapers commonly reflect the national attitude on crucial issues like immigration, local newspapers, like those found in "border states," may expose opinions and predilections of their local markets.

Conclusion

Newspaper stories should not only be examined from a rhetorical position, as stated earlier, but also from a position that considers more than one language, as well as

more than one culture. They ought to be seen as a site of cultural construction and production, as a place where political philosophies and positions are not static but in a state of contestation, argumentation, and debate (Bennett, 1986, p. 8). It is in this sense that SB 1070 newspaper stories are a site of politics over citizenship and immigration.

My approach began with the position that news stories are filled with constructed texts and images that relate to citizenship. I discussed the quantitative and qualitative methods used for analyzing the 759 news articles and 783 news images. Through content analysis, along with close textual analysis, I established my readings and results of the rhetorical constructs on citizenship of SB 1070 texts and images. In the next four chapters, I meticulously examine the texts and images pertaining to English and Spanish newspapers.

Footnotes

[1] This focus is from the viewpoint of a Latin American audience, one that is more complicated than exclusively identifying one particular ethnicity. Within this context, I use this dual stance as a way of belonging to a nation vis-à-vis cultural practices. An example of this is Mexican Americans and their festivities and celebrations across the nation for Day of the Dead, or *Día de Los Muertos.* It seems imperative in this study to examine how both American and Latino audiences may contextualize, use, read, or compromise representations of citizenship, immigration, and themselves within these mediated news messages.

[2] Wordsmith Tools, or Wordsmith, is a computer software program that linguists utilize. "WordSmith also allows the user to compare word lists…The Key Word function provides a quick glimpse of what the text is about, since the list is not based on absolute frequency but rather the unique words that are frequent in the particular text." (Reppen, 2001, p. 34)

[3] As Wordsmith Tools explains: "If a text is 1,000 words long, it is said to have 1,000 'tokens'. But a lot of these words will be repeated, and there may be only say 400 different words in the text. 'Types', therefore, are the different words. The ratio between types and tokens in this example would be 40%" ("Type/token ratios and the standardised type/token ratio," 2010). To determine my calculations, I divided the select words by the *tokens (running words) in texts* since it calculated all words in particular texts. The line found underneath this is *tokens used for word list*, which calculates words that are repeated more than once and therefore does not become part of this calculation. For

example, if a text had seven tokens, then this would be part of *tokens (running words) in texts*. However, if one of those seven tokens repeated itself, then it would be considered to be six *tokens used for word list*.

[4] This concept of 'cultural forum' originates from "Television as a cultural forum: Implications for research" by Newcomb and Hirsch (1983).

[5] For additional references on computing Krippendorff's Alpha-Reliability, see Krippendorff (2011), Krippendorff (2004a), Krippendorff (2004b), and Hayes and Krippendorff (2007).

CHAPTER FOUR

KEEPING IT LEGAL: ENGLISH COVERAGE OF SB 1070 TEXTS

Law enforcement officers. Jan Brewer. Sheriff Joe Arpaio. Latinos. What do these words have in common? They are all characters in the story of SB 1070. Passed in April of 2010, this legislative effort capitalized on this fearful trend of anti-immigrant attitudes over the border violence between Mexico and the United States. To control this situation, the state of Arizona proposed a method to immigration policy, "attrition through enforcement." As a result, other states tried to pass similar anti-immigrant laws including Pennsylvania and Michigan.

In this chapter, I analyze the SB 1070 text results from English newspapers. I argue that English newspapers illustrate SB 1070 from a point of view that favors legal citizenship, law enforcement, and Republican law makers. Specifically, I observe these English newspapers to show that this legal approach to immigration policy (ie, "attrition through enforcement") represents an American reality that does not necessarily pertain to the majority of Latinos and immigrants as Spanish newspapers will demonstrate in chapters Five and Seven.

Before providing my close readings of English SB 1070 texts, attention must be paid to the frequency of SB 1070 front news stories. The *Arizona Republic* had 51 news stories on the front page (out of 184, resulting in nearly 28%). The *Los Angeles Times* had 27 news stories on the front page (out of 125, resulting in 22%). The *Miami Herald* had 9 articles on the front page (out of 63, resulting in 14%). As the next chapter will

demonstrate, SB 1070 and immigration news stories on the front page appear significantly less in the English newspapers than in Spanish newspapers.

I provide tables at the end of this chapter, as well as in the upcoming three chapters, to 1) show application of my content analysis, and 2) solidify my close reading of each particular theme found. The four themes that will be discussed here are the following: the legal citizen, the illegal immigrant, local police officers, and SB 1070 politicians. After I analyze the English newspapers to explain the codification of the connection between citizenship, immigration, and Latinos, I examine the absence of the counterframe of anti-immigration. The implications will be discussed at the end.

The Legal Citizen

Filing high quantities of paperwork. Being able to speak and write in English fluently. Passing a civics test. Completing medical exams. These are just some of the many steps that an immigrant must take in order to complete the citizenship process in this country. Yet, according to the *New York Times* (2009), the United States Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS) is ineffective.

> Congress requires Citizenship and Immigration Services to be self-supporting. For years, the agency languished, its ambitions and effectiveness sorely limited by the principle of economics and government known as You Get What You Pay For. Bureaucratic backlogs built up, as did frustrations. Would-be citizens spent years waiting for paperwork. Their long ordeals were compounded by a notoriously surly, inattentive bureaucracy. ("A commitment to citizenship")

Due to lack of funding and support, the citizenship process in the U.S. is criticized, especially for inadequate time completion of cases by the USCIS. Thus, my first finding addresses how much attention the English newspapers paid to the terms connected to citizenship ("citizen(s)" and "citizenship") in coverage of SB 1070.

Table 4.1 offers an initial glimpse at the appearances of these words across the news through frequncies. The data show a larger overall emphasis on the terms of citizenship in English speaking papers (.13 vs. .09), with the greatest emphasis per paper in the *Miami Herald* (.17), followed by the *Arizona Republic* (.14), and then the *Los Angeles Times* (.11). A first finding, then, is an emphasis on the terms of citizenship in these English newspapers.

Table 4.1

English SB 1070 Texts: Citizens and Citizenship Terms Appearing in Coverage

	LA Times n (%)	La Opin. n (%)	Miami Her. n (%)	D.L. Amer. n (%)	Ariz. Rep. n (%)	Pren. Hisp. n (%)	Total n (%)
Citizen(s)(ship)/	103 (.11)		62 (.17)		198 (.14)		363 (.13)
Ciudadano(*s*)(*ia*)		105 (.08)		35 (.14)		25 (.06)	165 (.09)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

Under this category, the most common forms of the term citizenship were the following: "path to citizenship" (9 times in *Republic*; 6 times in *Times*; 5 times in *Herald*), "pathway to citizenship," (4 times in *Times*; 2 times in *Herald*), "U.S. citizens"

(35 times in *Republic*; 10 times in *Herald*; 9 times in *Times*), "American citizen(s)(ship)," (2 times in *Republic*; 6 times in *Herald*; 2 times in *Times*) and "non-citizens" (5 times in *Republic*; 4 times in *Times*). When addressing citizenship, these newspapers also focus their attention north of our border, detailing "paths to citizenship" in terms of legal processes ("earn citizenship" and "right to citizenship" appearing in the *Republic* and *Herald*) as well as something that law-abiding individuals already possess ("proof of citizenship" appearing 21 times in *Republic*, 5 times in *Times*, 2 times in *Herald*).

Some examples that describe this "path to citizenship" are the following:

> Senior White House aides privately have assured Latino activists that the president will back legislation next year to provide a path to citizenship for the estimated 12 million illegal immigrants. (Nicholas & Hamburger, 2009, p. A1)
>
> Without a path to citizenship, millions of people living in the U.S. will lack the basic tool needed to escape membership in the 'permanent underclass.' (Tobar, 2010a)
>
> Giving a pathway to citizenship to qualified illegal immigrants has long been the most controversial element in congressional proposals for comprehensive immigration reform. (Watanabe, 2010)
>
> The president recently met with Sens. Chuck Schumer, D-N.Y., and Lindsey Graham, R-S.C., who have been working for months to craft what they believe is a centrist bill to beef up enforcement of immigration laws while creating a path to citizenship for the estimated 10 million to 12 million illegal immigrants in the U.S. (Kelly, 2010a, p. A1)

> The Rev. Paul Langston-Daley of West Valley Unitarian Universalist Church in Glendale said he … wants Arizona lawmakers to wait for a national comprehensive immigration bill that is 'safe, humane and practical' and that offers a path to citizenship. (Rau, 2010, p. A1)
>
> If approved, applicants would receive a six-year visa, which eventually could be replaced by a green card -- the path to possible citizenship. (Chardy, 2009, p. 1B)
>
> Senate Democrats on Thursday unveiled a 26-page immigration overhaul proposal that includes a pathway to citizenship for the estimated 11 million to 12 million illegal immigrants. (Douglas & Lightman, 2010, p. 12A)

These quotations detail not only who follows the path (immigrants) but also who builds this path (politicians). If Latino immigrants follow this pathway of citizenship then they will overcome the rigorous legal citizenship process. The reason for this process-centered approach is to emphasize law and order. The citizenship process, while framed as conventional, is difficult. The USCIS, as discussed earlier, has yet to show efficiency. This is important to consider when distinguishing these constructions and frames associated to immigration. These pathway points on the process signal an audience that believes there are no 'ifs,' 'ands,' or 'buts,' when it comes to becoming an American. An intended audience, then, upholds the legal frame which shows a fixation for the legal means of citizenship in order to obtain national validity. This audience, more than likely, upholds this straight forward process (no matter how long it takes) and favors assimilation. Simultaneously, a negated audience consists of those who do not uphold American citizenship and who, more than likely, will

consider (or favor) another legal solution such as residency. The importance here lies in tradition and how American citizenship, as constructed by English newspapers, is so respected that other alternatives are hardly mentioned.

An unintended audience, on the other hand, consists of readers who disagree with this conventional path. These readers believe in different types of citizenships including political and collective types of citizenships. They also may believe that American citizenship is not, nor should be, the most popular type of national citizenship. This logic is confirmed by the Pew Hispanic Center: "Nearly two-thirds of the 5.4 million legal immigrants from Mexico who are eligible to become citizens of the United States have not yet taken that step" (Gonzalez-Barrera, Lopez, Passel, & Taylor, 2013). As the following chapter will demonstrate, some would argue that American citizenship is a least popular type of national citizenship and not even necessary to live in this country.

By not discussing other nationalities of Latinos including neighboring Central and South America, these English newspapers adopt a unilateral manner of discussing citizenship. This attitude highlights inclusion, or restrictions only to American culture, which is problematic here. As Bosniak (2006) argues the following:

> The problem is that [the] disregard of the larger world frame and of the permeability of national borders serves to distort or limit any account these scholars may offer of the practices and institutions and experiences of citizenship as it is practiced *within* the nation-state. (p. 7)

In other words, inconsideration of other cultures outside this country does not allow us to fully understand how citizenship functions inside our own nation. For example, a

Mexican-American citizen in this country will experience citizenship in a different manner due to their unique cultural behaviors and upbringings. They may grow up speaking more than one language, practicing more than one set of cultural traditions, and possibly even travel back and forth to the country where their families came from. These upbringings, thus, go beyond the experiences of most American citizens since the majority of Americans are monolingual and do not have passports.[2] Therefore, what it means to be an American citizen varies.

The legal American citizen is more frequently mentioned in these English newspapers, than Spanish newspapers, because it is idealized. An immigrant that takes the pathway to citizenship to become legal is preferred. The legal citizen is viewed as an immigrant who will follow the necessary rules and procedures to become an American citizen. This process also demonstrates perseverance because immigrants must meet *all* requirements such as health examinations and other high fees. The willingness of immigrants to be an American citizen at any cost necessary as noted here. Thus, legal citizenship symbolizes the determination of immigrants to satisfy the requirements of being an American, of being legally accepted.

This issue of acceptance and trust matters, especially when it comes to SB 1070. As observed with the most controversial clause of the law, law enforcement could ask individuals who have "reasonable suspicion" to show documentation to prove their legality. By psychological and cultural mechanisms of association Latinos were marked as "reasonable suspicious" to a certain degree. Examples of this are several protest signs, during SB 1070 demonstrations (as will be seen in chapter seven), that asked: "Do I look

reasonably suspicious?" Latinos constantly live with that mark of possibly being viewed as "illegal," of possibly having to provide documentation to establish whether or not they belong in the state of Arizona. In other words, their citizenship is constantly in question.

The Illegal Immigrant

> *Todos somos ilegales* [We are all illegals]. We are fighting for a new way, a new day. I walk the dessert in the day of night…I cross the river to the other side…The American land of parasites… See that border, it's neither scared nor hidden, the land we stand on, every inch of it stolen, how obscene, now these people are illegal, vilified survival, the journey is lethal. *Todos somos illegales*. (Outernational, 2011, track 4)

In these "We are all illegals" lyrics by Outernational, it is evident that they aim to go beyond such traditional labels of legal and illegals by declaring that everyone is illegal. They seem to understand the benefit to utilizing this blanket term of "illegal" for everyone: We are all human and that is what matters at the end of the day (not labels). Inspired by the logic of this song, this section addresses the construction of illegality and illegal immigrants.

My second finding addresses how much attention English newspapers paid to the terms connected to immigration ("immigrant(s)" and "immigration") in coverage of SB 1070. Table 4.2 offers an initial glimpse at the appearances of these words across all English and Spanish newspapers of this study. A larger overall emphasis on the terms linked to "immigration" in English newspapers over Spanish newspapers (.77 vs. .28), with the greatest emphasis per paper in the *Miami Herald* (.89), followed by the *Los*

Angeles Times (.78) and the *Arizona Republic* (.74). A second finding, then, reveals themes through terms of immigration in the English newspapers. Thus, English-speaking audiences read more terms that are associated to immigration than Spanish-speaking audiences. While it would seem as if immigration affects Spanish-speaking audiences more than English-speaking audiences, this emphasis in English newspapers may signify a sense of alarm and fear.

Table 4.2

English SB 1070 Texts: Immigrants and Immigration Terms Appearing in Coverage

	LA Times n (%)	La Opin. n (%)	Miami Her. n (%)	D.L. Amer. n (%)	Ariz. Rep. n (%)	Pren. Hisp. n (%)	Total n (%)
Immigration/	732 (.78)		332 (.89)		1,040 (.74)		2,104 (.77)
Inmigración		345 (.28)		106 (.41)		90 (.21)	541 (.28)
Immigrant(s)/	530 (.56)		240 (.65)		484 (.35)		1,254 (.46)
Inmigrante(*s*)		410 (.33)		143 (.56)		121 (.29)	674 (.35)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

Under this category, the most common forms of the terms ‘immigration’ and ‘immigrant(s)’ were the following: “illegal immigrant(s)” (224 times in *Times*; 227 times in *Republic*; 60 times in *Herald*), “undocumented immigrant(s)” (56 times in *Republic*; 49 times in *Herald*; 18 times in *Times*), and “immigration law(s)” (256 times in *Republic*; 74 times in *Times*; 26 times in *Herald*). When addressing the term ‘immigration’ and

'immigrant(s),' these newspapers highlight a popular binary: "legal" versus "illegal" ("us" versus "them").

Some instances that describe immigration and immigrants are the following:

> But by 2005, central Arizona was seething over illegal immigration. (Riccardi, 2009, p. A1)
>
> Experts on both sides of the immigration debate agree that illegal immigrants rarely receive government benefits illegally. (Riccardi, 2010a, p. A16)
>
> Some Americans feel powerless before the many social changes wrought by Latin American immigration. (Tobar, 2010b, p. A2)
>
> …the law makes it a misdemeanor for a government employee to fail to report immigration violations… (Benson, 2009, p. B7)
>
> Most illegal immigrants either entered the country illegally, or stayed after their visas expired. (González, 2010a, p. B1)
>
> 'Right now, we have killers coming across the border as illegal immigrants,' she said. (Rau, 2010, p. A8)
>
> But a report issued this month … which backs tighter immigration controls, said many of the immigrants who legalized their status under IRCA did so fraudulently. (Chardy, 2010a, p. 2C)
>
> Failing to overhaul the nation's immigration system…could play a pivotal role in key mid-term election… (Douglas, 2010)
>
> It [SB 1070] alters American tradition … making immigration law enforcement a federal matter. (Taley & Douglas, 2010, p. A1)

Conversations of Latino immigration and American culture normally elicit one of two reactions. Either immigration is seen as threatening American life or as enriching American culture as new groups are welcomed and assimilated. As we can see here, the popular binary of legal versus illegal symbolizes something deeper: who is excluded and who is included.

A fear of immigrants, specifically the 'Latino Threat' (Chavez, 2008), sparks much of the debate concerning immigration. Proponents of the negative position on this issue argue that American culture and national identity are subordinated to potentially dangerous and at times fatal influences from immigrants as seen, for example, with the current Mexican drug wars. Supporters of immigrants, on the other hand, argue that the celebration of different cultures, the establishment of ethnic diversity servicing immigrant communities, and the perseverance of native languages can positively influence the cultural life of America. Thus, the constant negative use of 'illegal immigrants' reveals the conservative policy that is followed: if you break the law(s) you must be punished. "Illegal immigrants" not only signifies criminals and crime activities but also exclusion.

Through these careful readings, English newspapers confirm the advancements of alarmist and negative frames of illegal immigrants. The problem is framed as involving the illegal act of crossing the border without papers. Here, Latinos seem to be pegged, as a whole, as breaking the law. This hasty generalization is portrayed to an implied audience. As a result this construction, of 'illegal immigrants,' is used to promote law and order.

These English newspapers would have readers believe that since this term "illegal" signifies that immigrants are criminals, the 'reasonable suspect' of the Latin-American body is essentially outside the nation, outside the U.S. In other words, Latinos and immigrants are portrayed, in English coverage, as outsiders and those who threaten those inside the nation. This will contrast what Spanish newspapers advance especially in the Spanish SB 1070 images. Not only do English newspapers strongly encourage Latinos to become legal American citizens; they also construct Latino political organizations 1) as not being active and 2) as small and, thus, not successful. There are not many English newspapers that provide alternative positions or organizations to SB1070 as will be explained in the counterframe section of this chapter.

These close readings reveal that readers' are not invited to think of groups that support the rights of immigrants (especially since a least common term was "immigrant-rights groups"; mentioned 6 times in *Times*; 2 times in *Republic*; once in *Herald*). English newspapers did, however, mention some Latino political organizations. In *Times*, the following Latino organizations were included: Chicano Liberation Committee, the National Council of *La Raza*,[1] *National Latino Congreso* (National Latino Congress) and Coalition for Humane Immigrant Rights of Los Angeles. In *Republic*, the following Latino political organizations were mentioned: League of United Latin American Citizens (LULAC), *Chicanos Por La Causa* (Chicanos for the Cause) and Mexican American Legal Defense and Educational Fund. In *Herald*, only the Centro de *Orientación del Inmigrante* (Center for the Orientation of Immigrants) was mentioned.

Local Police Officers

One of the main supporters of SB1070, and a character who appeared in English newspapers since the very beginning in December 2009, is the sheriff of Maricopa County in Arizona: Joseph M. Arpaio. He was viewed by some as a hero due to his strong campaign against illegal immigration. Mr. Arpaio even labeled himself "the toughest sheriff in America" (Time Topics, *New York Times*, 2012). Without a doubt, it's the cops, like Sheriff Arpaio, that are the backbone of SB 1070. My third finding addresses the frequency of law enforcement and police in SB 1070 news stories.

Table 4.3 shows a preference for the legal perspective which is congruent with the previous two themes. The first term on this table, "law(s)," is mentioned more in English newspapers (.70) than Spanish newspapers (.58). The greatest emphasis per paper (for this first term) appears in the *Republic* (1.15), followed by the *Herald* (.62), and the *Los Angeles Times* (.08). Following this term, "illegal" and "police" also appear more in English coverage than in Spanish coverage by double the frequency total if not more. A third finding, then, is the substantial emphasis on law and law enforcement in these English newspapers.

Table 4.3

English SB 1070 Texts: Legal and Statutory Terms Appearing Terms

	LA Times n (%)	La Opin. n (%)	Miami Her. n (%)	D.L. Amer. n (%)	Ariz. Rep. n (%)	Pren. Hisp. n (%)	Total n (%)
Law(s)/	72 (.08)		230 (.62)		1,617 (1.15)		1,919 (.70)
Ley(*es*)		636 (.51)		97 (.38)		381 (.90)	1,114 (.58)
Illegal(s)(ity)(ly)/	475 (.50)		135 (.36)		685 (.49)		1,295 (.47)
Ilegal(*es*)(*idad*)		112 (.09)		74 (.29)		47 (.11)	233 (.12)
(*mente*)							
Police/Cop(s)/	220 (.23)		63 (.17)		344 (.24)		627 (.23)
Policia(*s*)(*ales*)(*cial*)		136 (.11)		30 (.12)		42 (.10)	208 (.11)
Crime(s)(al)(s)/	178 (.19)		47 (.13)		312 (.22)		537 (.20)
Crimen(*nes*)(ales)		69 (.06)		21 (.08)		69 (.16)	159 (.08)
Arrest(s)(ed)/	65 (.07)		26 (.07)		155 (.11)		246 (.09)
Arrestado(*os*)(*estar*)		32 (.03)		8 (.03)		10 (.02)	50 (.03)
Court(s)/	15 (.02)		9 (.02)		164 (.12)		188 (.07)
Corte(*s*)		52 (.04)		8 (.03)		19 (.05)	79 (.04)
Judge(s)/	31 (.03)		6 (.02)		69 (.05)		106 (.04)
Juece(*s*)		10 (.01)		4 (.02)		4 (.01)	18 (.01)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

Under this category, the most common forms of the terms "law(s)," "illegal(s)(ity)(ly)" and "police/cop(s)" were the following: law- "law enforcement" (93 in *Republic*; 39 in *Times*; 21 in *Herald*) ; illegal- "illegal immigration" (102 times in *Times*; 80 times in *Republic*; 22 times in *Herald*) ; police/cop(s)- "local police" (42 in *Republic*; 12 in *Times*; 8 in *Herald*). In regards to law enforcement, "local police" was the most frequently mentioned, thus displaying the importance of the local context of this law, in Phoenix, and not the federal context. Local police received more recognition than

federal enforcement such as the Immigration and Customs Enforcement or U.S. Border Control. Law and order, as the frequency of these terms show, must be maintained according to these English newspapers.

Some examples of legality and local law enforcement are the following:

> Arizona lawmakers … [were] directing local police to determine whether people are in the country legally. (Riccardi, 2010b, p. A1)
>
> …some polls indicate that as many as 70% are in favor of giving local police the authority to check on someone's legal status in the United States. (Serrano & Linthicum, 2010, p. A1)
>
> Every Maricopa County Sheriff's deputy will receive training on the authority of local law enforcement to enforce federal immigration law under a new education program. (Hensley, 2010)
>
> A federal program that enlists local police agencies to enforce immigration laws has grown rapidly… (González, 2010b, p. A1)
>
> Fearful that Miami may go the way of Arizona, they also demanded that South Florida authorities end their participation in a federal program that encourages local law enforcement to share fingerprint records… (Chardy & Chavez, 2010, p. 1B)
>
> The law makes … gives local police the power to question people suspected of being in the U.S. illegally. (Reinhard, 2010, p. 1A)

English newspapers, it appears, must mention those who will enforce SB 1070: the police.

The frequency of this term, "police," as well as the term, "illegal," seems to portray who the enemy is according to these English newspapers: invaders. English coverage portrays invaders, or illegal immigrants, as unwelcomed law breakers. By invading the nation, those immigrants shown as crossing the border are participating in a hostile act: trespassing, which is also illegal. Thus, this "illegal trespassing by illegals" logic is advanced by English newspapers in two ways: as a crime (trespassing) and as criminals (trespassers).

And who is best for monitoring and arresting these unwelcomed trespasses? Law enforcement. Local law enforcement represents safety and surveillance. These English newspapers uphold, then, not only the process of citizenship, but also the executioners of SB 1070. Police officers, as portrayed in English coverage, will uphold safety as well as this law in particular.

While law enforcement exists at different levels, it was local police that was popularized by English newspapers as determined through evidence of frequencies and examples. The emphasis of locality is important to note: "Newspapers are covering the Latino community in local and not national terms" (DiSipio & Henson, 1990, p. 13). Immigration, and those who enforce immigration laws, is framed as a local issue. Those who pertain to these cities, and who defend these cities, belong; they are included. Those who do not belong (in this case, immigrants) are excluded. This frame in English coverage highlights immigrants entering this country and impacting populations, resulting in the need for local police enforcement.

The SB 1070 Supporters

> While we are grateful for this legal victory, today is an opportunity to reflect on our journey and focus upon the true task ahead: the implementation and enforcement of this law in an even-handed manner that lives up to our highest ideals as American citizens. ("Brewer: Supreme Court's Arizona decision a 'victory for the rule of law,'" 2012)

Not only is law enforcement fundamental, but so are those who created SB 1070: the politicians. Political representatives, like the police, are concerned for the safety of American citizens. This section discusses political actors associated with SB 1070.

So far, English newspapers have revealed to their readers that illegal immigrants are bad and law enforcement is good since they capture and arrest them. However, politicians associated to this legislative effort are also frequently mentioned. Table 4.4 shows that the term "Republican(s)" is mentioned more than "Democrat(s)" (.14 versus .07). If we combine "Republican(s)" with "Brewer," then the total is .27. If we combine "Democrat(s)" with "Obama," then the total frequency is .22. In other words, English coverage emphasizes Republicans more than Democrats. A fourth finding, then, is the preference of one political affiliation, Republicans, more than the other, Democrats, in English newspapers.

Table 4.4

English SB 1070 Texts: Politicized Terms Appearing in Coverage

	LA Times *n* (%)	La Opin. *n* (%)	Mia. Her. *n* (%)	D. Las Amer. *n* (%)	Ariz. Repub. *n* (%)	Pren. Hisp. *n* (%)	Total *n* (%)
Republican(s)/	177 (.19)		58 (.16)		144 (.11)		379 (.14)
Republicano(*s*)		157 (.13)		89 (.35)		15 (.04)	261 (.14)
Brewer('s)/	69 (.07)		15 (.04)		277 (.20)		361 (.13)
Brewer		49 (.04)		8 (.03)		38 (.09)	95 (.05)
Mexican(s)/	126 (.13)		32 (.09)		400 (.28)		558 (.20)
Mexicano(*a*)(*os*)(*as*)		126 (.10)		19 (.07)		68 (.16)	213 (.11)
Obama('s)/	213 (.23)		99 (.27)		132 (.09)		444 (.16)
Obama		168 (.14)		93 (.36)		25 (.06)	286 (.15)
Right(s)/	151 (.16)		63 (.17)		215 (.15)		429 (.16)
Derecho(*s*)		151 (.12)		34 (.13)		84 (.20)	269 (.14)
Latino(a)(os)(as)/	198 (.21)		26 (.07)		66 (.05)		290 (.11)
Latino(*a*)(*os*)(*as*)		106 (.09)		8 (.03)		37 (.08)	151 (.08)
Protest(or)(s)('s)/	34 (.04)		24 (.06)		125 (.09)		183 (.07)
Protesta(*as*)(*antes*) (*aron*)(*ar\ando*)(*ante*)		68 (.05)		7 (.03)		45 (.11)	120 (.06)
Democrat(s)/	73 (.08)		22 (.06)		85 (.06)		180 (.07)
Democrata(*s*)		98 (.07)		60 (.23)		6 (.01)	164 (.09)
Activist(s)/	49 (.05)		29 (.08)		29 (.02)		107 (.04)
Activista(*s*)		115 (.09)		15 (.06)		28 (.07)	158 (.08)
(Un)constitutional/	19 (.20)		8 (.02)		52 (.04)		79 (.03)
(*In*)*constitucionales*		4 (.003)		8 (.03)		9 (.02)	21 (.01)
Alien(s)/	13 (.01)		4 (.01)		36 (.03)		53 (.02)
Extranjero(*a*)(*os*)		23 (.02)		14 (.05)		4 (.01)	41 (.02)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

Under this category, the political actors that were more frequently mentioned were Republican politicians. Political actors, like Brewer, promote this "pathway to citizenship" that they expect immigrants to follow. Some examples that highlight politicians associated with SB 1070 are the following:

> But that two-track approach was rejected repeatedly in the past by Republicans and other critics who insist that a border crackdown must demonstrate its effectiveness before any action on citizenship is considered. (Nicholas & Hamburger, 2009, p. A1)
>
> And advocates for putting the roughly 11 million illegal residents on a path to citizenship will face resistance from many Republicans, as well as some moderate Democrats… (Tan & Lee, 2010, p. AA1)
>
> Brewer's situation mirrors struggles of Republicans in other states who face challenges from a resurgent right wing of the party. (Riccardi, 2010c, p. A10)
>
> Some local Republicans believe he has a long history of putting his personal political interests ahead of conservative principles. (Nowicki, 2010)
>
> … and a whopping 84 percent of Republicans support SB 1070, according to the latest Rasmussen Poll of likely voters. (Roberts, 2010, p. B1)
>
> The law, which thrust Arizona into the national spotlight since Republican Gov. Jan Brewer signed it last week, requires local and state law enforcement to question people about their immigration status … (Davenport & Carlson, 2010, p. 3A)

The Republican Party may be mentioned more in English newspapers not only to display emphasis but also to provide an alarmist frame. Thus, the Republican Party is framed as the political party that will try to turn off this alarm through SB 1070.

English newspapers emphasize the Republican Party which indicates a political preference. However, complications arise for both political parties involved with SB 1070.

> If SB 1070 is upheld, Latinos will be inflamed, Republicans will embrace it and Latino turnout and enthusiasm for the election will go up. If SB 1070 is struck down, largely because the president authorized the Justice Department to sue, the president gets the benefit of all of that and you can expect Republicans to denounce the Court and to say predictably awful things about Latinos. So it's kind of good for Obama either way. (Hastings, 2012)

By emphasizing the Republican Party, English newspapers put the Democratic Party in the background. While preference for political affiliation may vary from state to state, preference for Republicans and Brewer are evident in these close readings of English coverage. This will be different in Spanish newspapers, as will be discussed in the next chapter.

Displaying this support for Republicans signifies a conservative frame as well as a frame which supports SB 1070 since it was created, and supported, by this political party. In other words, through alarming readers of "illegal immigrants" as discussed in this chapter, Republicans are framed as those who attempt to stop them through SB 1070.

Furthermore, by observing the groups in these last two themes (police enforcement and Republican politicians), a collective effort is noted. In other words, through these groups, one may argue that citizenship is framed as a collective identity even though it is conservative. However, legal status continues to be the most frequently observed type of citizenship especially when taken into consideration the frequency of the "legal citizen," and the "illegal immigrant" as discussed in the first two themes of this chapter. All these groups, while displaying a collective identity, follow the criteria of citizenship as legal status.

As I conclude that these four themes point to the emphasis of citizenship as legal status, the tone of citizenship must also be noted here. The majority of English coverage contains an alarmist tone. As discussed in the methods chapter, an affirmative tone is one that celebrates immigrants whereas an alarmist tone is one that is cautious of them. Many alarms have been set off by these English newspapers, whether it was through the frames of the "illegal immigrant," local police enforcement, or Republicans. In addition, the emphasis on Republicans, over Democrats, demonstrates how English newspapers highlight politicians who favor SB 1070 and want to monitor immigrants, especially those who are "illegal." One last proof of this alarmist tone is the lack of the mention for rights of immigrants as discussed through the lack of Latino political and activist organizations. This will be discussed in the next section on the counterframe.

Anti-Immigrant Counterframe

The central finding of this chapter is the heavier emphasis on citizenship, immigration, law and law enforcement, and Republicans in English coverage than

Spanish coverage. English newspapers highlight law and order through the frequencies of such terms and characters like "pathway to citizenship," "illegal immigrants," "local police officer(s)," the "Republican Party" and "Jan Brewer." Through these frequencies, a frame of legal status citizenship is observed. This tone of citizenship, as all these themes confirmed, proves to be alarmist since English coverage warns us of "illegal immigrants."

All of these themes demonstrate a preference for the type of citizenship that is legal status. To solidify this notion of citizenship, the dominant frame advanced by English newspapers was observed: immigrants, specifically those who do not follow the "pathway to citizenship," are problematic. Immigrants are viewed as a threat to America. More importantly, they threaten law and order in this nation.

While all these themes promote legal citizenship through SB 1070, a particular frame is missing: a counterframe. As discussed in the theory chapter, a challenge or opposition to this law would signify a counterframe. In this study, this counterframe would have consisted of a challenge to Jan Brewer's administration or this legislative effort. The dominant frame promoted in English coverage is pro-SB 1070 and pro-legal status for immigrants as seen through these four themes. The counterframe, then, would be anti-SB 1070 or pro-immigrants. In other words, the counterframe would describe the law, or its creators, as "anti-immigrant." This counterframe would also include criticizing Governor Brewer as well as Arizona law makers. The counterframe here is the term 'anti-immigrant' since it is a critique of the main frame provided by English newspapers. An example of this counterframe is observed in the *Times*: "Described as the toughest anti-

immigration law in the U.S., it has spawned fears that police will target minorities on the thinnest of suspicions" (Nicholas, 2010, p. A7). Table 4.5 shows the miniscule amount of times this term was used in both newspapers.

Table 4.5

English SB 1070 Texts: Anti-Immigration Term Appearing in Coverage

	LA Times *n* (%)	La Opin. *n* (%)	Mia. Her. *n* (%)	D. Las Amer. *n* (%)	Ariz. Repub. *n* (%)	Pren. Hisp. *n* (%)	Total *n* (%)
Anti-immigrant/	14 (.15)		4 (.01)		13 (.01)		31 (.01)
Anti-inmigrante		13 (.01)		3 (.01)		7 (.02)	23 (.01)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

Table 4.5 demonstrates that SB 1070 was not challenged in English or Spanish coverage. Comparing this table to the last one (table 4.4), the lack of the term 'activist(s)' (.04) is observed. In addition, the lack of Latino activist organizations, as discussed in the second theme of this chapter, is observed. These two findings, along with the lack of the counterframe, signify just how little SB 1070 was challenged in English coverage. In other words, English coverage hardly reports the challenges of this law.

Since newspapers aim for neutrality and representation of at least two sides of each news story, this last finding is interesting. The imbalance of such news reporting of SB 1070 exists through the main frame of legal status. The limited appearance of this challenge in English newspapers confirms that few news stories were willing to mention

or report the disapproval of SB 1070. This is a similar finding in the study done by Bennett et al. (2006) on the counterframe of torture in the 2004 news coverage of Abu Gharib as discussed in the news framing section in the theory chapter. By popularizing SB 1070 along with the actors who support it (politicians and law enforcement), these English newspapers separate mainstream perspectives from alternative viewpoints and challenges. Furthermore, if challenges to SB 1070 would have been made, then perhaps these news stories would have mentioned the rights of immigrants. As a result, then, we would have seen a different type of citizenship that might have focused on rights. This, however, was not the case.

This preference for the legal status frame presents a hierarchal manner of reporting SB 1070. English newspapers advance traditional frames on citizenship along with key politicians such as Jan Brewer. This frame, however, is dangerous due to its silence as well as misrepresentations of immigrants. As Latino immigrants move along a path to citizenship that these English newspapers emphasized, they are increasingly more integrated in terms of income, levels of education, and political engagement. Latinos and immigrants contribute to a constantly changing U.S. culture and society. However, these English newspapers seem to advance a different message: that immigrants need to be disciplined by law enforcement to ensure safety.

Implications

Having discussed the overall textual findings in English newspapers, I turn my attention to the implications. Why English newspapers hardly covered SB 1070 in a way that challenged Jan Brewer and/or Arizona government officials is all the more

interesting. As the first finding demonstrated, citizenship is fundamental. Certain terms like "pathway to citizenship" portray this nation as one of path builders. Moreover, if Latino immigrants follow this pathway to citizenship, which involves meeting physical and financial requirements, *then* they may become American.

This heavy emphasis on citizenship also suggests that Latino immigrants should undergo a transformation in which they not only meet the legal requirements but also the cultural requirements such as assimilating to American culture and society. This traditional construction of citizenship through legal status does not take into consideration the *backdoors* to citizenship. By covering this "path to citizenship," these English newspapers lack covering alternative ways in which Latinos and immigrants obtain citizenship. An example of this alternative can be found in an article in *LA Weekly* (2010) which interviewed immigrants who were in shame marriages in order to become American citizens.

> With no chance of legalizing their status any time soon and any substantial immigration reform having been stalled in Congress for more than a decade, some young illegal immigrants in recent years have decided to enter into fake marriages in the hope of expediting the process. (Arellano, *LA Weekly* online)

Although citizenship is portrayed as traditional, it is not always obtained in that manner. The emphasis on conventional and legal citizenship ignores the shortcomings of this legal process as well as the citizenship frustrations of immigrants and Latinos.

Another alternative to citizenship is birth tourism. Newcomb (2013) investigated this alternative practice:

> Complaints have spiked over "birth tourism" in Los Angeles County, with 60 alleged maternity hotels being reported in the past month, according to a report by the county planning department… the so-called maternity hotels are overwhelmingly advertised to women from Asia, as evidenced from various websites, offering expectant mothers the chance to give birth to an American citizen. ("Los Angeles County 'Birth Tourism' Complaints Spike," *ABC Nightline* online)

This displays an attempt for citizenship in an untraditional manner: immigrant mothers are more concerned with the citizenship of their children than their own. Once again, while English SB 1070 news coverage highlights citizenship as traditional, it is being obtained by immigrants and Latinos in untraditional ways. While citizenship is framed as traditional and linear, as seen with the example of the "pathway to citizenship" as well as the higher frequency of the term "citizenship" in English coverage than in Spanish coverage, that is not always the case as seen with these two examples of sham marriages and birth tourism.

Both these examples demonstrate the problematic nature of constructing a linear and traditional sense of citizenship. English SB 1070 news coverage becomes a fundamental site for observing the struggles over citizenship at the state and federal level, as referred to with the "local police," as well as over traditional and untraditional means of obtaining legality. These SB 1070 English news stories focused on national and

traditional elements of citizenship through the emphasis of legal status. In other words, these English newspapers did not cover the untraditional frames of citizenship described in these two specific examples. Citizenship, according to constructions and frames found in English coverage, is viewed in a traditional and legal sense. Yet, citizenship is not always formally obtained. In other words, different realities are not promoted here. This inconsistency displays the problematic coverage by SB 1070 English newspapers. In the next chapter, the results of the Spanish SB 1070 news coverage will be discussed to note the similarities and differences in citizenship and immigrant constructions and frames.

Footnotes

[1] The National Council of La Raza (n.d.) explains what the term, *la raza* (la ra-sa) means: "The term 'La Raza' has its origins in early 20th century Latin American literature and translates into English most closely as 'the people' or, according to some scholars, 'the Hispanic people of the New World.' The term was coined by Mexican scholar José Vasconcelos to reflect the fact that the people of Latin America are a mixture of many of the world's races, cultures, and religions. Some people have mistranslated 'La Raza' to mean 'the race,' implying that it is a term meant to exclude others. In fact, the full term coined by Vasconcelos, 'la raza cósmica,' meaning 'the cosmic people,' was developed to reflect not purity but the mixture inherent in the Hispanic people. This is an inclusive concept, meaning that Hispanics share with all other peoples of the world a common heritage and destiny." (*The National Council of La Raza* online)

[2] According to CNN (2011), only 30% of American citizens have passports. Bruce Bommarito, executive vice president and chief operating officer for the U.S. Travel Association states: "Americans are comfortable in their own environment." Matthew Kepnes, international traveler and creator of NomadicMatt.com, a blog chronicling his travels and observations, argues the following: "Not taking the leap is comforting, because this is the American life…breaking outside anything that is your norm is scary." (Avon, "Why more Americans don't travel abroad")

CHAPTER FIVE

THE IMMIGRATION STORM: SPANISH COVERAGE OF SB 1070 TEXTS

"Overall, the number of Spanish-language newspapers remained largely stable in 2010 (832 versus 835 in 2009). But the number of papers that paid to have their circulation independently audited is even more indicative of the economic success of newspapers, and those grew by 17% to 142, according to the Latino Print Network."

(Guskin & Mitchell, 2011, para. 7)

Latinos read newspapers without a doubt, as exemplified above. Yet how do Spanish newspapers specifically address crucial topics, like immigration and citizenship, today? Consumers of Spanish newspapers, Latinos and immigrants, differ from past waves of immigrants in three important ways. First, by and large, they tend to stay close to their home countries in Mexico, the Caribbean, and Central and South America. Second, they move back and forth between the United States and their home countries. Third, and worst of all, a border fence has been built specifically to keep immigrants from Latin America out. No other immigrant culture or group, like Latinos, have had such a large, physical border separate them.

While Latinos in the U.S. are isolated and separated from their homelands and families, they continue to be informed about their home countries through Spanish newspapers. Spanish media has allowed Latinos to receive not only local news in Spanish but also news from other countries in Latin America. Among Spanish newspapers, international news becomes part of local news. For instance, in association to SB 1070,

certain Spanish newspapers not only reported on who was boycotting this law here in the U.S., but also covered other countries, like Peru, who denounced it.

This chapter presents key findings of a systematic and quantitative analysis of SB 1070 coverage in the following three newspapers as demonstrated in table 5.1: *La Opinión*, *Diario Las Américas*, and *Prensa Hispana.*[1] As with the English newspapers examined in the last chapter, these Spanish newspapers were purposely selected because they are located in cities with some of the largest populations of Latinos. While all the English newspapers were obtained electronically (since our university has the databases with these newspapers), these Spanish newspapers (with the exception of *Prensa Hispana*) were obtained at the Benson Latin American Studies Library. Every single newspaper was meticulously scanned for SB 1070 news stories in association to Latinos and immigrants.

Table 5.1

Spanish SB 1070 Texts

La Opinión n	*Diario Las Américas* n	*Prensa Hispana* n	Total n
212	50	125	387

I argue that Spanish newspapers provided more SB 1070 stories[2] due to their functionality. On the one hand, since this law targets immigrants, there is more coverage in Spanish newspapers. It is as if Spanish newspapers sought to heighten awareness of this legislative effort due to the possible ramifications for their readers. On the other hand, more information on SB 1070 is provided because, unlike English newspapers, more citizenship options are provided as will be discussed in the next two themes. Thus, while the majority of Spanish news coverage is alarmist, it is done in order to inform their readers of the danger of this law.

Before exploring the themes from Spanish SB 1070 news coverage, noting the overall frequency of news stories that appeared on the front page is important. *Diario Las Américas* had 42 news stories on the front page (out of 50, resulting in 84%); *La Opinión* had 94 news stories on the front page (out of 212, resulting in 44%); and *Prensa Hispana* had 25 articles on the front page (out of 125, resulting in 20%). Among English newspapers, as discussed in the introduction of the last chapter, the news stories that made the front news were much less: *Republic*, 30%; *Times*, 21%; and *Herald*, 14%. In other words, SB 1070 and immigration news stories on the front page appeared significantly more in Spanish newspapers than in English newspapers.

First, I will discuss the four themes from Spanish SB 1070 news texts: the Latino resident, the undocumented immigrants, the follower of the law, and the conservatives. Second, I will discuss the implications. By comparing data from both English and Spanish newspapers, I will show not only the increased attentiveness but also the context

by which these terms were utilized to describe SB 1070. Following these themes, discussion on the counterframe will be provided followed by the implications.

The Latino Resident

> Soy lo que me enseño mi padre [I am what my father taught me],
>
> el que no quiere a su patria no quiere a su madre [who does not love his country does not love their mother]
>
> Soy América latina [I am Latin America]
>
> un pueblo sin piernas pero que camina [a people without legs but walks]
>
> Aquí estamos de pie [Here we stand]
>
> ¡Que viva Latinoamérica! [Long live Latinoamerica!]. (Arcaute & Calle 13, 2010, track 7)

Latinos are in a double bind when it comes to American citizenship. They may first, and foremost, be a citizen from the country that they came from *and* an American citizen (if they become naturalized citizens). As immigrants wait to become Americans, it is important that they not forget their roots, culture, and practices from their country of origin during the process. As explained through cultural citizenship (Flores & Benmayor, 1997), it is fundamental that we consider "how Latinos are incorporating themselves into U.S. society, while simultaneously developing specifically Latino cultural forms of expression that not only keep identity and heritage alive but significantly enrich the cultural whole of the country" (p. 2). In other words, by taking various cultures into consideration, a better understanding of citizenship in this country can be obtained.

A first finding addresses the little attention that Spanish newspapers paid to the American citizenship in SB 1070 news coverage. Table 5.2 offers an initial glimpse at the appearances of these words across these Spanish newspapers. The data shows a smaller emphasis on the terms of 'ciudadano(s)(ia)' [citizen[s][ship]] in Spanish speaking papers (.09 vs. .13 in English newspapers), with the following frequencies per paper: *Américas* (.14), followed by *Opinión* (.08), and *Hispana* (.06). A first observation, then, is a smaller emphasis on the term, "citizenship," in Spanish newspapers than in English newspapers.

Table 5.2

Spanish SB1070 Texts: Citizens and Citizenship Terms Appearing in Coverage

	LA Times n (%)	La Opin. n (%)	Miami Her. n (%)	D. Las Am. n (%)	Arizona Rep. n (%)	Pren. Hisp. n (%)	Total n (%)
Ciudadano(*s*)(*ia*)/ Citizen(s)(ship)	103 (.11)	105 (.08)	62 (.17)	35 (.14)	198 (.14)	25 (.06)	165 (.09) 363 (.13)
Residente(*s*)/ Resident(s)	45 (.05)	75 (.06)	22 (.06)	16 (.06)	68 (.05)	16 (.04)	107 (.06) 135 (.05)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

Under this category, the most common association of 'ciudadano' [citizen] is the following: 'los ciudadanos' [the citizens] - 44 times in *Opinión*; 11 times in *Américas*; 10 times in *Hispana*. For these Spanish newspapers, the most important type of citizenship is one that is plural and not specifically American. Thus, readers are invited to think of SB 1070 from a cultural, non-American perspective. Spanish newspapers also provide more legal options to Latinos: citizen *or* resident. As seen in table 5.2, the term "residente"

[resident] appears a little more in Spanish newspapers (.06) than in English newspapers (.05). 'Cuidadano' [citizen] and 'residente' [resident] both signify status labels that one may complete to belong to this country legally.

Here are a few examples of when 'cuidadano' [citizen] appeared:

"Hacerse ciudadano es importante en este país para integrarse plenamente a esta sociedad y aprovechar todas las oportunidades de bienestar", aseguró Terrazas [Becoming a citizen is important in this country to integrate fully in this society and enjoy all the opportunities from well-being" assured Terrazas]. ("Salvadoreños," 2010, p. 2A)

En cuanto a los latino ciudadanos y residentes, de acuerdo a las estimaciones de la Oficina de Presupuesta del Congreso, el ingreso promedio de una familia hispana de cuatro integrantes es de 38 mil dólares [As for Latino citizens and residents, according to estimates from the Congressional Budgetary Office, the average income of a Hispanic family of four is $38,000]. (Cádiz, 2009, p. 6A)

De esta manera, a partir del primero de marzo los ciudadanos o residentes estadounidenses que ingresen en México por vía aérea, terrestre o marítima tendrán que presentar cualquiera de los siguientes documentos vigentes para identificarse… [Thus, starting March 1 U.S. citizens or residents who enter Mexico by air, land or sea must present any of the following valid documents to identify themselves…]. (Truax, 2010a, p. 1A)

Los ciudadanos, negocios y empresas de San Francisco, California deben boicotear a Arizona en protesta por la nueva ley que permite a la policía de ese

> estado detener a gente por su status migratorio, dijo un concejal [Citizens, businesses and companies of San Francisco, California should boycott Arizona to protest the new law that allows police of that state to detain people for their immigration status, said a counselor. ("Proponen en San Francisco," 2010, p. 4B)

These examples show an alternative to 'cuidadano' [citizenship] especially since it is not necessarily associated with American citizenship. The general, cultural use of this term ("the citizens") shows a broad invitation for Latinos to think of themselves as individuals who belong to this country through two legal labels. As stated in the previous paragraph, through the term "resident" appearing more in Spanish coverage than English coverage, another possibility exists. In other words, there is another way to be legal in this country: by being a resident, not necessarily a legal citizen as discussed in the last chapter.

Why would these Spanish newspapers use 'ciudadano(s)' [citizen[s]] less than English newspapers? One explanation may be that these Spanish newspapers want to display other alternatives besides legal citizenship as seen through the frequency of the term "resident" in table 5.2. Latinos and immigrants may be *included* in American society in others ways besides becoming naturalized American citizens. While a resident is not a full-fledged citizen, the possibility exists for Latinos to make the transition from resident to citizen if they decide to do so. Even if legal and permanent citizenship is not obtained, immigrants still have the opportunity to be legal through residency. Thus, legal status is still upheld in Spanish newspapers, yet there is more than one legal option. This upholds the dual mentality mentioned earlier: that immigrants may, first, be citizens of their home country and then be American citizens (if they choose).

The least common type of 'ciudadano' [citizen] is the following: "ciudadano Americano," "ciudadano de EEUU," "ciudadano estadounidense" [American citizen(s)]- 14 times in *Opinión*; 4 times in *Américas*; 5 times in *Hispana*. In English newspapers, the most frequent frame of citizenship was an America, legal one where immigrants were strongly encouraged to follow the "pathway to citizenship." On the contrary, among Spanish newspapers, there are more options than just legal status. In addition, as stated earlier in this section, the word "ciudadanía" [citizenship] is mentioned less compared to English newspapers (.13 vs. .09). Spanish newspapers, overall, emphasized legality differently than English newspapers. This was done through an alternative term, "residente"' [resident], as well as through mentioning "citizenship" less and "immigration" more.

Spanish newspapers display other citizenship possibilities and nationalities. Cultural considerations for immigrants are obvious among Spanish newspapers through frames of a different possibility. Such alternatives will especially be noted in the Spanish SB 1070 images in chapter seven. This approach is also much more accepting of the different paths that immigrants take such as legal residency. Thus, legality still rules but the audience of Spanish newspapers is more open to an alternative legal solution known as residency.

The Undocumented Immigrants

> La ley 1070 convierte en delito menor la presencia de inmigrantes indocumentados en el estado, otorga a los departamentos policiacos de cuestionar el estatus de una persona si existe "sospecha razonable" de que se encuentra

> ilegalmente en el pais…Actualmente en Arizona, donde segun cifras oficiales viven 460.000 indocumentados, hay 170 agencias del orden, las cuales en conjunto cuentan con más de 16.000 agentes [The 1070 law converts the presence of undocumented immigrants in the state of Arizona into a misdemeanor, grants police departments the right to question the status of a person if there is "reasonable suspicion" that he/she is in the country illegally…Currently in Arizona, where according to official figures 460,000 undocumented [immigrants] live, there are 170 police agencies, which together count with more than 16,000 agents]. ("Fuerte reaccion," 2010, p. 5A)

This is an example of how SB 1070 was described only two days after Governor Jan Brewer signed the act into law. Here, *Américas* simplifies it: This law targets undocumented immigrants and gives law enforcement more power to check one's status if there is "reasonable suspicion." One must ask, what does "reasonable suspicion" mean? And, more importantly, how could police officers determine what "reasonable suspicion" looks like? These questions can be associated to the construction of immigrants in Spanish SB 1070 news stories.

A second finding that emerges from this data is the description of undocumented immigrants. Spanish newspapers used the term "indocumentado(s)" [undocumented] more than English newspapers as seen in table 5.3 (.29 vs. .08). However, when the terms "inmigrante(s)" [immigrants] and "inmigración" [immigration] are combined, the finding is that these terms appeared significantly less in Spanish newspapers (.63) than English newspapers (1.23). Readers of Spanish newspapers were far more likely to include terms

calling attention to “inmigrante(s)” [immigrant(s)] (.35) and “inmigración” [immigration] (.28) than the term “cuidadano” [citizenship] (.09), as seen in table 5.2.

Table 5.3

Spanish SB1070 Texts: Immigrant and Immigration Terms Appearing in Coverage

	LA Times n (%)	La Opin. n (%)	Miami Her. n (%)	D. Las Am. n (%)	Arizona Rep. n (%)	Pren. Hisp. n (%)	Total n (%)
Inmigrante(*s*)/ Immigrant(s)	530 (.56)	410 (.33)	240 (.65)	143 (.56)	484 (.35)	121 (.29)	674 (.35) 1,254 (.46)
Indocumentado(*s*) / Undocumented	47 (.05)	333 (.27)	77 (.21)	104 (.41)	105 (.07)	125 (.30)	562 (.29) 229 (.08)
Inmigración/ Immigration	732 (.78)	345 (.28)	332 (.89)	106 (.41)	1,040 (.74)	90 (.21)	541 (.28) 2,104 (.77)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

Under this category, the most common forms of “inmigrante(s)” and “inmigración” were the following: “inmigrante(s) indocumentado(a)(s)” [undocumented immigrant(s)]- 333 times in *Opinión*; 104 times in *Américas*; 125 times in *Hispana*; and “los inmigrantes” [the immigrants]- 125 times in *Opinión*; 42 times in *Américas*; 42 times in *Hispana*. While “illegal” was one of the most popular terms in English newspapers (.47), the term “indocumentado” [undocumented] (.29) is more commonly associated to immigrants in Spanish newspapers.

Here, an alarm is set off by Spanish newspapers: beware if you are undocumented. This indicates that regardless of the language of the newspaper, an alarm is still set. While English newspapers also alert their audience of “undocumented”

immigrants (.08), Spanish newspapers warn their audience of the potential danger of being undocumented in Arizona even more (.29). In other words, Spanish newspapers are cautious when it comes to SB 1070. These newspapers are especially concerned with those who are in charge of the law and those who enforce it due to the possible consequences that immigrants may face. Furthermore, tables 5.2 and 5.3 also demonstrates that Spanish newspapers are more concerned with an immigrant frame (.63 when "immigrant" and "immigration" terms are combined] than with the citizenship frame (.09). Discussing immigrants and immigration, as opposed to citizens and citizenship, demonstrates special consideration of immigrants and Latinos in Spanish coverage.

Utilizing an immigrant frame, and not a citizen frame, symbolizes understanding and compassion for their target audience. This consideration is a fascinating finding: that Spanish coverage is more focused on immigrants than citizens. In other words, the legal and linear "path to citizenship" that English newspapers promoted is not so frequent in Spanish newspapers, for it is granted that the experiences of Latinos as immigrants are as, if not more, valid than those of citizens. The frames have switched here: from an emphasis on a legal citizenship frame, observed in English coverage, to an immigrant frame as seen in Spanish coverage. The audience for Spanish newspapers observes an immigrant frame more than a citizenship frame. The news stories of and about immigrants resonate with readers. This is a very strategic and conscious choice of words by Spanish newspapers. They are aware that their target audience, more than likely, consists of immigrants who continue to speak their native language (Spanish).

Here are a few examples where "inmigrantes indocumentados" [undocumented immigrants] were used:

> El grupo [Cuerpo Civil Minuteman de Defensa], creado en abril de 2005, llegó a tener en sus filas a unos 12.000 miembros que se han turnado para detectar a inmigrantes indocumentados a lo largo de la frontera de EEUU con México y hacer que los detenga la Patrulla Fronteriza [The group [Minuteman Civil Defense Corps, or MCDC], created in April 2005, came to have in their ranks some 12,000 members have taken turns to detect illegal immigrants along the U.S. border with Mexico and make Border Patrol detain them]. ("Disuelven a los Minuteman," 2009, p. 1A)

> Del total de inmigrantes indocumentados, un 34% tiene entre 25 a 34 años de edad; un 27% entre 35 a 44 años y un 13% entre 18 y 24 años [Of the total of illegal immigrants, 34% are from 25 to 34 years old; 27% are from 35 to 44 years old and 13% are between 18 and 24 years old]. (Cádiz, 2010a, p. 1A)

> La investigación continúa; los presuntos "coyotes"[3] fueron encarcelados y los inmigrantes indocumentados están bajo la custodia de las autoridades. [The investigation continues; the alleged "coyotes" were imprisoned and the undocumented immigrants are in the custody of the authorities]. (Félix, 2010a, p. 2C)

These examples show how undocumented immigrants are described numerically and criminally.[4] Thus, the presence of immigrants is important yet problematic as seen with these examples.

The least common words for describing "inmigrante(s)" and "inmigración" were the following: "inmigrante(s) documentados/legal" [documented/legal immigrant(s)]- 3 times in *Opinión*; once in *Américas*; twice in *Hispana*; and "inmigrante(s) ilegal(es)" [illegal immigrants]- 16 times in *Opinión*; 14 times in *Américas*; 3 times in *Hispana*. Here, a similarity and difference is noted. "Documented immigrants" is hardly mentioned in Spanish newspapers; this is similar to English newspapers. The difference, however, is that the term "illegal immigrant" appears less in Spanish newspapers than in English newspapers. The term "illegality" is less frequent in Spanish newspapers (.12) than in English newspapers (.47) as seen in table 5.4. This is an opposite finding of the last chapter. Another comparison to consider here is the following: "undocumented" (.29) appears less than "illegal" (.12) as seen in this Spanish news coverage in tables 5.3 and 5.4. The reason for this is may be that "undocumented" is less accusatory than "illegal."

Table 5.4

Spanish SB1070 Texts: Legal and Statutory Terms Appearing Terms in Coverage

	LA Times n (%)	La Opin. n (%)	Miami Her. n (%)	D.L. Amer. n (%)	Ariz. Rep. n (%)	Pren. Hisp. n (%)	Total n (%)
Ley(*es*)/		636 (.51)		97 (.38)		381 (.90)	1,114 (.58)
Law(s)	72 (.08)		230 (.62)		1,617 (1.15)		1,919 (.70)
Ilegal(*es*)(*idad*)(*mente*)/		112 (.09)		74 (.29)		47 (.11)	233 (.12)
Illegal(s)(ity)(ly)	475 (.50)		135 (.36)		685 (.49)		1,295 (.47)
Policia(*s*)(*ales*)(*cial*)/		136 (.11)		30 (.12)		42 (.10)	208 (.11)
Police/Cop(s)	220 (.23)		63 (.17)		344 (.24)		627 (.23)
Crimen(*nes*)(ales)/		69 (.06)		21 (.08)		69 (.16)	159 (.08)
Crime(s)(al)(s)	178 (.19)		47 (.13)		312 (.22)		537 (.20)
Corte(*s*)/		52 (.04)		8 (.03)		19 (.05)	79 (.04)
Court(s)	15 (.02)		9 (.02)		164 (.12)		188 (.07)
Arrestado(*os*)(*estar*)/		32 (.03)		8 (.03)		10 (.02)	50 (.03)
Arrest(s)(ed)	65 (.07)		26 (.07)		155 (.11)		246 (.09)
Juece(s)/		10 (.01)		4 (.02)		4 (.01)	18 (.01)
Judge(s)	31 (.03)		6 (.02)		69 (.05)		106 (.04)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

The frequencies of these terms demonstrate that Spanish newspapers are more concerned with the repercussions of this law, and how it affects immigrants, than the actual citizenship process, or frame, as seen in English newspapers through the frequency of citizenship (.13) and through examples such as “pathway to citizenship.” The legality of immigrants is not as important as providing some sense of belonging as seen through “resident.” In other words, inclusion is demonstrated through the frequency of immigrant frames, such as “indocumentado(a)(s)” [undocumented], as opposed to exclusion through

the frequency of labels like “illegal” as observed in English coverage. The status of immigrants is less important in Spanish coverage than in English coverage. This is supported by adding the terms “undocumented” and “illegal” from tables 5.3 and 5.4 and, then, comparing it from Spanish (.41) to English (.56).

These Spanish newspapers face a double bind: by prioritizing immigrants over citizens, they appear empathetic toward their readers. Yet, through the frequency of the terms “inmigrante(s) indocumentado(s)” [undocumted immigrant(s)] the alarm, the look-out, is still present. Furthermore, an immigrant-centered frame is more frequent here as opposed to the citizen-centered frame found in English coverage. The frames, once again, have shifted. In English newspapers, the American citizen and tradition, specifically of law and order, is what mattered most. In Spanish newspapers, immigrants are the most important group with less emphasis on their legality. However, since “undocumented immigrants” is still frequently mentioned here, the legal alarm is still present. Perhaps the volume of the alarm is less in Spanish coverage; however, it is an alarm nonetheless as the one seen in English coverage.

The Follower of the Law

> With no chance of legalizing their status any time soon and any substantial immigration reform having been stalled in Congress for more than a decade, some young illegal immigrants in recent years have decided to enter into fake marriages in the hope of expediting the process. They’re doing it with the help of friends and relatives who have gone through the process before. “You reach this point where you figure, ‘Why not?’” Jose

> says…"[Young illegal immigrants] all reach that breaking point. We have a sense that we shouldn't succumb to something false. We want to be honest. But nothing's getting better." (Arellano, 2010)

In this unique article in *LA Weekly* (2010) titled "Rush to the altar," immigrants who are in sham marriages (in order to obtain American citizenship) are justified, as seen above in the testimony of Jose. The logic of such immigrants is this: If the system is not going to take care of us, then we are going to take care of ourselves. In other words, immigrants may provide justifications for not following the law, for not following the "pathway to citizenship."

A third theme that emerges from this data is the role of immigrants who obey SB 1070. Readers of Spanish newspapers encounter terms of legal importance as seen in table 5.4—such as "ley(es)" [law(s)]- .58, "ilegales(idad)(mente)" [illegal(s)(ity)(ly)]- .12, and "policia(s)(ales)(cial)" [police]- .11. Under this category, the most common forms of legal and statutory terms were the following: "ley de Arizona" [law of Arizona]- 47 times in *Opinión*; 23 times in *Américas*; 7 times in *Prensa Hispana*; "inmigrante(s)/inmigración ilegal" [illegal immigrant/immigration]- 39 times in *Américas*; 37 times in *Opinión*; 25 in *Hispana*; and "la policía/los policias" [police/policemen]- 15 times in *Américas*; 100 times in *Opinión*; 29 in *Hispana*. These popular terms are all associated with law and order through police enforcement. Thus, in English and Spanish newspapers, an emphasis on law and order is displayed. Just as in the last chapter, with English newspapers paying special attention to law enforcement, Spanish coverage is also concerned with those who maintain law and order. While the

frequencies vary among the terms, as seen in table 5.4, the three most popular terms ("law," "illegal," and "police") are the same in both English and Spanish coverage.

Here are a few examples that demonstrate how this law was discussed:

> La ley de Arizona, que aguarda la firma de la gobernadora Jan Brewer, criminaliza la presencia ilegal en el estado fronterizo y permite que la policia arreste a quienes sospeche que son indocumentados [The law of Arizona, which awaits the signature of Gov. Jan Brewer, criminalizes illegal presence in the border state and allows the police to arrest those suspected of being undocumented]. (Peña, 2010, p. 1A)

> El gobierno de Arizona podría aprobar una propuesta que tipificaría como delito la inmigación ilegal y endurecería las normas policiales contra los indocumentados en el estado [The Arizona government may approve a proposal that would criminalize illegal immigration and toughen police rules against the undocumented in the state]. (Billeaud, 2010, p. 7A)

> Esta entidad, gobernada por la republicana Jan Brewer, cuenta con unos 460.000 inmigrantes ilegales, según cálculos oficiales, de los cuales la mayoria son mexicanos [This entity, governed by Republican Jan Brewer, has about 460,000 illegal immigrants, according to official estimates, most of whom are Mexican]. ("México solidario con sus paisanos," 2010, p. 6A)

> El Congreso de Arizona aprobó esta semana una ley… que criminaliza a los inmigrantes indocumentados y permite a la policía arrestar a personas "sospechosas" de encontrarse de manera ilegal en el estado [The Congress of

> Arizona passed a law this week… that criminalizes undocumented immigrants and allows police to arrest people 'suspected' of being in the state illegally].
>
> ("Fortalecerá ley antiinmigrante de Arizona marchas del 1 de mayo," 2010, p. 6A)

Law and order continue to be heavily emphasized in Spanish coverage although not at the same frequency as English newspapers. Police, and the extent of their power, are frequently mentioned here as well. Unlike the last two themes, in which the frames switched, this frame of law enforcement continues to be emphasized in both English and Spanish newspapers.

The least common terms are the following: "ley antiinmigrante" [anti-immigrant law]- 14 times in *Opinión*; twice in *Américas*; 24 times in *Hispana*; "los ilegales" [the illegals]- 7 times in *Opinión*; 8 in *Américas*; 4 times in *Hispana*; and "policía local" [local police]- 3 times in *Américas*; twice in *Opinión*; twice in *Hispana*. With the term, "policía local" Spanish newspapers display caution of those who enforce SB 1070: local police officers. This term, "local police," may be less frequent because Spanish newspapers may not want to instill more fear in their readers than what they already face from the law itself. The low frequency of "anti-immigrant law" will be discussed in the upcoming counterframe section.

The Conservatives

> Por su parte, el senador estatal republicano Russell Pearce dijo … que en su opinión los inmigrantes indocumentados no tienen por qué gozar de los beneficios de este país. "Estas personas se aprovechan del sistema y dejan sin oportunidad a

> los que sí lo merecen y lo necesitan", dijo Pearce, quien aseguró que … presentará una nueva propuesta que podría convertir en un delito estatal la sola presencia de un inmigrante indocumentado en Arizona [Meanwhile, Republican Senator Russell Pearce said… that in his opinion undocumented immigrants have no reason to enjoy the benefits of this country. "These people are exploiting the system and leave no opportunity for those who deserve it and need it," said Pearce, who assured that ... he will present a new proposal that could convert the mere presence of an undocumented immigrant in Arizona into a state crime]. ("Hijos estadounidenses de indocumentados serán los más afectados por nueva ley," 2009, p. 3A)

Republican Senator Russell Pearce is the mastermind behind SB 1070. Back in 2009, more than 5 months before this law was enacted, Spanish newspapers like *Américas* were already warning their readers: Take cover. The storm is coming.

A fourth theme demonstrates an intrigue for the authors, and main supporters, of SB 1070. This last concern addresses how Spanish newspapers mentioned and described political actors in the coverage of SB 1070. Readers of Spanish newspapers were more likely to encounter terms associated to Republicans and Brewer (.19 when both frequencies are calculated) than Obama (.15) as seen in table 5.5. When this is compared to the frequencies of English newspapers, one can note that Republicans and Brewer are still mentioned more in English coverage (.27) than Spanish coverage (.19).

Table 5.5

Spanish SB1070 Texts: Politicized Terms Appearing in Coverage

	LA Times *n* (%)	La Opin. *n* (%)	Mia. Her. *n* (%)	D. Las Amer. *n* (%)	Ariz. Repub. *n* (%)	La Pren. Hisp. *n* (%)	Total *n* (%)
Republicano(*a*)(*os*)(*as*)/	157 (.13)		89 (.35)		15 (.04)		261 (.14)
Republican(s)	177 (.19)		58 (.16)		144 (.11)		379 (.14)
Brewer(*'s*)/	49 (.04)		8 (.03)		38 (.09)		95 (.05)
Brewer('s)	69 (.07)		15 (.04)		277 (.20)		361 (.13)
Obama(*'s*)/	168 (.14)		93 (.36)		25 (.06)		286 (.15)
Obama('s)	213 (.23)		99 (.27)		132 (.09)		444 (.16)
Derecho(*s*)/	151 (.12)		34 (.13)		84 (.20)		269 (.14)
Right(s)	151 (.16)		63 (.17)		215 (.15)		429 (.16)
Mexicano(*a*)(*os*)(*as*)/	126 (.10)		19 (.07)		68 (.16)		213 (.11)
Mexican(s)	126 (.13)		32 (.09)		400 (.28)		558 (.20)
Democrata(*s*)/	98 (.07)		60 (.23)		6 (.01)		164 (.09)
Democrat(s)	73 (.08)		22 (.06)		85 (.06)		180 (.07)
Latino(*a*)(*os*)(*as*)/	106 (.09)		8 (.03)		37 (.08)		151 (.08)
Latino(a)(os)(as)	198 (.21)		26 (.07)		66 (.05)		290 (.11)
Activista(*s*)/	115 (.09)		15 (.06)		28 (.07)		158 (.08)
Activist(s)	49 (.05)		29 (.08)		29 (.02)		107 (.04)
Protesta(*as*)(*antes*)(*aron*)(*ar\ando*)(*ante*)/	68 (.05)		7 (.03)		45 (.11)		120 (.06)
Protest(or)(s)('s)	34 (.04)		24 (.06)		125 (.09)		183 (.07)
Alien(s)/	13 (.01)		4 (.01)		36 (.03)		53 (.02)
Extranjero(*a*)(*os*)	23 (.02)		14 (.05)		4 (.01)		41 (.02)
(*In*)*constitucionales*/	4 (.003)		8 (.03)		9 (.02)		21 (.01)
(Un)constitutional	19 (.20)		8 (.02)		52 (.04)		79 (.03)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

Under this category, the most common politicized terms were the following: “los republicano(s)” [the Republican(s)]- 27 times in *Opinión*; 16 times in *Américas*; 4 times in *Hispana*; Jan Brewer- 57 times in *Hispana*; 49 times in *Opinión*; 8 times in *Américas*; and Barack Obama- 104 times in *Opinión*; 81 times in *Américas*; 17 times in *Hispana*. Like English newspapers, Spanish newspapers are more concerned with one political party, Republicans, than another, Democrats as demonstrated in table 5.5

Here are some examples that demonstrate how Spanish newspapers discussed Republicans:

> Los republicanos se oponen a puntos clave de los anteproyectos que han estado circulando y los demócratas, que tienen mayoría en el Congreso, están divididos tanto sobre la estrategia como en la sustancia [Republicans oppose key points of the drafts that have been circulating and the Democrats, who have a majority in Congress, are divided on both strategy and substance]. (“Reforma migratoria enfrenta obstáculos,” 2009, p. 1A)
>
> Vanessa Cajina, analista del Centro de Políticas de Migración… dijo que aunque la fecha límite para presentar propuestas de ley se ha cerrado, es posible que los republicanos pudieran enmendar algunas de las que ya presentaron y proponer más medidas antiinmigrantes [Vanessa Cajina, analyst from the Center for Migration Policy…said that although the deadline for presenting proposals of the law have now closed, it is possible that Republicans could amend some of those already presented and propose more anti-immigrant measures]. (Ortega, 2010, p. 1A)

> La organización Red de Acción Fronteriza de Arizona… se presentó de nueva cuenta en las oficinas de la Gobernadora Jan Brewer para intentar frenar propuestas anti-inmigrantes [The organization Border Action Network of Arizona ... was presented again in the offices of Governor Jan Brewer to try to stop anti-immigrant proposals]. (Padilla, 2010a, p. 1A)

This constructions on Republicans and Brewer raise the following question: What is the connection between Latinos and the GOP? As a recent finding from the Pew Hispanic Center (2010) states: "Two-thirds (65%) of Latino registered voters say they plan to support the Democratic candidate in their local congressional district, while just 22% support the Republican candidate" (Lopez, *Pew Hispanic Center* online). One reason that Spanish newspapers may mention this political party more is to warn readers of them. After all, SB 1070 has received backing from Republicans. By mentioning Republicans more, readers can be aware of the supporters and architects (ie, Russell Pearce) of this law. Thus, Spanish readers should be concerned with the strategies of the supporters of SB 1070, specifically of politicians like Brewer and Pearce. This law, and those who wrote it, impacts the lives of many immigrants since it targets anyone who has "reasonable suspicion."

The least popular terms were the following: "protesta(as)(antes)(aron)(ar/ando)(ante)" [protest(s)(ers)(ing)]- 68 times in *Opinión*; 7 times in *Américas*; 45 times in *Hispana*; "extranjero(a)(os)" [foreigner(s)]- 23 times in *Opinión*; 14 times in *Américas*; 4 times in *Hispana*; and "(in)constitucionales" [unconstitutional]- 4 times in *Opinión*; 8 times in *Américas*; 9 times in *Hispana*. These terms illustrate who is negated: those who

challenge, or protest against, SB 1070 including those who ponder the "unconstitutionality" of the law. Spanish newspapers give little to no attention to those who may oppose the law such grounds like constitutionality.

These warnings, found in Spanish coverage, reveal an alarmist tone. All themes covered in this chapter (the Latino resident, the undocumented immigrants, and the follower of the law, and the conservatives) display a frame of legal status. Legality continues to be promoted in these SB 1070 Spanish news stories, as found in the English SB 1070 news stories. The last theme in particular, the conservatives, highlights the main supporters and Republican law makers who created (Pearce) and passed (Brewer) this law. As argued in the last chapter, perhaps an argument could be made that these themes also represent a collective identity. While this may be true, the groups advanced here uphold citizenship as a legal concern. Both newspapers may have an alarmist tones, but the tone in Spanish coverage is less alarmist than the tone in English coverage as seen through the alternative to legality through residency as explained in the first theme on the Latino resident.

Anti-Immigrant Counterframe

Table 5.6 displays the same counterframe as the last chapter. In other words, both English and Spanish newspapers use the term "anti-immigrant," or "anti-inmigrante," at the same low frequency: .01. This means that none dare call SB 1070 "anti-immigrant" The reason this finding is interesting is because "a meaningful frame contest involves at least two coherent frames presented often and prominently" (Bennett et al., 2006, p. 472). In other words, there is an expectation that newspapers, regardless of language, would

display two frames of this law: pro-SB 1070 and anti-SB 1070. As observed in both newspapers, pro-SB 1070 frames dominate news coverage as seen through such terms as "illegals," "Republicans," "Jan Brewer," and "police/law enforcement." In this chapter, as well as the last chapter, not only were the low frequencies of this term, "anti-immigrant," observed so were the lack of other terms such as "protests," "activism," and Latino activist organizations such as the Chicano Liberation Committee and the League of United Latin American Citizens (LULAC).

Table 5.6

Spanish SB 1070 Texts: Anti-Immigration Term Appearing in Coverage

	LA Times *n* (%)	La Opin. *n* (%)	Mia. Her. *n* (%)	D. Las Amer. *n* (%)	Ariz. Repub. *n* (%)	Pren. Hisp. *n* (%)	Total *n* (%)
Anti-inmigrante		13 (.01)		3 (.01)		7 (.02)	23 (.01)
Anti-immigrant	14 (.15)		4 (.01)		13 (.01)		31 (.01)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

This continual emphasis on legal status, law, and order shows an important correlation: Spanish readers should be very cautious of law enforcement and SB 1070 supporters. Constant reminders are given to readers about the legality of SB 1070, how it affects illegal immigrants, and what the ramifications are if the law is broken. The legal immigrant who follows the rules is idealized. This occurs through information overload

on ‘undocumented immigrants’ and what can happen if they refuse to follow the leader, America.

Why both English and Spanish newspapers declined to cover SB 1070 in a way that challenged Republicans or Brewer framing is all the more interesting. Perhaps the reason for this is that the idea of American government adopting an anti-immigrant law represents a cultural inconsideration that “short circuits” frames of citizenship (Jones & Rowling, 2005; Entman, 2004b). In other words, if these newspapers would have challenged this law or its supporters more, then it might have been seen as anti-American; it may have been seen as taking immigrants into consideration and not citizens. This lack of frequency of “anti-immigrant” suggests a hierarchy: American citizens, and their concerns, matter more than immigrants, who are placed at the bottom.

What is at stake with mainly pro-SB 1070 news reporting by Spanish newspapers? A lot. By not adequately covering the challenges against SB 1070, as well as lacking information on Latino political organizations,[4] these newspapers do not encourage nor provide their Spanish-speaking audience with details for becoming politically active or conscious. Their silence (through lack of political activism) signifies some assent. This law should have been reported as civil rights conundrum which would then have led to discussion of citizenship as rights, not legal status. After all, immigrants influence American society. They are employed here. They pay taxes here. Their children attend school here. They dream of raising families here. The majority are assimilated into the American system, but are left with no other choice than to live in the shadows

because of their legal status. They are deprived of ordinary civil rights. The lack of reporting this as an "anti-immigrant" law curtails the basic human dignity of immigrants.

Implications

The main aim of this chapter was to observe how Spanish newspapers covered SB 1070 through news texts. This data shows the themes that emerged and how Latinos and immigrants were portrayed as citizens and immigrants. However, a major difference exists here. English newspapers discussed citizenship in a solidified, conventional frame (by detailing the "pathway to citizenship" and popularizing the "American citizen"). Spanish newspapers, on the contrary, approached citizenship as a concept that is fluid, a notion that had different options such as residency. While legal terms are still frequently mentioned in Spanish newspapers, they are used to warn readers of what is coming.

The main difference between Spanish and English newspapers is how they endorse citizenship. English newspapers characterize citizenship in strict and traditional ways. They frame immigrants in an illegal manner as discussed in the frequency of the term "illegal." Spanish newspapers humanize immigrants to some degree (not fully). Alternatives to legal status are provided a bit more in Spanish coverage. Thus, advancing the frame of legality is fundamental to these newspapers, regardless of the audience.

Spanish newspapers did their best to inform their Spanish-speaking audience of the storm approaching in Arizona. Yet, more was needed since SB 1070 was not exclusive to Arizona:

> Arizona's strict new law has generated the most controversy, but there are hundreds of immigration-related laws on the books across the country. The laws

> regulate employment, law enforcement, education, benefits and healthcare… the number of immigration-related laws and resolutions enacted by states surged to 333 last year, up from 32 in 2005, according to the National Conference of State Legislatures. And during the first three months of 2010, lawmakers introduced more than 1,000 bills and resolutions, though it's too early to tell how many will become law. Bills on topics such as employment verification and driver's license requirements are on the table in 45 states. (Gorman, 2010a)

Spanish newspapers understood what was at stake in regards to SB 1070: the increase of fear in one state can beget fear in more states. In other words, such legislative efforts like SB 1070 are not exclusive to Arizona. It is bigger: it parallels not only the changing settlement patterns of immigration but also the nervous attitude that Americans[5] still have of immigrants throughout the country. In the next chapter, SB 1070 images in English newspapers will be examined to determine if this promotion of the legal frame continues, as well as to determine the types and tones of citizenship in visual, mediated discourse.

Footnotes

[1] *La Opinión* and *Diario Las Américas* are daily newspapers. Due to the lack of resources at UT-Austin, no daily newspapers from Phoenix were available. Thus, *Prensa Hispana*, a weekly Phoenix Spanish newspaper, was selected. This newspaper has exclusive or dominant circulation in 72% of 164 zip codes in Arizona, making it the largest Spanish language publication in the state ("Prensa Hispana Phoenix," 2012).

[2] This substantial increase (among Spanish newspapers) is two-fold: First, there are more news articles (387 Spanish vs. 356 English). Second, news articles on the front page appear more often in Spanish newspapers than English newspapers (see the beginning of this chapter).

[3] The *Merriam-Webster Dictionary* defines a coyote as "one who smuggles immigrants into the United States" (online).

[4] The first example in this section reveals the number of MCDC members present to protect the border and arrest those who crossed the border. The second example provides a partial demographic profile of immigrants, while the third example associates "coyotes" with undocumented immigrants.

[4] These are a few of the political organizations that were mentioned in Spanish newspapers: *Liga de Ciudadanos Latinoamericanos Unidos* [League of United Latin American Citizens] (LULAC) (three times in *Opinión*, once in *Américas*, once in *Hispana*); the *Unión Americana de Libertades Civiles* [American Civil Liberties Union] (ACLU): (9 times in *Opinión* and once in *Hispana*); and *Centro Nacional de Leyes de Inmigración* [National Immigration Law Center] (NILC) (twice in *Opinión*).

[5] This is not to say that only Americans fear immigrants. Other Latinos, like Florida Governor Marco Rubio, support SB 1070 as well. As Lopez, Morin, and Taylor (2010) found, "the vast majority of Latinos—79%—disapprove of the first-of-its-kind Arizona law enacted this year that gives police broad powers to check the immigration status of people they stop for other reasons whom they suspect may be in this country illegally." (Lopez, 2010, Pew Hispanic Center)

CHAPTER SIX

PLURALITY, POLITICIANS, AND POLICE ENFORCEMENT: ENGLISH COVERAGE OF SB 1070 IMAGES

When words become unclear, I shall focus with photographs. When images become inadequate, I shall be content with silence.

(Adams, 1985, p. 33)

Although American photographer Ansel Adams may have been content with silence from images, this study certainly is not. The lack of a counterframe, as discussed in previous chapters, reveals an audience that is negated: the opponents of SB 1070. Furthermore, photography is fundamental since it *shows* readers a particular news story through visual language while *telling* them about it through written language. In fact, the initial construction of citizenship that is noticed is not the text but the image(s) of the news story. In addition, the captions were instrumental to the coding of SB 1070 images since they provide important details, such as a certain stance on SB 1070 or a call to action, among the many possible messages for each photo (Hall, 1997b, p. 228). News photos communicate not only with the audience but also with the texts. Mitchell (1994) asserts the following about the text and image combination:

> The real question to ask when confronted with these kinds of image-text relations is not 'what is the difference (or similarity) between the words and images?' but 'what difference do the differences (and similarities) make?' That is, why does it matter how words and images are juxtaposed, blended, or separated? (p. 91)

These similarities and differences are noted not only in these last two result chapters, but also in the conclusion. Such differences, as explained in chapter three, matter regardless of how big or small they are; all differences deserve our attention.

In total, out of all 783 SB 1070 images collected, only 274 of those came from English newspapers (for a total of 34 percent of all images). For the previous SB 1070 texts discussed in the last two chapters, one large word document was made to run it through WordSmith to determine the statistics and frequencies of words. These written texts were collected through online databases such as Lexus Nexus and the actual websites of the newspapers (in some cases). For the SB 1070 images, a separate, single document was made, per newspaper, to save pictures along with the date, the title of the news story, and caption (if provided). While some of these pictures were found online, the majority of these pictures were collected through microfilm from our college library loan system. By using microfilm, I was able to confirm that the pictures collected online were the same photos. With the exception of four pictures,[1] all SB 1070 images collected from English newspapers were part of the written news story.

After I coded all 783 images, I conducted the intercoder reliability for accuracy as explained in the methods chapter. Once that was established, I was able to conduct a content analysis, followed by a close textual analysis. By carefully analyzing the images that appeared most often, I found the most recurring themes associated to citizenship, immigration, and Latinos. Table 6.1 demonstrates the results of the types and tones of citizenship from English SB 1070 newspapers. The three most popular types of citizenship (collective identity, political activity, and legal status) will be noted in the

following themes: group members, SB 1070 political players, Latino families, and authorities along the U.S. and Mexican borders. Once these themes have been explained, an explanation of the most frequent types and tones of citizenship will be provided. The counterframe will also be discussed, followed by the implications.

Table 6.1

English SB 1070 Images: Types and Tones of Citizenship

	LA Times *n* (%)	Miami Herald *n* (%)	Arizona Republic *n* (%)	Total *n* (%)
Type				
Unclear	19 (22.35)	18 (33.96)	51 (37.5)	88 (32.35)
Political Activity	31(36.47)	7 (13.21)	36 (26.47)	74 (27)
Legal Status	17 (20)	8 (15.10	38 (27.94)	63 (22.99)
Collective Identity	18 (21.18)	19 (35.85)	9 (6.62)	46 (16.79)
Rights	0	1 (1.89)	2 (1.47)	3 (1.09)
Tone				
Neutral	49 (57.65)	32 (60.38)	96 (70.59)	177 (64.60)
Affirmative	20 (23.53)	14 (26.42)	21 (15.44)	55 (20.07)
Alarmist	16 (18.82)	7 (13.21)	19 (13.97)	42 (15.33)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

The Group Members

American industrialist and pioneer Henry Ford stated the following about groups working together: “Coming together is a beginning. Keeping together is progress. Working together is success” (*My life and work*, 1922/2006, p. 23). While the images in English coverage do not reveal which phase each group is in (such as the ‘beginning’ as described by Ford), they do reveal groups of three or more people committing an action together.

The first finding addresses the plurality of people in English newspaper images. Table 6.2 demonstrates how nearly half (45.62 percent, or 125 out of 274 total English SB 1070 images) of English SB 1070 images involved groups. These group images of SB 1070 displayed groups and, at times, their parameters. This involved not only physical boundaries between Mexico and U.S. but also certain boundaries of law and order as seen between police officers and protesters, which will be discussed on the last theme of this chapter. These groups included religious community members, police officers, and family members. As a result, citizenship imagery highlights differences through distinctive circles and peoples.

Table 6.2

English SB 1070 Images: Photos of Individuals and Groups

	LA Times *n* (%)	Miami Herald *n* (%)	Arizona Republic *n* (%)	Total *n* (%)
Groups (three or more people)	45 (52.94)	23 (43.40)	57 (41.91)	125 (45.62)
Individuals (one person shown)	19 (22.35)	21 (39.62)	42 (30.88)	82 (29.93)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

While the majority of the tables in this dissertation show frequencies in both English and Spanish newspapers, table 6.2 does not include the results of the Spanish images. The reason for this is because the dominating images in Spanish coverage are anti-SB 1070 protests across the nation. These frequent protest images in Spanish newspapers will be discussed in the next chapter. Furthermore, table 6.2 is setting up the next chapter and close reading on one group in particular: anti-SB 1070 demonstrators.

Several of the photos collected demonstrate community groups that belong to the city of the specific newspaper examined. This included photos containing local church congregates, theater members and demonstrators. One photo for the *Times* displays two immigrants involved in a local, theatrical production: 1) "Juan Herrera…feels the moment in a traveling theater company called 'Day Laborer Theater Without Borders'"; and 2) "Cuban immigrant Victor Wermer…prepares fellow actors… (Bermudez, 2010, p. B1). Another photo from the *Times* shows "migrants trek along a footpath leading from Sasabe, Mexico, to the U.S. border south of the Tucson" (Gorman, 2010b, p. AA2). In a

photo from the *Herald*, "an African immigrant…joins worshipers in prayer" (Henao, 2009, p. 21A). In another image from this same newspaper, church goers "pray during a vigil in support of comprehensive immigration reform…" (Kaleem, 2010, p. 1B). In a photo from the *Republic*, "immigrant-rights supporters rally outside Wrigley Field in Chicago" (Faller, 2010, p. C2). From this same newspaper, another image is provided with the following caption:

> Nine people are arrested Tuesday after chaining themselves to the doors of the Old Capitol building in Phoenix. The group, all college students, was protesting tough Arizona legislation cracking down on illegal immigration. The measure is on Gov. Jan Brewer's desk. (Rau, Pitzl, & Rough, 2010, p. A1)

These images show a variety of community and local groups associated, in some way, to this law. More importantly, not only do readers see groups of people working together, but they also see political stances revealed as to whether or not their group supports this law as seen with the previous quotation. Through group photos, collective identity can be noted. As described early on in this study in Appendix B, as well as the methods chapter, "to feel part of a community is determined not solely by immigration status but also by sentiments influenced by social relationships and cultural beliefs and practices" (Chavez, 2008, p. 14). In these pictures, groups are observed to become aware of their association, and link, to this law, whether on religious, political, or cultural grounds. How people contextualize citizenship may be visually seen through collective and subjective

experiences described above, such as religious, church images, and historical events like the 1980 El Mariel Boat Lift.

Whether historical or political, communities are made, to some degree, from social relations and political ideologies as observed in these images. These pictures show community group members were not only united through politics but also through other aspects such as religion. In this respect, shared activities create collective identity as well as a sense of solidarity. This is achieved through visual and political disclosure of a group's political stance and their connection with SB 1070. Collective identity was determined not only through visual signifiers, such as physical settings and objects, but also by confirming information through photo captions. This was also the same manner in which ethnicity was determined, through information provided from the captions. To make such distinctions, details such as last names and visual markers were taken into consideration. In the previous example of students who chained themselves to a government building, the type of group (protesters) along with their political stance (anti-SB 1070) was confirmed through the caption (Rau, Pitzl, & Rough, 2010, p. A1).

Group images here display a collective identity. These group pictures are the most popular type of image shown in English SB 1070 news images as shown in table 6.1 (types and tones) and 6.2 (group vs. individual photos). Protesting images are the most frequent pictures as will be discussed in the next chapter. Thus, an intended audience would seem to value group efforts, or collective identity. Communities, and its members, are seen working together to express their beliefs and opinions regarding SB 1070 and citizenship.

However, unlike Spanish newspapers, English newspapers showed little of one group in particular: protesters.[2] Many of the group images do not include demonstrators or marches. Instead different types of groups, specifically community and local ones, are displayed in different settings. This lack of images that display opposition to SB 1070 will be discussed in the counterframe section.

While group imagery is frequently seen, individual images constitute 30 percent of all English SB 1070 images (or 82 out of 274 total pictures). This is 15 percent less than group photos. In other words, these pictures do not typically display only one person. Private actions by individuals, such as praying or rehearsing alone, are negated as well. For example, when protesters are shown in English coverage, they are displayed *during* a protest, not beforehand. In other words, there aren't many images that demonstrate the work and preparation that occurs before a group activity.

From a visual angle, group imagery, as confirmed by the captions provided under this theme, seems to signify membership or belonging of some kind – membership in a political or a common society. For the most part, these images show group collaborations and interactions. For this reason, collective identity and solidarity are the most popular type of citizenship here.

This differs somewhat from the English SB 1070 texts which displayed a preference for legal status citizenship mainly through placing emphasis on those who supported SB 1070 such as the creators and enforcers of this law. While some protest pictures are provided in English newspapers, it is not as frequent as those images of politicians and other group members. While citizens, such as political representatives, are

visually displayed, immigrants are not. Immigrants, or those who may support them, are not as frequently viewed in English newspapers as much as in Spanish newspapers. This difference will be explained in the next chapter through the construction of the protesting giant. As the examples here demonstrate, various groups are pictured in English coverage. This will differ dramatically from the next chapter, in which one main group and event will dominate Spanish images: protesters and demonstrations against SB 1070.

This main finding of English SB 1070 images, up to this point, highlights the groups that are included and excluded in accordance to this law. By observing these group images, inclusion and exclusion is also noted. On the one hand, an intended audience may uphold a collective frame due to the frequent images of individuals working and acting together. On the other hand, images that include only one individual were not so common. While some individuals are photographed alone, they are not as frequent as pictures with group members and displays of collective action. In addition, immigrants and supporters of their rights are rarely shown in English coverage.

The SB 1070 Political Players

"At one of the news conferences, longtime Latino civil rights activist Dolores Huerta spoke in Spanish directly to fearful Arizona immigrants. 'Don't leave,' she said, promising a political backlash that would unseat politicians who passed the bill. 'Stay here'" (Riccardi, 2010d, p. A5). It is no surprise that English newspapers frequently displayed images of political figures and leaders associated to SB 1070. In order to understand these political constructions, the frequency of images including political representatives must be noted. This theme will reveal a frequency of a political party in

particular: the GOP. These images, as confirmed by their captions, display, for the most part, the political affiliation and stance of specific political actor(s).

A second finding addresses actors associated with SB 1070. Images of political figures, either as a head shot or in action, are frequently displayed in English SB 1070 images. In total, there were 86 images of political actors (out of 274), making up 31 percent of all the English SB 1070 images as confirmed by table 6.3. Spanish newspapers have a total of 125 images of politicians (out of 509), constituting nearly 25 percent of all Spanish images. This will also be discussed in the next chapter by specifically comparing and contrasting images of Latino politicians.

Table 6.3

English SB 1070 Images: Photos of Politicians

	LA Times *n* (%)	La Opin. *n* (%)	Mia. Her. *n* (%)	D.L. Amér. *n* (%)	Ariz. Rep. *n* (%)	La Pren. Hisp. *n* (%)	Total *n* (%)
Gov. Jan Brewer	1 (1.18)	4 (1.72)	1 (1.89)	0	6 (4.41)	6 (2.36)	8 (2.92) 10 (1.96)
Mexican President F. Calderón	3 (3.53)	1 (.43)	2 (3.77)	0	3 (2.21)	2 (.79)	8 (2.92) 3 (.59)
Senator Russell Pearce	2 (2.35)	1 (.43)	0	0	5 (3.68)	3 (1.18)	7 (2.55) 4 (.79)
Ariz. Senator John McCain	1 (1.18)	1 (.43)	0	2 (9.09)	6 (4.41)	0	7 (2.55) 3 (.59)
President Obama	3 (3.53)	8 (3.43)	1 (1.89)	0	2 (1.47)	0	6 (2.19) 8 (1.57)
Homeland Security Secretary Janet Napolitano	1 (1.18)	1 (.43)	0	1 (4.55)	3 (2.21)	2 (.79)	4 (1.46) 4 (.79)
Sherriff Joe Arpaio	1 (1.18)	2 (.86)	0	0	2 (1.47)	6 (2.36)	3 (1.09) 8 (1.57)
CA Insurance Com-missioner S. Poizner	2 (2.35)	3 (1.29)	0	0	0	0	2 (.73) 3 (.59)
HP President & CEO Meg Whitman	2 (2.35)	3 (1.29)	0	0	0	0	2 (.73) 3 (.59)
White House Staff R. Emanuel	2 (2.35)	0	0	0	0	0	2 (.73) 0
Sen. Lindsey Graham	1 (1.18)	3 (1.29)	0	0	0	0	1 (.36) 3 (.59)
Minority Leader Nancy Pelosi	0	2 (.86)	0	0	0	2 (.78)	0 4 (.79)
First Lady Michelle Obama	0	1 (.43)	0	1 (4.55)	0	0	0 2 (.39)
Other Anglo political Actors (ie N. Pelosi & others)	5 (5.88)	19 (8.15)	2 (3.77)	2 (9.09)	15 (11.03)	14 (5.51)	22 (8.03) 35 (6.88)
Other non-white politicians (ie, E. Holder)	4 (4.71)	14 (6.01	0	0	10 (7.35)	21 (8.27)	14 (5.11) 35 (6.88)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

Not only is it important for English news consumers to be told the news story: it is crucial for them to also *see* specific political representatives associated with SB 1070. While English newspapers mainly focused on politicians who supported this law, as will be seen here, Spanish newspapers will focus on Latino politicians who opposed it. Exposing readers to the political actors involved in this legislative effort is crucial; it puts a face to the name in the news stories. More importantly, politicians hold power in certain branches and sectors of government. News consumers can be aware not only of politicians and their physical traits but, more importantly, of their political stance on SB 1070 through captions.

There are many photos that show these politicians. Without a doubt, Arizona Governor Jan Brewer is displayed the most since she signed the law into effect. In the *Times*, Brewer is shown, speaking from a lectern at a news conference. The caption for this image reads the following: "On her desk: Arizona Gov. Jan Brewer will decide this week whether to allow a controversial crackdown on illegal immigration to become a state law" (Riccardi, 2010e, p. A3). In the *Republic*, Governor Brewer is shown signing the bill into law ("Center of the storm," 2010). In the *Herald*, Brewer is once again pictured speaking into a microphone (Talev & Douglas, 2010). These pictures show Governor Brewer 'in action.' Specifically, she is seen approving SB 1070. She is pictured as one of the main characters of SB 1070 news coverage.

An interesting parallel here is that Jan Brewer appears in nearly 3 percent of all English images; this is the same percentage that former Mexican President Felipe Calderón is displayed. This tie, however, is not the same in Spanish SB 1070 images:

Brewer appears more often than Calderón (1.96 vs. .59).[3] Visually, English SB 1070 images display an American governor (Brewer) and Mexican president (Calderón) at the same frequency. Thus, at these visual and political levels, English newspapers take an approach that acknowledges American and Mexican ties (especially since the majority of these pictures were taken in Congress).[4] The reason that this intercultural frame matters is because it acknowledges some political consideration of our neighbor: Mexico. By showing the president of Mexico, political cooperation between both countries is visually constructed. This is especially important at the local level since each city of these newspapers has high Latino and immigrant populations. Thus, news consumers of these images can be aware of what political players, and ties, are involved in these SB 1070 news stories.

Furthermore, by visually advancing the images of a Mexican president, English newspapers promote tokenist diversity among their intended audience members. Calderón came less than a month after SB 1070 was signed. He came during an important and political moment in which this controversial law was enacted. Calderón argued against SB 1070 as confirmed by the photo captions. He went to Washington, D.C., to meet with President Obama as well as other political representatives as displayed in his images. His visit shows American news consumers that Mexico is involved, and concerned, with SB 1070.

This displays a difference between English SB 1070 texts and images. At the end of the English text results, the type of citizenship that was heavily promoted was legal status. Here, however, a citizenship of collective identity is included. As a result, the

audience of these English newspapers is one that has, at the very least, knowledge of our neighboring country since this non-American politician, Calderón, is visually and frequently promoted.

Viewing Governor Brewer and Mexican President Calderón in SB 1070 English images displays an emphasis on political leaders. An American political and visual presence is observed more in English newspapers (86 images, or 31 percent) than in Spanish newspapers (125 images, or nearly 25 percent). Political figures that perform their professional duties such as speaking to a crowd, like Brewer, or talking to young students, like First Lady Michelle Obama, are commonly displayed in English coverage.

Politicians appear frequently not only because of their association with SB 1070, but also because of their roles. They are not only believers of our government, but also creators of legislative efforts. This specifically includes Brewer, Pierce, and Arpaio, as seen in table 6.3. Opponents of SB 1070, such as presidents Calderón and Obama, are also included in these photos. These images show a visual preference for the Republican lawmakers involved with this law.[5] While the roles of these politicians (Brewer, Pierce, and Arpio) are provided, their support for SB 1070 is also included in captions. Their political stances, as well as their political affiliation, display a citizenship that involves collective identity through the Republican Party For example, as Brewer is pictured signing SB 1070 into effect, she displays her anti-immigrant stance as well as her membership in the Republican Party. In nearly all the captions provided for photos of Brewer, her association to the GOP is mentioned. Furthermore, these captions reveal to readers the anti-immigrant positions of these Republican politicians. By displaying

politicians and their stances, one can infer that these images, indirectly, also promote legal status through frequency of Republic lawmakers and politicians.

Latino Families

Latinos uphold their families and family values. "Traditionally, the Hispanic family is a close-knit group and the most important social unit. The term *familia* usually goes beyond the nuclear family" (Clutter & Nieto, "Understanding the Hispanic culture," para. 1). Latino families also matter in English coverage of SB 1070.

A third finding, in particular, addresses how English newspapers advanced visual constructions of Latino families as demonstrated in table 6.4. This was confirmed, mainly, by captions which included such information as last names, ethnicities (such as Mexican), and statuses (such as "illegal immigrant" as upcoming examples will demonstrate). A total of 29 out of 274 photos, or nearly 11 percent of all English images, pictured Latino family members and children. On the contrary, only 4 percent, or 24 out of 509 photos, of Latino families were shown in Spanish images.

Table 6.4

English SB 1070 Images: Photos of Latino Families

	LA Times *n* (%)	La Opin. *n* (%)	Mia. Her. *n* (%)	D.L. Amér. *n* (%)	Ariz. Rep. *n* (%)	La Pren. Hisp. *n* (%)	Total *n* (%)
Latino Child(ren)	2 (2.35)		13 (24.53)		3 (2.21)		17 (6.20)
(under 18)		7 (3)		3 (13.64)		5 (1.97)	15 (2.95)
Latina mother	1 (1.18)		3 (5.66)		3 (2.21)		7 (2.55)
(w/ kids or other fam)		1 (.43)		1 (4.55)		2 (.79)	4 (.79)
Latino father(s)	1 (1.18)		1 (1.89)		1 (.74)		3 (1.09)
(w/ kids or other fam)		3 (1.29)		2 (9.09)		0	5 (.98)
Whole Family	2 (2.35)		0		0		2 (.73)
Photo		0		0		0	0

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

The difference between how English and Spanish newspapers display Latino families will be discussed in more depth in the next chapter, specifically when discussing the young activists (*los jóvenes activistas*) theme. Under this category, the most popular type of image involved Latino youth. Up to this point, English SB 1070 images frequently displayed group members and politicians to highlight legal status as well as collective identity. Here, a family theme may show cultural diversity and appreciation. It displays, to some extent, inclusion of immigrants through the presence of families in our nation. While the past two themes displayed social and political aspects of this law, through groups and politicians involved, this theme examines a personal trait: family. However, speculation arises: perhaps English coverage includes these family images to show how

immigrant families are a burden on the state. This observation was made by Chavez (2001; 2008) through examining immigrants in magazine covers and other mediated discourses.

There are many photos that display these Latino and immigrant families. Information and facts of immigrants were included in captions attached as observed in past examples in this chapter. In the *Republic*, two particular images show Latina mothers with their child: 1) "Monique Garcia and her daughter Aracely Aceves, 3, pick up a census bag. The town historically has had a low census response" (Náñez, 2010, p. B6); 2) another Latina mother is shown on the phone, while her young son stands next to her. "Claudia Suriano, 27, says she, her husband, and children are moving to New Mexico because of Arizona's migrant law" **(**Kossan, 2010, p. A1). In another image, from this same newspaper, "Mormon Jorge Pimienta, with sons Zachary and Seth, fears families will flee" (González, 2010c, p. A1). In the *Times*, a Latino father, "Aldo Dominguez, carries son Oswald at the *posada* (Mexican gathering) where the police chief addressed Latino concerns" (Watanabe, 2009, A41). Another image from this same newspaper displays a Latino family (mother, father, and daughter). The caption reads: "Family: Maria, a U.S. citizen, and husband Salvador, an illegal immigrant, learned to live with worry" (Esquivel, 2010, p. A1). Lastly, in the *Herald*, several images contain pictures, past and present, of Latino children as part of a news story titled, "Children chase U.S. dream." This news story features six Latino students with the majority of them pictured in their high school cap and gowns *(*Chardy, 2010b, p. B1). These pictures are accompanied with childhood picture of all these students. In another *Herald* special story

on immigration from a historical perspective (the 1980 El Mariel boatlift), three images display Cuban children next to their mothers (Tamayo, 2010, p. A1). While the captions for most of these images contained certain information, such as names and ages, some images, like the boatlift from 1980, contained no captions. One last example under this theme includes a Latino father is shown carrying his son on his shoulders in the *Herald*. They "took part in a protest…against Arizona's immigration law" (Chardy, 2010c, p. A3).

Latino families are frequently shown in these images. However, Latino children are most frequently pictured under this category. Whether a Latina third-grader, Alexandra Trujillo, recites the Pledge of Allegiance during her school's morning assembly, or an 11-year-old Latina, Aileen Romero, is holding the American flag (Nasser, 2010, p. A1), readers are potentially invited to envision a nation where Latino families and children co-exist, with Americans, in common places such as schools. A citizenship of collective identity, as a nation with more than one ethnic family type and culture, is promoted here to a certain extent.

The lack of unified family images, where all members are present, may signify an acceptance of a new family dynamic such as single-parent families as well as step-families. More importantly, white families are hardly seen in English coverage. They are not displayed by English newspapers as family units or protesters. As discussed in the last theme, this is not the case when it comes to political representatives since the majority of politicians in English SB 1070 images as confirmed in table 6.3. Not only is a cultural type of citizenship advanced here, but a sense of acceptance as well. In other

words, while certain immigrants and Latino adults may undergo the difficult citizenship process, the birthright citizenship for children born in the U.S. to undocumented parents appears to be indirectly supported by the frequency of Latino children images. This is the most popular type of image under this familial category. Perhaps, through these images of Latino family members and children, citizenship may be granted for the sake of families and keeping them together.

Many of these English images have denied Latinos the possibility to think of themselves as citizens as observed in the last two themes. However, this category provides some consideration for particular negated members: immigrants. These images, for the most part, not only tell us if a pictured family includes immigrant members or not; they also reveal what their legal status is, as provided through the majority of captions under this theme. This may symbolize an exception that is made when it comes to citizenship: that Latinos and immigrants who have children born in America can, and should, be given special consideration. Perhaps all readers, regardless of ethnicity, can be aware of common frames that solidify Latino presence and family ties in this country.

The Authorities of the Borders

Granting police officers the authority to ask for documentation from anyone who was "reasonably suspicious" was the most controversial clause of this legislative effort. What does "reasonably suspicious" look like? What physical traits would cause such suspicion by law enforcement? Under SB 1070, any non-American individual, such as someone with a foreign accent, would be required to prove their legal status.

The fourth finding examines the most common law and order images, specifically through the photos of police officers and other authoritative figures. In English SB 1070 news images, 28 out of 274 photos (or 10 percent) included images of police officers and the fence (together and separate) that borders the U.S. and Mexico. On the contrary, in Spanish SB 1070 images, only 37 out of 509 images, or 7 percent, displayed authoritative figures including law enforcement. Police officers were shown alone, with other cops, and in the act of arresting others. They were more frequently seen than the border fence and mug shots of criminals as demonstrated in Table 6.5.

Table 6.5

English SB 1070 Images: Photos of Law Enforcement

	LA Times *n* (%)	La Opin. *n* (%)	Mia. Her. *n* (%)	D.L. Amér. *n* (%)	Ariz. Rep. *n* (%)	La Pren. Hisp. *n* (%)	Total *n* (%)
Arrests (Act of Arresting)	3 (3.53)	14 (6.01)	0	0	6 (4.41)	3 (1.18)	9 (3.28) 17 (3.34)
Law Enforcement/ Police Officers	4 (4.71)	5 (2.15)	2 (3.77)	0	3 (2.21)	8 (3.15)	9 (3.28) 13 (2.55)
Borders Fence (people along border, panoramic view)	5 (5.88)	1 (.43)	2 (3.77)	1 (4.55)	1 (.74)	4 (1.57)	8 (2.92) 6 (1.18)
Mug Shots of Criminals	0	0	0	0	2 (1.47)	1 (.39)	2 (.73) 1 (.20)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

Police officers are shown not only along the border, but among other places as well such as protesting demonstrations. In the *Times*, an image is shown of police

intervention; the caption of this picture reads: "Protest: A demonstrator is taken into custody for blocking a street at a federal detention center in Broadview, Ill. to stop deportation from being carried out. Some protesters chanted 'Illinois is not Arizona'" (Gorman & Riccardi, 2010, p. AA1). In another image from this same newspaper, a Phoenix police officer is shown searching an illegal immigrant as explained in the following caption: "Controversy: An illegal immigrant is searched in Phoenix. Attorneys on Thursday foiled the first lawsuits against the law" (Watanabe & Winton, 2010, AA1). One image from the *Herald* displays a particular police officer: "In New York: Police officer Michael Belogorodsky speaks in Russian" ("Agencies want more bilingual cops," 2010, p. A5). Another image, from this same newspaper, shows police cars along the Nogales, Arizona, border fence (Cooper, 2010, p. A3). In the *Republic*, a policeman "with the Phoenix Police Drug Enforcement Unit stands outside a shuttle van office" (Ferraresi, 2010, p. A1). The background of this picture, a white wall, reads the destinations of this business which includes Los Angeles, San Fernando, Fresno, Sacramento, and El Paso. Here, a frame of law and order is advanced through authoritative and law enforcement officials. This signifies that police officers, as well as patrol members along the U.S. and Mexico border, are idealized.

An implied audience is one that believes in law and order, specifically when it comes to protection of borders which is similar to English SB 1070 texts. This may also be considered a preferred, hegemonic interpretation since American police authorities are the ones photographed. Mexican authorities, for example, are never pictured in English or Spanish coverage. News consumers see frequent images of police enforcement, along

with other agencies such as Border Patrol, to symbolize how law and order is enforced. Furthermore, in these police and law enforcement images, immigrants are portrayed as trespassers, as 'enemies.' This is not only noted in this theme but also in the first theme of groups, specifically of the group of immigrants that walked together in a single file line (Gorman, 2010b, p. AA2). By constructing immigrants in a negative frame, police officers can, then, be constructed in a positive frame. In other words, police officers and law enforcement officials are visually seen as upholding such idealized traits such as law, order, and safety.

A negated audience here consists of readers who challenge not only SB 1070 but the extent of power granted to police enforcement. Unintended news consumers may be skeptical of police officers as well as other law enforcement officials. Furthermore, these readers may also be concerned with the new amount of power granted to police forces under SB 1070.

These alarmist images of police and patrol officers send an alert of borders under surveillance. They provide a construction of a border that is militarized. English SB 1070 news images and texts portray a war zone for their intended audience members. These newspapers would have readers believe that 'we,' American citizens, are protecting this nation through law enforcement while 'they,' immigrants cross these borders to enter this land. Protection is needed from 'them,' immigrants. This is why police officers and other law enforcement agencies are photographed: because 'they' are keeping 'us,' citizens, safe. Furthermore, they advance images that indirectly propose a solution: that it is up to American law enforcement to arrest these immigrants. This is proven by the frequency of

images that display arrests. These law and order images construct immigrants as crossing the borders to enter the nation. By advancing these images, borders are portrayed as guarded, closed, and defended. These authoritative images become a way of discoursing about, and indirectly supporting, SB 1070. In other words, legal status continues to be the type of citizenship promoted through images of Republicans and law enforcement.

These images make it clear that immigrants are the outsiders, or out group, who are trying to find a way into this nation. And who better to control this out group than police enforcement and other agencies such as Border Patrol. As officers whose role it is to maintain vigilance on the nation's border, they become icons of the border itself. When depicted in the act of doing their job, such as arresting those who trespass borders or break a law while protesting, the action is enough to define the physical border and, more importantly, the rhetorical context of these images.

Now that these four themes have been explained, the types and tones of citizenship provided in table 6.1[6] may be explained. One of the most frequent types of citizenship from this table is political activity at 27 percent. The themes including group members and SB 1070 political players exemplify how citizenship is visually promoted as both collective identity as well as political activity. These themes display different ways to practice citizenship in political and social manners. Furthermore, many images highlight how citizenship is practiced through action. The last theme, authorities along U.S. and Mexican borders, exemplifies another frequent type of citizenship: legal status. This is consistent with the last two result chapters which also had a dominant frame of legal status.

One interesting result here is that the tone has changed when it comes to English images. Whereas in the two chapters the tone was alarmist, here a frequent tone is affirmative[7] if only slightly more than alarmist. These images, while still upholding legal status as the dominant frame, provide more types and tones of citizenship. As a result, frames shifted, from legal status to political activity and from alarmist to affirmative. Overall, SB 1070 images in English coverage seem to be more emphatic towards immigrants, especially through the theme of Latino families.

Anti-Immigrant Counterframe

One limitation of English news images is seen with the counterframe. Since most English images involved political and police members, or support for SB 1070, the counterframe remains the same as the last two chapters. Here, the counterframe would have displayed those who are excluded since this frame is associated to the third persona. The visual counterframe here would have included individuals who opposed SB 1070. For example, when pictures of politicians were included in English news coverage, their position on this law (pro- or anti-SB 1070) was included in the caption. However, when family images of Latinos are provided, their names and actions are included. Their political stance, however, is usually not provided in the captions (unless it is photographed as described in the earlier example of a Latino father and son at a protest with signs that read, 'Strike Out SB 1070').

The reason why this counteframe may not be visually evident is due to the frequency at which Calderón is displayed. His image is important because it is not an American politician but a Mexican president, a politician outside this country.

Furthermore, in these images, he is shown talking to other politicians, such as Obama and Pelosi, against SB 1070 as confirmed by photo captions. Displaying the Mexican president would make it seem as if the counterframe is present. However, the lack of this counterframe is evident because it is only *one* non-American political figure, out of three Republican politicians (Brewer, Pearce, and McCain), that is frequently photographed. When these three Republican politicians are combined, the frequency total is at 8.03 percent. This is almost three times as many images of Calderón (2.92). In other words, English coverage wants to provide just enough of the counterframe. These newspapers don't want Calderón to be the dominant frame.

As discussed earlier, under the first theme of this chapter, not many pictures displayed opposition, or protest, of this legislative effort. For English newspapers, 26 percent of all images display protest against SB 1070. In Spanish newspapers, protest images appear significantly more than in English protesting images (43 percent). This difference will be explained in the next chapter. By restricting protest pictures, specifically of those who opposed this law, the groups most affected by SB 1070, immigrants and Latinos, continue to be negated.

Implications

In this chapter, the themes that surfaced from the English SB 1070 news images were discussed. While citizenship of legal status continues to be strong in these news images, as it was in the English news texts, some attempts were made by these English newspapers to humanize immigrants through two popular images, specifically of a non-American politician (Mexican President Calderón, who is shown even more than our own

American president) and of Latino family members and children. This shows some recognition not only of a politician from our neighboring country, but also of diverse families. In other words, while legal status continues to be the preferred type of citizenship, additional types of citizenship are presented in English coverage: collective identity (through images of groups as well as Latino families), political activity (through images of politicians), and legal status (through images of authorities along U.S. and Mexico borders).

English newspapers have an array of political (Brewer, Calderón, and Pearce) and non-political (Latino family members) characters visually displayed, as well as a variety of groups (community and police). Despite these various images, English newspapers provided significantly less photos than Spanish newspapers. As will be explained in the next chapter, Spanish newspapers provide nearly three times as many images. Through the variety of images in English coverage, an intended audience of these English newspapers can be aware of another president or type of ethnic family. Citizenship, as this chapter displays, may be more than just legal status at a visual level.

On the other hand, these frames are restricted, for the most part, to specific American sectors. It is no wonder that the American and Mexican borders are frequently shown in English newspapers: because borders are also placed in our visual imagination of immigrants. In other words, English news readers are invited to have cultural appreciation and knowledge, such as that of President Calderón, but not *too much* of it as explained in the last section on the counterframe.

Another implication is the frequency at which the Republican Party and Latino families were included in SB 1070 images. In the wake of the last election,[8] some Republicans realized that if they wanted to court Latinos, they would have to create a strong bond with them. And what better way to connect with Latinos than through family values. Republican Assemblyman Rocky Chávez (R-Oceanside) stated the following recently: "We [the GOP] are a party of values and a party of families, and when we address the immigration issue we will connect with the Latino population" (White, 2013, *The Sacramento Bee* online). Is it possible that perhaps English newspapers are providing frames of the Republican Party and Latino families under the assumption that they go hand in hand? Hopefully, the answer is no, for a connection between the GOP and Latino family values would be incorrect. John Echeveste, creator of the oldest marketing firm in Southern California, explains why this link is invalid: "What Republicans mean by 'family values' and what Hispanics mean are two completely different things…We are very compassionate people, we care about other people and understand that government has a role to play in helping people" (Donald, 2012, *National Review* online). Due to many factors such as class and socio-economic status, the Republican Party has yet to court Latinos in a manner that, genuinely, considers not only family unity but, more importantly, family struggle.

English SB 1070 images have shown more consideration of immigrants and Latinos than English SB 1070 texts. Unfortunately, for the most part, English coverage continues to prefer legal status through images, and symbols, of civic and legal order. Furthermore, this traditional type of citizenship is supported through the frequency of

Republican lawmaker. Through images of aggressive policing of the borders, as well as photographs of political representatives, Arizona's SB 1070 took shape in these English newspapers. In the next chapter, the biggest consideration of immigrants and Latinos will finally be observed: the picturing of the sleeping giant.

Footnotes

[1] Only four images (out of the 783 total images) were not linked to a specific news story. However, since these four images related to citizenship and immigration (specifically becoming an American citizen), they were included in my data set. The four images are the following: two from the *Los Angeles Times* displaying immigrants marching together (in honor of International Migrant Day) as well as immigrants together at a church service at La Placita church ("Voices for Immigrants," 2009); and two images, from the *Miami Herald*, of a group performing the "Pledge of Allegiance during a citizenship ceremony…at the U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services Office in Oakland Park," ("Becoming American," 2010, p. B4), along with family and friends taking pictures of this symbolic moment of citizenship.

[2] These are following amounts of images that display the act of protesting and/or protesters per newspaper: the *Republic* had a total of 38 protest photos out of 136 (28 percent); the *Times* had a total of 25 protest photos out of 85 (29 percent); and the *Herald* had a total 8 pictures out of 53 (15 percent). When the total amount of protesting images is divided by the total amount of English SB 1070 images (or 71 out of 272 total English images), they make up 26 percent. This difference will continue to be discussed in the next chapter.

[3] Another parallel is that Miami's *Américas* does not have one single picture of Gov. Brewer or Mexican President Calderón.

[4] Mexican President Calderón was specifically pictured during his visit to Washington, D.C., in May, 2010. As the caption of the *Times* (Nicholas, 2010) reveals:

"Calderon is in Washington for two days of high-level meetings and a state dinner" (p. A3). In addition to these meetings, he also spoke in front of Congress, denouncing this legislative effort.

[5] Although Calderón tied with Brewer (for the most frequently shown politician in English coverage), the rest of the politicians pictured here, for the most part, belong to the Republican Party. Following this tie, another tie is observed between Arizona Republican Senators Russell Pearce and John McCain (each makes up 7 percent). While two Democratic leaders (President Obama, 2.19, and Homeland Security Janet Napolitano, 1.46) follow Pearce and McCain, the next Republican politician that is pictured the most is Sherriff Joe Arpaio (at 1.09 percent).

[6] As table 6.1 demonstrates, 32 percent (or 88 out of 274 pictures) of the SB 1070 English images were unclear. Unclear images consisted of ambiguous photos and did not illustrate any of the other four types of citizenship used in this study (legal status, political activity, rights, and collective identity). An example of this is an image of Supreme Court Justice John Paul Stevens (Svarzman, 2010, p. 1A). The caption simply states that he is the oldest justice in comparison to the other nine judicial members. Because the caption does not indicate Stevens' stance on SB 1070, it was unclear as to what type of citizenship this image exemplified. Another example is an image of a Honduran native (Daniel, 2009, p. B2). The caption only states his last name, making it unclear as to who he was or what type of citizenship was being exemplified through his head shot. Images like these were considered to be unclear in order to maintain accuracy

and honesty throughout my interpretations. This same logic was applied to the next chapter on the types of citizenship found in Spanish SB 1070 images.

[7] Table 6.1 shows that the majority of the images were coded as neutral (at nearly 65 percent). Neutral, as stated in the methods chapter, is an image that seemed, in my opinion, to be equal or balanced toward the issue of citizenship or immigration. Those images that did not appear as pro or anti- SB 1070 were also considered to be neutral. As the last footnote explains through the example of the image of a Honduran native (Daniel, 2009, p. B2), it was unclear from the photo caption whether or not he was for or against SB 1070 or immigrants. This same logic was applied to the next chapter on the tones of citizenship found in Spanish SB 1070 images.

[8] Latinos voted for President Obama "by a margin of nearly 75 percent to 25 percent" (Donald, 2012, para. 1).

CHAPTER SEVEN

PICTURING THE PROTESTING GIANT:

SPANISH COVERAGE OF SB 1070 IMAGES

"Moreover, if mobilization is a key factor in Latino political participation and empowerment, in what form or fashion does that mobilization news and information take place in the headlines and/or text of the news…content of Spanish-language dailies?"

(Subervi-Vélez, Brindel, Taylor, & Espinosa, 2008, p. 124)

While the study above specifically focused on the print (text) angle of Latino political participation, this chapter is concerned with the visual angle of political engagement in Spanish coverage. Latino political participation, to some extent, was noted in English newspapers. In Spanish newspapers, however, images overwhelmingly highlighted political activity. Specifically, the majority of the images in Spanish coverage demonstrate protests and marches opposing this legislative effort as will be discussed in the upcoming themes. As with the last chapter, photo captions confirmed the necessary details to correctly code and interpret these Spanish images.

Table 7.1 shows the results of the types and tones of citizenship in Spanish SB 1070 images. The most popular type of citizenship in Spanish coverage, political activity, differs from English coverage (since legal status was the main emphasis of those images). These differences will be explained in this chapter. In addition, the following themes will be noted: amalgamation of images and masses, the Latin-American connection, *los jóvenes activistas* (the young activists), and the 'Other' politicians. These themes will be followed by a discussion on the counterframe. Lastly, the implications will be discussed.

Table 7.1

Spanish SB 1070 Images: Types and Tones of Citizenship

	La Opinión *n* (%)	D. Las Américas *n* (%)	La Prensa Hispana *n* (%)	Total *n* (%)
Type				
Political Activity	120 (51.50)	9 (40.91)	100 (39.37)	229 (44.99)
Unclear	71 (30.47)	6 (27.27)	74 (29.13)	151 (29.67)
Collective Identity	14 (6.01)	2 (9.09)	50 (19.69)	66 (12.97)
Legal Status	28 (12.02)	5 (22.73)	26 (10.24)	59 (11.59)
Rights	0	0	4 (1.57)	4 (.79)
Tone				
Neutral	143 (61.38)	12 (54.55)	179 (70.47)	334 (65.62)
Affirmative	61 (26.18)	9 (40.91)	52 (20.47)	122 (23.97)
Alarmist	29 (12.45)	1 (4.55)	23 (9.06)	53 (10.41)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

An Amalgamation of Images and Masses

The biggest finding of these Spanish SB 1070 images is the quantity as noted in the last chapter. There were nearly three times as many photos in Spanish newspapers than in English newspapers. Of these Spanish SB 1070 images, the most frequent image displays demonstrations as seen in table 7.2. The quality of this protesting theme will be discussed, in more depth, in the next two themes. Furthermore, this quantitative

difference of images occurs despite one Spanish newspaper, *Hispana*, being weekly and not daily like the other five newspapers as explained in the methods chapter.

Table 7.2

Spanish SB 1070 Images: Photos of Protests

	LA Times *n* (%)	La Opin. *n* (%)	Mia. Her. *n* (%)	D.L. Amér. *n* (%)	Ariz. Rep. *n* (%)	La Pren. Hisp. *n* (%)	Total *n* (%)
Protesting Pictures	25 (29.41)	110 (47.21)	8 (15.09)	10 (45.45)	38 (27.94)	100 (39.37)	220 (43.22) 71 (25.91)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

While English newspapers usually included one or two images per SB 1070 news story, Spanish newspapers frequently devoted more than that amount especially during April and May of 2010 when SB 1070 demonstrations were at their peak. Furthermore, they showed different types of protesters such as students and even sports fans as upcoming examples will illustrate. Through displaying different types of protesters against SB 1070, Spanish newspapers visually portrayed various activists during this political moment. In other words, the dominant frames observed in Spanish coverage display the political and intense opposition to SB 1070.

Many of the images collected are shown together, placing one on top of the other or next to each other. Horizontally or vertically, montages and collages of images were mainly used to show different visual aspects, and connections, of these protests against SB 1070. For example, in *Américas*, two images show participation in a march titled

'Marcha por América' ('March for America'). The first image, on the top, displays a protester holding a sign that reads, 'Nation of Immigrants.' The second image on the bottom shows Nora Sándigo, executive director of the *Fraternidad Americana* [American Fraternity], a pro-immigration rights group, hugging two siblings, Ronald and Cecia Soza. This picture is taken during a protest in Washington, D.C., as explained in the following caption. "Los niños … hicieron huelga de hambre para evitar la deportación de su madre Maricela Soza" ["The children…went on a hunger strike to prevent the deportation of their mother Maricela Soza"] (Osorio, 2010, p. 1A). The bottom right side of the first image is connected, diagonally, to the top left of the second image.

In *Opinión*, three images are provided for one news story in particular titled "Golpe al contraband de indocumentados" ["Hit to the contraband of undocumented"] (Christie, 2010, pp. 1A, 10A). In the first two images, Drug Enforcement Agency (DEA) officials along with the Transportation Union of Nogales, Arizona, are seen waiting outside a bus station. In the third image of this news story, one particular transportation business, Sergio's Shuttle in Phoenix, is displayed. Another example from this same newspaper contained six images that displayed protests, again at a large scale, across the nation including Los Angeles (two images), New York, Houston, Chicago, and Atlanta. These images were part of a news story titled "Una nación en marcha" ["A nation in marching"] (pp. 6A, 7A). In *Hispana*, eleven images are provided for one single news story, "Protestan sin miedo" ["Protesting without fear"] about a march in Phoenix for human rights (Hernández, 2010, pp. 1A, 1C). Of these 11 images, six of them displayed mass groups of protesters walking together. In particular, one image shows a figure of the

Roman Catholic icon known as the "Virgen de Guadalupe" ["Virgin of Guadalupe"] at the very center of a protesting crowd. Two of those 11 images included authorities who were present at this particular protest. Another image shows two police officers on horses while another image shows seven police officers standing next to one another. Three of these images show only one person, communicating with the crowd through a microphone. One last example, from this same newspaper, provides six photos of mass protests in Phoenix (Padilla & Félix, 2010, pp. 1A, 4A). Though the majority of these images display large crowds of protesters, two specific images focused on 1) a police officer arresting a protester and 2) three college students chained to the doors at Arizona State Capitol Building, in Phoenix. This last image displayed strong opposition of SB 1070 through the symbolic and possible risk on being arrested. The facts of these images, like in the previous chapter, were confirmed through the provided captions. The reason that this amalgamation is noted here, and was not in the last chapter, was due to the overabundance of images in Spanish coverage. Whereas English newspapers provided only one, possibly two images, per news story, Spanish newspapers provided much more.

Large multitudes of protests, and protesters, are frequently seen across the nation in these images including each city of each newspaper studied here. Chavez (2001) referred to this as the "infinityline" to describe "a line of immigrants with at least one end emerging or disappearing, usually at the edge of the cover's border" (p. 69). While he is specifically describing immigrants in magazine covers, the same concept can be applied to this theme. It is not possible to declare that this "infinityline" consists exclusively of immigrants since it was not confirmed in the photo captions; however, the protest

pictures are, without a doubt, against SB 1070. This type of line was not observed in English newspapers because, as stated above, there were not enough quantity of pictures as well as not enough protest images as explained in the last chapter. However, it is safe to say that this "infinityline" can be applied, to some extent, to protesters in Spanish SB 1070 news images. While Chavez argues, in his study, that this "infinityline" was alarmist since "it symbolized an unbounded flow of immigrants" (p. 23), I will argue the opposite: through showing a high quantity of protesters, a 'strength in numbers' visual attitude is promoted.

More importantly, these Spanish images do not *exclusively* show large masses of protesters; they also show other features of these SB 1070 protests. These additional frames included police authorities as well as young children traveling to Washington, D.C., as explained in the previous examples. Protesting, as constructed in Spanish coverage, is multi-faceted. Various actors are involved besides protesters (such as police officers). Thus, an intended audience is concerned not only with the *quantity* of protest images, as seen with the abundance of photos provided both at the macro (with Spanish newspapers representing nearly three times more images than English newspapers) and micro (with Spanish newspapers providing more than one image per news story) level but also with the *quality*, or variety, of protest images provided. These newspapers, for example, show more than just one type of individual involved as well as more than one protesting city.

The images that are negated here, as seen in English coverage, are individual images. Once again, an emphasis on groups is seen at a bigger level in comparison to

English images as demonstrated in table 7.2. In addition, pro-SB 1070 images are rarely advanced in Spanish news coverage.[1] Thus, a negated audience includes those in favor of this legislative effort. As pointed out in the theory chapter, the counterframe can be determined by pinpointing the exact opposite of the dominant frame, as well as considering the third persona, or those who are ignored. Previously, the dominant frame focused on traditional, legal citizenship through supporting SB 1070 through examples such as Republicans and law enforcement. Here, the opposite is true: the lack of pro-SB 1070 images is the counterframe. The dominant frame has switched here: while the last three chapters demonstrated that the most frequent frame supported SB 1070, the dominant frame here is political activity through protest against SB 1070. This switching of frames will be discussed in the counterframe section of this chapter.

While some may view this large number of protesting photos as having no limits, since many images display protesters in line with no conclusive end, I will argue that this displays political activity as a preferred type of citizenship. These images not only display disapproval of SB 1070 but, more importantly, they uphold a notion of immigrant rights. This type of citizenship, of rights for immigrants, is rarely seen. Furthermore, this symbolizes an acceptance and belonging within this nation. This magnitude of demonstrators signified that Latinos will exercise their right to protest and, thus, politically express their attitudes and beliefs on immigration and citizenship. These Spanish SB 1070 images symbolize how protesters voice their political opinions and citizenship frustrations through action.

The Latin-American Connection

"Considering that Mr. Romney's father was born in Mexico, would that allow the candidate to claim a Mexican-American heritage, asked Jorge Ramos of Univision TV" (Goodale, 2012, para. 2). Latinos, we now know, did not believe Romney to be fit for the role of American president in 2012 as seen in the results:

> Latinos, the fastest growing minority, making up 16% of the nation's population, made their mark on election night as they voted for President Barack Obama over Republican Mitt Romney 71% to 27%, a lower percentage than Republican candidates have received in in the last three elections. (Rodriguez, 2012, para. 1)

This is just one example where a Latin-American connection was made specifically to a politician. As discussed in the last chapter, a Mexican-American visual link was made through advancing images of Brewer and Calderón at the same frequency.

A second finding shows Latino culture combined with American culture. Table 7.3 provides the number of images that included specific cultural details such as Mexican flags and Cesar Chavez, the most prominent Mexican American civil rights activist. In addition, several of these images provide signs, at protests, that are both in English *and* Spanish. In other words, a visual combination of these two cultures, Latino and American, make up this second theme.

Table 7.3

Spanish SB 1070 Images: Photos of Mexican American Flags and More

	LA Times *n* (%)	La Opin. *n* (%)	Mia. Her. *n* (%)	D.L. Amér. *n* (%)	Ariz. Rep. *n* (%)	La Pren. Hisp. *n* (%)	Total *n* (%)
Dual Cultures (combo of American flag with Mexican flag *sombrero*, Virgin of Guadalupe, etc.)	3 (3.53)	8 (3.43)	2 (3.77)	1 (4.55)	1 (.74)	7 (2.76)	16 (3.14) 6 (2.19)
Signs linked to immigrants in protest	3 (3.53)	50 (21.46)	1 (1.87)	4 (18.18)	1 (.74)	13 (5.12)	67 (13.16) 5 (1.83)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

Various photos show this duality present. In an image from *Américas*, a woman is seen holding the American flag in one hand and, in the other hand, holding a sign that reads, "Legalización. Ya Somos de America" [Legalization. We're from America]. In addition, she has a *sombrero*[2] on her head with paper signs, on the brim, that read, "Viva America" ["Long Live America"] ("Grupos hispanos apoyan ley de reforma migratoria," 2009, p. 1A). As discussed in the last theme, one specific example displayed two siblings receiving a hug for a Latina advocate (for immigrant rights). This was after they fasted for their mother who faced deportation. The photo that accompanies this one is a male protester holding a sign that reads, 'Nation of Immigrants.' In the background, a blue and white flag is shown accompanying the American flag. It represents the flag from El Salvador (Osorio, 2010, p. 1A).

From *Opinión*, one image shows protesters holding crosses with names written across the horizontal parts of this object. “Miles de cruces son cargadas por inmigrantes en recordación de las muchas personas que han fallecido en su intento por cruzar la frontera” [“Thousands of crosses are carried by immigrants in remembrance of the many people who have died in their attempt to cross the border”] (Cádiz, 2010b, p. 1A). In another example, from this same newspaper, Arizona high school and college students are seen marching together. “Alumnos del Colegio Comunitario Pima, Universidad de Arizona y de la escuela secundaria Tucson High se manifestaron en contra del proyecto de ley antiinmigrante” [“Students from Pima Community College, University of Arizona and Tucson High School demonstrated against the anti-immigrant bill”]. The center of this image shows a male holding a Mexican flag wide over his head (Marrero, 2010, p. 1A). In *Hispana*, one image shows a protester with a bilingual sign that reads: “‘Ya Basta!’ [‘Enough!’]. Enough is Enough. Stop Russell Pearce! Halt SB 1070 Now!” (Félix, 2010b, p. 1A). In another image from this same newspaper, Phoenix councilman Michael Nowakowski stands in front of the White House, holding two small mounted stick flags of America and Mexico (Félix, 2010c, p. 4A). Lastly, another image from this newspaper shows a male and female walking together, with their backs facing the viewer. The female has the Mexican flag vertically covering her back while the male has the American flag covering his back horizontally (“Mexico replanteará relación con Arizona,” 2010, 6E).

This combination of cultures, not only through displays of flags but also of languages, is influential. “As a symbol of the nation, scenes in which the flag is changed

or acted upon can be a powerful metaphor for changes in the nation itself" (Chavez, 2001, p. 76). In this case, the American flag has not changed. Instead, it is not alone in a visual frame. The American flag is not the only flag seen, unlike English SB 1070 images.[3] The inclusion of Latin American flags, such as the Mexican and Salvadorian ones exemplified here, may denote an acceptance, a belonging, of Latin America and its people. In addition, these flags are seen during a protest. As a result, these Latino *and* American flags are symbolic examples that highlight visibility of Latinos and immigrants. Latino civic agency, as seen through these flags, allows one to reconsider not only what it means to participate in civic actions and engagements, but also what it means to be a citizen.

A citizen, as shown in these images, has the option to belong to more than one culture or to know more than one language. An ideal audience, then, involves members who believe in the power of protests and voicing discontent with our American government, laws, and politicians. More importantly, these news consumers value bilingual traits, whether visual (such as through flags) or written (as seen in Spanish and English protesting signs). They recognize other cultures inside *and* outside of this nation. While English SB 1070 images tried to embrace Latinos and immigrants as well, as seen with the examples of Calderón and Latino families in the previous chapter, it is not to the degree of Spanish images as seen in table 7.3 (16.3 v. 4.02 percent).

While the previous three chapters explored news content that did not humanize Latinos or immigrants, Spanish newspapers did the complete opposite: the dominant frame, of anti-SB 1070 protest images, is considerate of Latinos and immigrants. As

discussed in the last chapter, while one could argue that these images also demonstrate collective identity, it is only achieved through a politically active version of citizenship. Whereas the last chapter was mainly concerned with legal status, these Spanish images are guided by anti-SB 1070 protests images, or through the political activity of protesting.

Furthermore, these protest images in Spanish coverage highlight the cultures and ethnicities of Latinos and immigrants. More importantly, these Spanish newspapers promote images that overwhelmingly denounce anti-SB 1070. This political dissatisfaction is proven through inclusion of Mexican flags and protest signs that declare and celebrate not only their cultures but also their right to protest as seen throughout the various cities photographed (including the city of each newspaper examined). More information would be needed to determine if these Latin American flags themselves were inherently a protest. It is hard to support this claim since these flags were usually shown together not separately or individually. At the end of this chapter, in the section on implications, this theme will be linked to 'the sleeping giant' who had a long hiatus.[4]

Los Jóvenes Activistas (The Young Activists)

In 2011, "more than 2,000 Hispanic students in Alabama failed to show up to school on Monday following a federal judge's decision to uphold key parts of the state's tough immigration law" (Portero, 2011, para. 1). Through school absences, students displayed their opposition against a law that required public schools to confirm the immigration status of students. While this is one manner in which students protested against forceful actions (of verifying one's status), Spanish SB 1070 images demonstrated Latino students, and youth, *actually* protesting in the streets.

A third finding establishes that nearly 6 percent (or 30 out of the 509) of these Spanish images consisted of Latino children, teens, and students as seen in table 7.4. These images display Latino youth in anti-SB 1070 protests across the nation. More importantly, they are the focal point in protest images as they are usually placed at the center of an image. While physical traits allowed for inferences of children and youth, such as height, photo captions also confirmed the facts of their age and ethnicity.

Table 7.4

Spanish SB 1070 Images: Photos of Young Latinos at Protests

	LA Times *n* (%)	La Opin. *n* (%)	Mia. Her. *n* (%)	D.L. Amér. *n* (%)	Ariz. Rep. *n* (%)	La Pren. Hisp. *n* (%)	Total *n* (%)
Latino children		12 (5.15)		2 (9.09)		4 (1.57)	18 (3.54)
and babies	0		1 (1.87)		1 (.74)		3 (1.09)
Latino teens		3 (1.29)		0		5 (1.97)	8 (1.57)
	2 (2.35)		0		0		2 (.73)
Latino college		2 (.86)		0		2 (.79)	4 (.79)
students	0		2 (3.77)		0		2 (.73)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

Many photos exemplify this youthful presence. In *Opinión*, one image shows five children holding signs that read, "Legalización Ahora" ["Legalization Now"]. Three of these children wore bandanas, on their heads, of the American flag. The caption confirmed that these protesters were, indeed, children: "La participación en marchas pro inmigrantes forma nexos más allá de lo familiar, al desarrollarse una conciencia humanitaria entre padres e hijos, sobre todo cuando estos últimos nacieron en esta

nación" ["The participation in pro-immigration marches forms ties beyond the familiar, to develop a humanitarian conscious between parents and children, especially since the latter were born in this country"] (Truax, 2010b, p. 3A). In another image, from this same newspaper, a student is seen holding a sign that reads, "Address the root causes of migration." He holds this sign under a huge banner with stars, similar to the ones seen on the American flag (Jaramillo, 2010, pp. 10A, 11A). "Una gran bandera cobija a Damián Cruz, estudiante de 21 años y residente de Nueva York, y quien se movilizó hasta Washington con otros jóvenes inmigrantes" ["A large banner covers Damian Cross, a 21 year-old student and resident of New York, and who traveled up to Washington with other young immigrants"]. Another image, also from *Opinión*, shows a Latino father holding his baby, who is wrapped in an American flag (Truax, 2010c, p. 1A). "Dos generaciones: Juan Rivera con su hijo Daniel, de 8 meses, en la marcha" ["Two generations: Juan Rivera with his son Daniel, of 8 months, in the march"].

More images, from *Hispana*, display this Latino youth in action. In one photo, a young teenage female is seen at a meeting by the 'Red de Acción Fronteriza de Arizona' ['Border Action Network of Arizona']. The photo caption states the following: "Varios niños hicieron fila para ir entregando paquetes de peticiones de veto, alzando la voz por las miles de familias que se verían afectadas con la legislación" ["Several children lined up to deliver packages of veto requests, raising the voice for the thousands of families that would be affected by the legislation"]. In a second photo, three young males are pictured, side by side, with veto request documents in their hands (Padilla, 2010b, p. 1A). In another image, from this same newspaper, Arizona students are seen protesting the law

with signs that read, “Say No 2 SB 1070” and “No Hate! Veto SB 1070! Educate!” The photo caption confirms this age group: “Los estudiantes de Arizona, de diferentes razas, pideron el veto de la SB 1070” [“The students of Arizona, of different races, ask to veto SB 1070”] (“Viven día de unidad,” 2010, p. 1A). Lastly, in *Américas*, a small child is seen holding the American flag, along with a sign that displays the Statue of Liberty (“Piden negar ciudadanía a hijos de indocumentados,” 2010, p. 1A). The photo caption for this image states: “Un niño salvadoreño camina junto a su familia durante una de las marchas a favor de una reforma migratoria” [“A Salvadoran boy walks with his family during one of the marches in favor of a immigration reform”].

The youth displayed in these images are political, unlike the ones seen in the last chapter. In English coverage, children were shown in non-political settings such as with their parents. Spanish newspapers displayed young Latinos, as little as 8-months old, as activists and protesters. This may be linked to the historical example of the East Los Angeles walkouts in 1968. During these protests, thousands of students walked out of their classrooms from such high schools including Woodrow Wilson, Garfield, and Theodore Roosevelt. This was done to protest unethical practices by Los Angeles Unified School District. These protests signified the largest demonstration by Chicano youth. Perhaps these images are advanced to show that the personal is political as several feminist theorists have declared (Mills & Gitlin, 2000; Hanisch, 1970; Morgan, 1970; Campbell, 2005; Hoerl, Jarvis, & Cloud, 2009). For Latino youth, their civic exercise of protesting expresses their personal experiences of being immigrants, or belonging to parents, families, and others who are immigrants. Thus, through this imagery of Latino

youth, a sense of belonging is promoted: activists, no matter how young, should march for immigrant rights. This youthful Latino activism is part of the dominant frame which is against SB 1070. As will be discussed in the counterframe section, this is the opposite of what English newspapers visually displayed specifically in family images.

An intended audience, then, is one that accepts not only Latino-centered imagery, especially through protests, but also one that places no age restrictions on civic participation. These Spanish readers can identify not only with Latinos and immigrants, but with their political actions and civic engagement. Moreover, they also value unity not only among age but culture as well since these children are seen with different flags as well as bilingual protesting signs. While this unity seems to be specifically on Mexican terms, it also recognizes other Latin American countries as explained in previous examples in this chapter.

Supporters of SB 1070, or pro-SB 1070 news consumers, make up a negated audience. Since SB 1070 is a law that racially profiles Latinos, it is no wonder that Spanish newspapers neglected to show protests and supporters for this law. While English SB 1070 images fueled a citizenship of legal status, Spanish SB 1070 images invigorated a citizenship of political activity and, to some extent, rights (see table 7.1). Through these protesting images, which involved Latino children and students, a frame of youthful Latino political participation is visually constructed. All individuals, no matter what age, have the same right and opportunity to participate in political marches.

The 'Other' Politicians

Although *Time* announced that Florida Senator Marco Rubio was the "Republican Savior" (Grunwald, 2013), Latinos, more than likely, will not vote for him in the future. This is mainly for two reasons. The first reason is that Latinos identify more with the Democratic Party than the Republican Party. According to the Pew Research Hispanic Center (2012), "…a rising share of Latino voters say that the Democratic Party has more concern for Latinos than does the Republican Party. Today 61% of Latino registered voters say this, up from 45% in 2011. This is the highest level recorded in Pew Hispanic surveys since 2002" (Lopez & Gonzalez-Barrera, p. 11). The second reason is that, although Rubio won the Senate race, he is only popular in Florida. Cubans, as Latinos know, are unique and not aligned, for the most part, with the rest of this demographic. The Pew Hispanic Center (2006b) reported the following on this special ethnic group:

> Cubans are far more likely than other Hispanics to identify themselves as white when asked about their race. In the 2004 Census data, about 86% of Cubans said they were white…The report said the findings suggest that Hispanics see race as a measure of belonging and "whiteness" as a measure of inclusion, or perceived inclusion. ("Cubans in the United States," pp. 3-4)

In other words, while the majority of Latinos will usually identify as being non-white, Cubans overwhelmingly declare themselves as such. This is why the majority of Latinos are uncertain about Cubans: because they, like Rubio, do not accurately represent Latino culture across this nation. They only compromise 4 percent of the U.S. Latino population

("U.S. Census Bureau: Facts about Cuban Americans," n.d.), making them less popular in quantitative terms. These are just some examples that pose the question: Who is the 'Other' politician?

A fourth finding examines Latino politicians photographed in Spanish SB 1070 images. As noted in the last chapter, the most popular Latino political leader shown was former Mexican President Calderón. This is an opposite finding among Spanish newspapers as seen in table 7.5. A total of 30 images, or 6 percent, displayed Latino politicians.[5] This finding, of 6 percent, was the same for the last theme as well. Among the most popular Latino politicians shown are U.S. Representatives Luis Gutiérrez (D-IL) and Xavier Becerra (D-CA).

Table 7.5

Spanish SB 1070 Images: Photos of Latino Politicians

	LA Times *n* (%)	La Opin. *n* (%)	Mia. Her. *n* (%)	D.L. Amér. *n* (%)	Ariz. Rep. *n* (%)	La Pren. Hisp. *n* (%)	Total *n* (%)
IL Congressman Luis Gutiérrez	1 (1.17)	5 (2.15)	0	0	0	3 (1.18)	8 (1.57) 1 (.36)
CA Congressman Xavier Becerra	0	4 (1.72)	0	0	0	3 (1.18)	7 (1.38) 0
Los Angeles Mayor Antonio Villaraigosa	0	1 (.43)	0	0	0	1 (.39)	2 (.39) 0
Other Latino politicians	2 (2.35)	5 (2.14)	0	1 (4.55)	5 (3.68)	15 (5.47)	21 (4.13) 7 (2.55)

Note: % = word count/total number of words in coverage (x 100).

Although these two Latino male politicians, and Calderón, were visually included the most, there were other Latino politicians pictured in these SB 1070 images as well. In *Opinión*, three images in particular presented political representatives from Latin America. The first example shows Salvadoran President Mauricio Funes at the center of the image, shaking hands with Nancy Pelosi. "Mauricio Funes, presidente de El Salvador, saluda a Nancy Palosi, presidenta de la Cámara de Representantes de EEUU" ["Mauricio Funes, president of El Salvador, greets Nancy Pelosi, chairman of the U.S. House of Representatives"] (Cádiz, 2010c, p.1A). The second example shows consuls meeting in Los Angeles to discuss their opposition of SB 1070. These consuls represent the following Latin American countries as confirmed by the caption: Bolivia, Brazil, Costa Rica, Ecuador, El Salvador, Guatemala, Mexico, Peru, and the Dominican Republic (Alvardo, 2010, p. 1A). The third example from this newspaper shows a political meeting in Guatemala to discuss the opposition of SB 1070. "Legisladores latinoamericanos sesionan en Guatemala" ["Latin American legislators hold sessions in Guatemala"] ("Suman apoyo contra Arizona," 2010, p. 5A).

In *Américas*, an image shows political figure Joe García[6] smiling as he announced he would run for a political position in the House of Representatives. "Joe García, al momento, de hacer su ingreso al MDC con Gabriela, su hija de 12 años" ["Joe García, at the moment, makes his entry to the Miami-Dade Congressional District, with Gabriela, his 12-year-old daughter"] (Boffelli, 2010, p. 1B). In *Hispana*, former senator Alfredo Gutierrez (D-AZ) is pictured talking to a crowd during a protest. "Alfredo Gutiérrez llamó a la comunidad a la resistencia contra las leyes que prácticamente permitirán el

acoso racial" ["Alfredo Gutierrez called the community to resist against laws that practically allow racial harassment"] (Padilla, 2010c, p. 5A). Another example, also from this newspaper, shows Gov. Brewer shaking hands with a political representative from Mexico: "La gobernadora Jan Brewer y su homólogo de Sonora, Guillermo Padrés, en un encuentro oficial celebrando el año pasado" ["Governor Jan Brewer and her counterpart from Sonora, Guillermo Padres, in an official meeting held last year"] (Félix, 2010d, 7A). The last example, also from *Hispana*, photographed the Peruvian consul: "Javier Cuadros, cónsul adjuntos del Perú en Los Ángeles, California" ["Javier Cuadros, Deputy Consul of Peru in Los Angeles, California"] (Félix, 2010e, p. 4A).

Unlike English SB 1070 images, a variety of international political representatives and figures are displayed in Spanish images. Whereas the main Latino political actor in the last chapter was the president of our neighboring country, this chapter includes photographs of anti-SB 1070 political actors *beyond* this country. This theme shows us that Spanish images surpass English images in cultural terms by showing several representatives from Latin America.

An intended audience, then, is one that recognizes national and international actors such as presidents from Central and South America. These readers may consider citizenship to be global, where all nations and all humans are joined as citizens. In other words, a glocal, or global *and* local, frame is advanced. "Glocalization as a concept arose to help alleviate the conceptual difficulties of macro-micro relationship" (Khondker, 2004, p. 3). Spanish newspapers provide images not only of local politicians, like Los Angeles Mayor Antonio Villaraigosa as seen in table 7.5 but also of Latin American

presidents and even consuls. In other words, Spanish newspapers require their readers to think in terms of how ethnicity extends beyond our country.

A negated audience consists of members who display visual and political preferences for American politicians only. In other words, while an intended audience prefers to see protesters against SB 1070 as well as politicians who oppose it, such as Villaraigosa, a negated audience includes those who prefer to see images that support SB 1070 including political actors such as Brewer and Pearce. These negated news consumers may want to see non-Latino politicians and Americans more often as observed with the frequency of images of political actors from the last chapter. In Spanish SB 1070 images, the implied audience is one that is bilingual, while a negated audience is one that is, more likely than not, monolingual. This attitude is confirmed through the frequency of displaying American politicians, law enforcement, and borders as discussed in the last chapter. Here, intended readers are invited to see more than just the president who is near us (Calderón): they can see national and international political representatives from North, Central, and South Americas.

Lastly, another negated audience may be a feminist one since only male Latino politicians were visually displayed. While it is known that there are not many Latina politicians or figures in our nation, there are some who have specifically spoken out against this law. For example, Hilda Solís, who served as the U.S. Secretary of Labor from 2009 to 2013, was only included in one photo, out of the nearly 800 images collected for this study. *Hispana* photographed her speaking into a microphone. “En entrevista telefónica…Hilda Solís dijo que los patrones deben pagar por la visa de los

trabajadores inmigrantes" ["In a telephone interview…Hilda said employers must pay for visa immigrant workers"] (Félix, 2010f, p. 4A). Less than a month after SB 1070 was signed, Solís "flat out said that she 'doesn't agree with what's happening in Arizona'" (Marczak, 2010, para. 2). Another political dignitary is Latina civil rights activist is Dolores Huerta, co-founder of the United Farm Workers of America, who also spoke out against SB 1070. Two English examples included her: 1) an image, from the *Republic*, shows Huerta speaking to the crowd as confirmed by the caption (Rau & Rough, 2010, p. B1); and 2) a *Times* news article states her response to SB 1070 (Riccardi, 2010f, p. A5). Her statement was provided under the theme of SB 1070 political players from the last chapter. Both Solís and Huerta are two political Latina figures who spoke out against SB 1070 shortly after it was signed into law. While few English examples mentioned Huerta, and only one Spanish image included Solís, is not enough to portray Latina politicians against SB 1070.

Granted, there are also some conservative Latina politicians that supported SB 1070 such as U.S. Representatives, and sisters, Loretta and Linda Sánchez from California. Loretta (D-Garden Grove) made the following comment after the Supreme Court decision was announced in June, 2012:

> This ruling by the Supreme Court to strike down large portions of SB 1070 confirms what I have always maintained-that immigration enforcement is a federal responsibility. This is a victory and vindication that state and local municipalities simply do not have the authority to set the law on immigration matters. ("Sanchez statement on supreme court

ruling on the Arizona immigration law," 2012, para. 2)

Linda, on the other hand, was more extreme than her sister: "Rep. Linda Sánchez told Democratic Club Tuesday that she believes white supremacist groups were behind the controversial Arizona law on immigration" (Sprague, 2010, para. 1). All together, these are four Latina political actors who discussed their positions shortly after the approval of SB 1070. They could have been mentioned more, in SB 1070 texts or images, in either English or Spanish coverage. Sadly, they were not. The absence of these Latina politicians will be discussed in the upcoming section.

Before discussing the counterframes, the type and tone of citizenship must be discussed. As table 7.1 demonstrates, the most popular type of citizenship among Spanish SB 1070 images is political activity. This is proven through the last two themes and examples of this chapter. Another popular type of citizenship that is seen here is collective identity since the last three themes of this chapter acknowledge, as Appendix B states, "personal and cultural experiences of how people contextualize citizenship and may go from very local to transnational." The last part, of local to transnational, is especially seen with the different Latino politicians in this country as well as outside of it as explained in the theme of the 'Other' politicians. Not only has the most frequent type of citizenship changed but so has the tone. Once again, in the last three chapters, the tone was overwhelmingly alarmist. Here, since the majorities of these photos celebrate and support immigrants, specifically through opposition of SB 1070, the tone has changed to affirmative. This parallels the dominant, anti-SB 1070 frame. An intended audience here consists of individuals who recognize and appreciate immigrants as well as the 'Other'

politicians. In addition, this is congruent with a rhetoric of inclusion by symbolically showing readers, through political and protest images, that immigrants and Latinos should be accepted into American society.

Switching of Frames and Counterframes

While the counterframe, or lack of challenging SB 1070, was similar in the last three chapters, there is a unique counterframe here: the lack of pro-SB 1070 images. Previously, the dominant frame supported SB 1070 through such emphasis on legal citizens, Republicans, and police figures. As a result, the counterframe in the last three chapters was an anti-SB 1070 frame. In Spanish coverage, specifically in these images, the dominant frame is one of protests against SB 1070. This results in the counterframe being the lack of pro-SB 1070 images. Thus, when it comes to Spanish SB 1070 images, the dominant frame is the counterframe from the last three chapters: against SB 1070.

The counterframe, consisting of pro-SB 1070 images, is hardly presented in Spanish newspapers. And *how* could these Spanish newspapers visually provide images that promoted a law that excluded and frightened Latinos? More importantly, *why* would they visually stigmatize their Latino readers even more? Without a doubt, SB 1070 automatically resulted in fear among Latinos.

> A phone line hosted by the Arizona branch of the American Civil Liberties Union has received almost 4,000 calls in just two days [after law was passed], many from anxious parents who fear their children could be left abandoned should they be picked up under the so-called 'show-me-your-papers' provision…"People are terrified. They fear that they will go to the

> store to buy groceries and won't get home and their kids will be left alone at school," said Luz Santiago, a pastor in Mesa. (Pilkington, 2012, para. 3)

If Spanish news images would have provided pro-SB 1070 images, it would have only contributed to more fear among Latinos which was not necessary then and is certainly not necessary now.

On the one hand, the themes of this chapter demonstrate a sense of inclusion since Latinos and immigrants are the main focus of these images. This is an opposite finding from the last chapter which showed collective groups, American politicians (white Republican lawmakers), and police forces. While this protesting frame celebrates Latinos and cultural appreciation of Latin America countries, as seen with the 'Other' political leaders, this frame does lack in the area of gender. As explained in the last section, a dominant frame in Spanish newspapers includes Latino male politicians. Thus, another counterframe is the lack of Latina feminist images. Despite having at least four Latina political figures speak out against SB 1070, they are rarely included in texts or image, in English or Spanish newspapers.

Implications

Coincidentally, this last chapter (on the results) contains the most radical findings of all this SB 1070 data. These visual findings in Spanish coverage are unique in that sense that they promote political activity the most, unlike the preference for legal status as seen in the previous three chapters. This Latino political participation is encouraged through frequent images of protests across the nation. This is also promoted through the recognition of several Latin American countries in addition to the main emphasis on

Mexico. These results are also powerful because a bilingual and youthful type of citizenship is visually promoted. Lastly, exemplifying more Latin American political actors display a shifts in our attention, from local to national and even international. For example, English coverage only required readers to recognize one international politician: Calderón. In Spanish coverage, readers are required to know more than just one international politician. In other words, having more cultural intelligence, than what English newspapers required, is necessary here. This cultural acumen includes understanding bilingual protest signs, objects such as a *sombrero* and the Virgin Mary, and even historical figures such as Cesar Chavez.

Through these frequent protest images, against SB 1070, readers could observe, with their eyes, how upset and discontent Latinos and immigrants were with this law. These protest images became part of history since they portrayed Latino political mobilization. Moreover, these overwhelming images of anti-SB 1070 protests symbolized that 'the sleeping giant' was finally awake.

'The sleeping giant' is a term used to describe Latinos, specifically the Latino voting bloc. "The reason the Latino group is called a 'sleeping giant' is because they continually disappoint by not showing up at the polls during elections, minimizing their potential power for representation" ("The Sleeping Giant," n.d., para. 1). This 'sleeping giant' doesn't wake up too often which is why it is worth noting when it does rise up from a deep slumber.

When the sleeping giant wakes up, it is due to political discontent. For example, in March, 2006, the sleeping giant awoke after a long sleep. Latino students, immigrants,

protestors, and other organizers were determined to have their voices heard by marching the streets of Los Angeles, as well as other American cities, to send a message: immigrants deserve human rights. These protests were, to a large degree, motivated by Latino opposition to the Sensenbrenner Bill (HR 4437, also known as the Border Protection, Anti-terrorism, and Illegal Immigration Control Act of 2005) which would have resulted in a longer border fence and felony convictions for undocumented or illegal immigrants.

Visually, these Spanish SB 1070 images constantly displayed Latinos and immigrants marching together. These images compromised nearly half of all these Spanish images, as demonstrated in table 7.2. Furthermore, these photos displayed, to some extent, a visible fight not only to oppose SB 1070 but also for rights.[7] The images of civic actions, such as protesting, symbolize not only freedom of speech but also cultural pride of Latin America and all its citizens. Unlike the English newspapers which advanced white, American politicians the most, Spanish newspapers displayed brown, Latino politicians most frequently. These pictures demonstrated a contemporary example of Latino political participation. In other words, 'the sleeping giant' finally woke up in 2010.

Spanish SB 1070 images refine the visual imagery of citizenship through youthful, political participation by Latinos and immigrants. Here, citizenship was frequently observed as that which was worth fighting for. This is the opposite of English SB 1070 images which mainly endorsed citizenship as legal status. In these Spanish newspapers, Latinos and immigrants were *finally* seen as those who were visually

included and politically present. In the last chapter, I will discuss the overall conclusions of this study as well as provide limitations, suggestions for future research, and theoretical and methodological findings.

Footnotes

[1] Out of all the Spanish SB 1070 images (509 total photographs), only one image directly supported SB 1070. In *Opinión*, an image displays a fan at a baseball game at Sun Devil Stadium in Tempe, Arizona. An unidentified male fan holds a sign that reads, 'Illegals Go Home.' (Núñez, 2010, p. 7A)

[2] A *sombrero* is a large hat with wide brims. This word derives from the Spanish word, '*sombra*,' which means 'shade.' *Merriam-Webster Dictionary* defines it as "an often high-crowned hat of felt or straw with a very wide brim worn especially in the Southwest and Mexico." (online)

[3] The Mexican flag is shown only once in each English newspaper. In the *Times*, a protester is seen, in the center of the image, holding the Mexican flag high. "Milagros Vizcaino, 13, of Los Angeles heads home after the peaceful but boisterous march" (Watanabe & McDonnell, 2010, p. A1). In the *Herald*, a Mexican flag is exclusively displayed among protesters as well as other signs in English *and* Spanish (Douglas & Lightman, 2010, p. A1). Lastly, in the *Republic*, Mexican president Calderón is pictured with the Mexican flag in the background (Kelly, 2010b, pp. A1, A5). These are the few English SB 1070 images that display another flag besides the American one.

[4] The last time 'the sleeping giant' awoke was during the 2006 immigrant protests against the Sensenbrenner Bill (HR 4437, or the Border Protection, Anti-terrorism, and Illegal Immigration Control Act of 2005) as well as the reform program proposed by former President G.W. Bush.

[5] In addition to Latino politicians making up Spanish SB 1070 images, African American political leaders were also pictured. However, these images were very few. For example, in *Américas*, the only image of an African American political figure is First Lady Michelle Obama ("No deportarán a mamá que 'no tiene papeles,'" 2010). Other images included civil rights activist Al Sharpton and Representative Barbara Lee (D-CA).

[6] Before announcing he would seek candidacy in the U.S. House of Representatives, Joe García was the director of Minority Economic Impact for the Department of Energy ("Joe Garcia," *Washington Post*, n.d.).

[7] When coding these protesting pictures, only those images that clearly demonstrated a preference for immigrant civil liberties were coded as the citizenship type of rights, as explained in Appendix A. As addressed in the methods chapter, the tones of citizenship required a visual, evident statement for rights of immigrants. Such wording as 'we are human' or 'immigrant rights' on protest signs, or even some indication of that through photo captions, were examples of what qualified citizenship as rights at the visual level. While several protests were shown, it would have been inaccurate to automatically code an image of protests as a citizenship practice, and ideal, of rights. The justification for this was that it was more preferable to code protest images as political activity, regardless of whether they were for or against SB 1070, than rights since it would be an assumption, not a fact.

CHAPTER EIGHT

CONCLUSION: CITIZENSHIP AS LIVING

"I pledge allegiance to the Flag of the United States of America and to the Republic for which it stands, one nation, under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all." This pledge symbolizes my earliest memory of American citizenship. The scene was the Los Angeles Convention Center, on South Figueroa, in 1991. My father, Guillermo Ruiz De Castilla, was among the many participants reciting this as a part of their American citizenship ceremony. My younger brother Paul, age six, and I, age nine, accompanied him to witness this unforgettable moment. When the speaker finally arrived, we all stood up from our seats, waving our little mounted American flags. Before this moment, participating individuals at this event were not considered to be Americans. But at that moment, in that convention center, they were finally naturalized citizens. On this special day, the participants in this room were reciting the national anthem and pledge of allegiance as a symbol of their new citizenship and, more importantly, a new acceptance in this country.

Back then, my brother and I were too young to understand not only what my father was feeling, but what the citizenship process meant and entailed. More importantly, we were too young to comprehend the *luchas*, or struggles, of immigrants in this country. It would be nearly 20 years after this ceremony that my mother, too, would go through the same naturalization process.

Immigrant narratives, like this one, and laws pertaining to them, such as the one examined here, continue to have much urgency in the U.S. Years have passed since SB

1070 was enacted. This law resulted in certain effects. One effect, as visually observed in this study, was the immediate backlash of SB 1070 in April and May of 2010. This was displayed through protests and demonstrations across the nation. A second effect is the federal decision of this law. Arizona's SB 1070 reached the highest court of the land in the summer of 2012, over two years after the law was enacted. Supreme Court Justice Anthony M. Kennedy stated the following concerning this case:

> The National Government has significant power to regulate immigration…Arizona may have understandable frustrations with the problems caused by illegal immigration while the process continues, but the State may not pursue policies that undermine federal law. (Cohen & Mears, 2012, *CNN Politics* online)

The Supreme Court rejected the toughest parts of SB 1070, such as a provision that would have made it a state crime for an immigrant to fail to hold federal registration papers. However, this court maintained the obligation of police officers verifying the immigration statuses of people who they believe are 'reasonably suspicious.' In other words, the heart of SB 1070 remained.

The aim of this study was not to discuss the law itself. Instead, the objective was to determine whether or not Latinos were invited to think of themselves as citizens by media. In addition, this study was interested in the types and tones of citizenship in SB 1070 news coverage. By uniting specific theories—citizenship theory, second and third persona, and news framing—I was able to evaluate the hundreds of SB 1070 texts and images to determine what constructions, on citizenship and immigration, were advanced

the most often. These interpretations were provided in the last four chapters. Content analysis, along with close textual analysis, allowed for more accurate findings as well as readings of the themes found in English and Spanish news coverage as well as intended and unintended audiences. In this last chapter, I will first discuss the limitations of this study followed by suggestions for future research. Third, I will discuss theoretical and methodological considerations. Lastly, I will provide a final discussion of my study.

Limitations

This study aimed at observing the most important themes from SB 1070 texts and images in English and Spanish news coverage over a six-month period. To accomplish this, content and close textual analyses were conducted. The theories utilized for this study, citizenship theory and news framing theory, were discussed following the methods. Over the last four chapters, the findings of all this data were explained.

Discussions on citizenship in the United States will not likely recede anytime soon. For this reason, communication scholars must continue to look at mediated discourses on immigrants, citizenship, and Latinos. These investigations on citizenship and immigration should be encouraged not only to understand how such mediated discourses function and persuade news consumers but to understand the variety of cultures that make up American life and culture. This study examined language through bilingual investigations and translations, in English and Spanish, as well through quantitative, content analysis, and qualitative, close textual analysis, methods. Though contributions were made through this study, there were some constraints.

One limitation of this study is the types of citizenship that are included which were the following four: legal status, rights, political activity, and collective identity. However, other types of citizenship exist. For example, Jarvis and Han (2010) identified other approaches to citizenship: statutory citizenship, participatory citizenship, knowledgeable citizenship, identifying citizenship, skilled citizenship, responsible citizenship, caring citizenship, global citizenship, and justice oriented citizenship. While the four selected for this study involved the most popular citizenship types (Chavez, 2008; Bosniak, 2008), this study was limited in this manner.

A second limitation is the absence of one Spanish daily newspaper from Phoenix. As explained in the methods chapter, our university was not able to obtain a loan for the daily newspaper from this city. As a result, a weekly Spanish newspaper was used instead, *Prensa Hispana*. Therefore, while the English newspapers are complete and consistent with three daily newspapers, the Spanish ones are not. Had the three Spanish newspapers been daily ones, perhaps differences between English and Spanish, as well as texts and words, may have been even more significant. It is my hope that I will be able to obtain support in the future to make this study as complete and consistent as possible which includes obtaining a daily Spanish newspaper from Phoenix.

Suggestions for Future Research

While this study has taken an important step to address the existing gap in communication literature on English and Spanish mediated discourses, much more is still needed. For example, this study was limited in quantitative terms since it only included two coders. Other coders should be considered, ideally college students who are

bilingual. By doing so, more observations can be made and verified. Furthermore, having more coders will solidify popular values and themes perceived in English and Spanish news coverage.

Additionally, other cities should be examined. While the sample for this study included some of the highest Latino populated cities in America, more cities should be included in future studies. For example, cities like New York and Chicago may enrich this study by confirming, or disconfirming, such themes in SB 1070 news coverage. Analyzing more English and Spanish daily newspapers may give us a deeper understanding of how news media covers such laws as SB 1070 as well as citizenship and immigration.

Another area that could provide some additional comprehension into the rhetorical constructions of citizenship is forms of media. Future studies may consider mediated discourses from television and internet news outlets. For Deluca and Peeples (2002), "media are not mere means of communicating in a public sphere or on a public screen; media produce the public sphere and public screen as primal scenes of Being" (p. 151). Following this line of reasoning, the Being of Latino immigrants, then, is constructed for and by media. It would be beneficial, then, to note the similarities and differences among various mediated channels of such mediated discourses.

Citizenship Theory and Methods

By applying citizenship theory, second and third persona, and news framing theory, this study was able to evaluate how English and Spanish newspapers constructed citizenship and immigration as well as audiences that were intended and unintended.

These theories helped solidify important themes, such as illegality and borders, through careful observations of SB 1070 news coverage. Specifically, noting the literal (words) and visual (images) constructions allowed me to recognize who was included, such as American citizens, and who was excluded, such as illegal immigrants or those who did not follow the straight and narrow "pathway to citizenship." The main emphasis of citizenship, as discovered in the majority of English and Spanish SB 1070 news coverage, is on legal status.

In addition, this study resulted in the observations of a multitude of frames. Frames, as described in the theory chapter, are particular perspectives that are used to cover a news story or image. Through such frames of references, in both written and visual texts, narratives surfaced ranging from citizens' to immigrants' stories and pictures. Local perspectives, such as the group members theme from the English image result chapter, emerged not only from the frame itself but also through the frequency of characters, or political actors. In other words, these frames revealed how English and Spanish media defines and describes the processes, of citizenship and immigration, as well as the characters of these news stories, specifically immigrants and citizens. "They [frames] give the story a 'spin'…taking into account their organization and modality constraints, professional judgments, and certain judgments about the audience" (Neuman, Just, & Crigler, 1992, p. 120). When noting the most frequent themes in this SB 1070 news coverage, such as law and order, frames solidified my findings and close readings. Frames went hand in hand not only with revealing citizenship constructions, but also in pinpointing the target news audience and, thus, intended and unintended audiences.

By determining which citizenship constructions were most frequently used, intended audiences could also be determined. As a result, the least frequent citizenship constructions could be observed as well as unintended audiences. Friedland and Zhong (1996) contended that the objective of frames was to operate as "the bridge between…larger and social and cultural realms and everyday understandings of social interaction (p. 13). The frames used to cover this legislative effort signified the realities of certain audiences. For example, English news coverage was mainly concerned about immigrants who did not follow the law or abide by the naturalization process to become legal. In Spanish coverage, a reality that was frequently described was that of immigrants who are excluded, who are not legal, and who are portrayed as not belonging. As discussed in the theory chapter, the traits of inclusion and exclusion mirrored implied and negated audiences. The traits of the counterframe also went hand in hand with the third persona. Having such theoretical duos, of a theory of citizenship as inclusion along with a theory of second persona as well as a theory of citizenship as exclusion along with a theory of third persona, was a new framework that arose from this study. In addition, the counterframe was paired with the third persona. These theoretical anchors have never been used in this fashion. Hopefully, future studies can also use these theoretical duos to guide their investigations on rhetorical and mediated discourses.

The intended and unintended audiences were clarified through second and third persona. As this study displayed, not only were different languages used but so were different tropes, such as the illegal immigrant, and different audiences. The second and third persona revealed those news consumers and audiences who were included and

excluded. As Rivas-Rodriguez (2003) notes, "...mainstream newspapers may use their new Latino inserts as a way to placate the Latino community and continue to leave Hispanic news out of the mainstream" (pp. 27-28). Through these SB 1070 texts and images, the 'Other' was determined through contrasting English news coverage with Spanish news coverage and vice versa. For example, English newspapers mentioned American citizenship most frequently in SB 1070 texts, as well as through American politicians as seen with the images. Negated audiences of English newspapers, Latinos and immigrants, were the opposite in Spanish newspapers. This was observed in Spanish coverage through the frequency of the terms "Latino citizens" over "American citizens" as well as frequency of images including Latino politicians and opposition to SB 1070 through demonstrations across the nation.

Through utilizing content and close textual analysis, the subject matter of SB 1070 news coverage, and the themes associated with it, could be read accurately at quantitative and qualitative levels. "Reading is fundamentally a qualitative process, even when it results in numerical accounts" (Krippendorff, 2004, p. 26). Utilizing both methods permitted for a breadth and depth of citizenship and immigration discourses in news coverage. More importantly, these methods allowed for an appreciation of mediated discourses that is scientific *and* artistic. I learned, through this study, to refer to numerical data for evidence and then use it to support my interpretations. To support my rhetorical claims on citizenship and immigration, I utilized the frequencies and percentages calculated from my data as well as computerized programs. By doing so, my interpretations and close readings could be validated. Thus, similar mixed approaches not

only provide more evidence to support claims, but they also expand the methodological skills of communication scholars.

Discussion

This project provided results and close readings of SB 1070 news texts. The number of SB 1070 stories associated to Latinos, citizenship, and immigration were about the same in English and Spanish coverage. The English daily newspapers studied here (*Los Angeles Times*, *Miami Herald*, and *Arizona Republic*) accounted for nearly half of the total SB 1070 news stories (49 percent). The Spanish newspapers evaluated here (*La Opinión*, *Diario Las Américas*, and *Prensa Hispana*) accounted for nearly 51 percent of all SB 1070 news stories. This is just one of the main findings explained in the last five chapters. Here, I would like to end with my final observations followed by a description of a *Latino rhetorical environment*.

The main research question, as discussed at the beginning, was whether or not Latinos were invited to think of themselves as citizens by media. In addition, a second research question on the frequent types and tones of citizenship utilized by media was also posed. While English newspapers do invite Latinos to think of themselves as citizens, it is an invitation that is strict and traditional, an invitation that is only extended if a "pathway to citizenship" or naturalization process is involved. More importantly, it is a selfish manner of inviting Latinos to be citizens since it is meant to mainly uphold American ideals such as dominance of one language. This was demonstrated through both texts and images of English newspapers. Spanish newspapers, on the other hand, provided different invitations including this legal one. Furthermore, Spanish newspapers

photographed Latinos and immigrants as activists who fought against SB 1070. As explained in the previous chapter through the trope of 'the sleeping giant,' Spanish speaking audiences were invited to march and voice their opinions against this legislative effort and its creators.

Of the nearly 800 SB 1070 news stories analyzed, the themes that were found here were diverse. Another major difference among English and Spanish news stories on SB 1070 was the nationality of citizenship that was preferred. The citizenship that was promoted the most by English newspapers is the American one. Again, this is another opposite finding in Spanish newspapers as seen through the frequency of Mexican citizenship and other citizenships from Latin America.

In addition, Spanish newspapers relate the concept of citizenship with other alternatives such as legal residency. Unlike the English newspapers, these Spanish newspapers at least recognized that there is more than one type of citizenship status that exists. In other words, Spanish newspapers are more open, than English newspapers, to the possibility of Latinos being recognized in this country through other means besides American citizenship such as legal residency. Furthermore, Spanish coverage also promotes citizenship as an exercise, as a political activity like the SB 1070 protests observed.

One main finding that illustrates popular constructions and frames of citizenship are the most frequent words that appeared according to WordSmith. As the first two result chapters demonstrated, on SB 1070 texts, the contexts of these words revealed dominant frames as well as audiences that were included and excluded.

Through the themes of the legal citizen, the illegal immigrant, local police officers, and SB 1070 supporters, frames were observed to see how English newspapers promoted legal status through a conventional and linear sense of citizenship. Through promoting the "pathway to citizenship," SB 1070 English news stories distinguished who was the preferred type of immigrant: those who followed the proper steps to become an American citizen. Illegals are the least preferred type of immigrant. Citizenship as legal status is portrayed as that which is earned, not granted. Moreover, a preference of law and order was also noted through the examples of law enforcement and supporters of SB 1070.

Spanish newspapers, on the other hand, provided immigrants and Latinos with more options than just this one "pathway to citizenship." Despite these alternatives provided in Spanish coverage, a citizenship emphasizing legal status was still present. When carefully considering the most frequent words, in English and Spanish coverage, a similar frame of caution and alert is presented: Latinos and immigrants should be aware of SB 1070 because they, the police, are coming to verify your documentation.

Thus, through this frequency of legal status, both English and Spanish newspapers uphold stereotypes that influence media constructions. These stereotypes include acts of crossing the border, as seen with SB 1070 images, as well as larger implications of immigration within the legal realm. This was upheld, for example, with the attention and emphasis of police enforcement. "It is an ordinary occurrence when U.S. news media covers stories of crime related to border crossings, immigration forces, and the legislation that tried to control actions involving movement across the border" (Chavez, Whiteford,

& Hoewe, 2010, p. 112). News coverage will continue to cover events that occur across the U.S. and Mexico borders because, like a car accident on the highway, viewers simply cannot look away from the event. "…one common theme…is the focus on the illegal, undocumented, or unauthorized entry into the United States, reducing the immigrant experience to the act of border crossing and reifying the border spectacle that has come to play out in U.S. news media" (Sowards & Pineda, 2013, p. 77). The border becomes an enigma which we cannot quite understand. Perhaps this is why, when border images are presented in English coverage, police officers are included as observed in the theme of authorities along the U.S. and Mexican borders from chapter six: to reassure news consumers that law enforcement is trying to alleviate problems along the borders as well as provide surveillance.

Through these appeals to tradition and authority, newspapers, mostly English ones, loaded their news stories with negative associations as seen with the theme of the illegal immigrants discussed in chapter four. These same alarmist tones are observed, for the most part, in the first three results chapters. While Spanish newspapers were also fearful, they displayed other alternatives besides the legal, American citizen and the traditional naturalization process. Furthermore, the majority of these newspapers reinforced the Latino threat narrative. Chavez (2008) explains that "…the Latino Threat Narrative is part of a grand tradition of alarmist discourse about immigrants and their perceived negative impacts on society" (p. 3). These newspapers, for the most part, frequently construct citizenship as that which is innately linked to legal status. As a result, the exclusionary and inclusionary roles can be easily assigned: those who have

undergone the citizenship process, which includes assimilation, are *included* while those who have not are *excluded*. Moreover, a hierarchy in SB 1070 news coverage exists not only among American citizens, who are placed at the top, and immigrants, who are placed on the bottom, but also among immigrant groups themselves. Another hierarchy that exists here includes those images which supported the so-called American Dream:

> Images and discourses of immigrants "making it" as consumers, for instance, simultaneously help feed and establish the myth of American democracy safeguarding the attainability of social and economic prosperity for all, while veiling the actual inequalities reproduced on the basis of people's social, cultural, or racial backgrounds that may affect or hinder economic attainment and progress. (Dávila, 2008, p. 73)

On the one hand, immigrant images are promoted, or placed on top of such hierarchies, if they boast American visions. This is exemplified through the preference of legal citizens as well as the "pathway to citizenship." On the other hand, constructions of immigrants, Latinos, and their struggles, established a presence, as well as a voice for those on the bottom of the order, or for those who are negated.

These depictions of citizens and immigrants are not static or fixed. These pictures of immigrants and Latinos come to signify much more than what meets the eye: "Contemporary images of immigrants, such as that of illegal aliens, do not emerge in a vacuum. Instead, they are part of our nation's history of immigration, race, and nation; they bring with them varied meanings, reflecting their origins and uses" (Flores, 1997, p. 363). Certain (negative) portrayals of immigrants may illustrate certain demands. This

was observed, for example, in the themes of police authorities as discussed in chapters four and six. Through frequency of police enforcement terms and images, an emphasis is noted: watch the borders so that immigrants may be prevented from entering. However, other varied meanings, as discussed throughout this dissertation, include such ideals as law, order, and legality.

By constructing Latinos and immigrants as illegal, undocumented, and unauthorized people, negative and alarmist frames continued to be enforced by these newspapers. This is because media is more concerned with showing alarmist frames than affirmative ones. However, the Pew Hispanic Center (2006b) reports that of the estimated 11.5-12 million undocumented individuals in this country, 40-50% of those immigrants arrived to the U.S. legally through the use of Border Crossing Cards or prolonging their stay beyond their visa expiration date ('Fact Sheet'). Immigrants who follow the legal steps to enter this country are not what is frequently written about or shown in images. This is because such legal, and positive, stories do not make news headlines. Negative immigrant stories and images, such as illegal crossings at the border, are what makes news headlines instead. The emphasis on this type of citizen, as well as immigrant, is crucial since it determines how audiences react to such news coverage on SB 1070 and how readers understand immigrant presence and histories, specifically those from Mexico and other countries from Latin America.

While the majority of SB 1070 news coverage is alarmist, the previous chapter did show a shift from legal status to political activity. To some degree, news consumers of Spanish coverage were able to see citizenship as that which went beyond document

formalities, the legal citizenship process, and even this country. For these audience members, imagery of demonstrations and marches suggested a different call to action where the solution did not involve law and order, as did chapters four through six, but political consciousness and international knowledge instead. These considerations range from cultural objects, such as the Mexican flag, to the photographing of other leaders beyond Mexico. Through these protest pictures, the idea of citizenship was constructed as a mobilizing value. The rhetorical power of such images indicated an engaged relationship between a political community and Latinos, immigrants, and other members.

In addition, newspapers focused more on the state of Arizona than the federal government. On the one hand, this emphasis on the state signifies inclusion within SB 1070 as well as a focus on immigrants who enter this specific border state. On the other hand, lacking consideration of differences among other states excludes not only other contexts, such as a federal level, but also other groups of people. However, SB 1070 is not just about one particular local community. Immigration, and laws associated with it, affects a significant amount of people in every community in various sectors such as politics. This duality, of America and Latin America, is promoted more in Spanish coverage than in English coverage.

This duality may be assisted with a description of a Latino rhetorical environment. This is a setting that takes place not only at a linguistic level, such as switching between English and Spanish, but also a cultural level. It involves constant adjustments as well as considerations of the 'Other' indicating immigrants. A song by Los Lobos sheds light on this back and forth: "We had a notion about an immigrant's

journey – it's a story that starts in one place and ends in a different place" (Balko, 2007, para. 11). The transformations that immigrants go through, with or without American citizenship, have several physical locations and psychological destinations. These transformations affect immigrants, their families, and even citizens.

In the midst of such transformations, collisions are bound to occur. For example, if an immigrant is caught crossing the border, he or she may face a collision with law enforcement. Or if an immigrant works in this country without proper documentation, then they may collide with government officials and agencies. Another example lies with the actual law itself: immigrants increased their chances of colliding with police officers if they looked "reasonably suspicious." These collisions are experienced quite often by immigrants and Latinos:

> Cradled in one culture, sandwiched between two cultures, straddling all three cultures and their value systems, la mestiza undergoes a struggle of flesh, a struggle of borders, an inner war. Like all people, we perceived the version of reality that our culture communicates. Like others having or living in more than one culture, we get multiple, often opposing messages. The coming together of two consistent but habitually incompatible frames of references causes *un choque*, a cultural collision. (Anzaldúa, 1987, p. 100)

For immigrants and Latinos, citizenship involves a 'to and fro' not only between languages, but cultural realities as well. These *choques*, as discussed in chapter one, make up a Latino rhetorical environment: an atmosphere where cultural collisions occur such as

those seen in SB 1070 news coverage between legal versus illegal, white politicians versus Latino politicians, and even national pride through the display of different flags. They are worth noticing since they depict sentiments on citizenship and immigration by mainstream media and, thus, reveal intended and unintended audiences. Noting such cultural tensions in mediated discourses may help us be aware of such immigrant and citizenship constructions through frequencies. For the most part, the dominant frames are not created or advanced to benefit Latinos and immigrants as noted in English coverage. Such observations are crucial to our understanding of citizenship processes, immigrant positions, and border issues.

These *choques* are not only present in mediated discourses, but also the minds of immigrants and Latinos. This is similar to the double consciousness required of African Americans as argued by Du Bois (1903/1962):

> After the Egyptian and Indian, the Greek and the Roman, the Teuton and the Mongolian, the Negro is sort of seventh son, born with a veil, and gifted with the second-sight in this American world- a world which yearns him no true self-consciousness, but only lets him see himself through the revelation of the other world. It is a peculiar sensation, this double consciousness, this sense of always looking at one's self through the eyes of others, of measuring one's soul by the tape of a world that looks on in amused contempt and pity. One ever feels his twoness – an American, a Negro; two souls, two thoughts, two reconciled strivings, two warring

> ideals in one dark body, whose dogged strength alone keeps it from being torn asunder." (pp. 8-9)

Latinos and immigrants live with this double perspective, this double consciousness. It is a skill that involves constant negotiation to be made with others as well as one's own self. In addition, they occur in different settings and sectors as well. Inclusion and exclusion occurs at multiple levels of one's personal, cultural, and even professional life. This study, through the close readings of the themes from SB 1070 coverage, reveals public *choques*. However, there are also private *choques* that Latinos and immigrants experience which are not as frequently mentioned. These agons (Burke, 1950; 1967) occur in public and private settings, to both English and Spanish-speaking news consumers, to American and Latino citizens.

In order to grasp these conscious and political characteristics of citizenship, we may consider the following advice: "We must learn to see ourselves less as U.S. citizens and more as members of a larger world community composed of many nations of people and no longer give credence to the geopolitical borders that have divided us" (Moraga, 1995, p. 219). By increasing our attempts to read and interpret mediated discourses on citizenship and immigration from different cultural perspectives, we can understand not only inclusions and exclusions at cultural and political levels, but also the very essence of being a member in American society.

As scholars of communication, politics and media naturally intrigue us. However, we must not undervalue the roles of language, race, and culture since it influences and distinguishes us from one another. Citizenship has, in the past and present, been

examined from traditional standpoints. For this reason, we must continue to discover those citizenships which are not so traditional, the ones that go beyond legal status as well as this nation. Conducting rhetorical critiques and analyses in other languages and with consideration of other individuals, such as immigrants, not only raises our awareness of politics as observed with SB 1070; it gives insights on new and dynamic complexities of American culture. For the most part, immigrants were viewed, and continue to be viewed, as the 'Other.' They are, typically, negated audience members. They require our undivided attention since they will influence this country in several different ways, in various areas of American life and culture.

The main lesson I learned here was that rhetoric ought to be appreciated as both an art and science. Rhetoric is typically and exclusively considered to be an art as seen with its foundations from ancient Greece. Being able to have numerical evidence, as well as close textual evidence, allowed me to become a better communication scholar. This study also increased my theoretical and methodological knowledge of our field as well as others.

From these years of investigating SB 1070 news coverage in two languages, I have developed an enthusiasm for our discipline. I have gained a much deeper admiration for bilingual perspectives since they are so rarely examined in communication studies and in general. That being said, code switching between English and Spanish is what surprised me the most. Translations are quite difficult. Being able to translate not just the words, but the same meaning was quite a challenge of this study. For this reason, a bilingual editor double checked my Spanish spellings, accents, and translations.

Lastly, the lack of the counterframe surprised and disappointed me. As explained throughout this dissertation, the counterframe is the frame which is critical of the dominant frames of citizenship, or the frame of the third persona. While the heart of this law remains, SB 1070 is a law that allows for the racially profiling of Latinos by law enforcement. It is surprising that news coverage did not challenge this law more by labeling it as "anti-immigrant" more frequently, or describing it as exactly what it was: anti-Latino.

Through providing the citizenship narrative of my parents, I attempted to describe my own introduction to citizenship. While this occurred when I was a child, it is a moment that continues to influence me. Through this study, I have sought to defend my rhetorical findings and conclusions of how media covered this controversial law known as Arizona's Senate Bill 1070. I conclude that citizenship, through its various invitations, is dynamic, changing, and challenging. Citizenship, as I sought to show here, is best learned by being lived.

Appendix A

Types of Citizenship (to aid analysis of news texts and images)

Type	Description
Legal Status	This approach emphasizes the formal and legal aspects of citizenship and the role of the state as an institution (such as drawing the line between citizens and "aliens" when it comes to allocating privileges such as voting) (see Barbalet, 1988; Bosniak, 2006) Visual representations included American documents such as passports as well as political figures, like Maricopa Sheriff Joe Arpaio who was one of the main supporters of SB 1070.
Rights	This approach is all about rights, responsibilities, and privileges corresponding to immigrants (such as denying citizenship to the U.S.-born children of undocumented immigrants) (see Oboler, 2006; Holston & Appadurai, 1999). Visual representations included signs at protests that read 'Immigrant Rights' or 'Human Rights' as well as political figures who stood up for rights of others such as Cesar Chavez and Martin Luther King, Jr.
Political Activity	This approach considers how citizenship is not just a status of rights but is also an expression of membership in a political community (such as the citizenship expectations that Puerto Ricans developed in the United States in the early 20th century) (see Thomas, 2006; Gupta, 2006). Visual representations included individuals protesting as well as others promoting the 2010 Census through their clothing. These include images that show political participation and engagement.
Collective Identity	This approach is based on identity and solidarity in order to acknowledge personal and cultural experiences of how people conceptualize citizenship and may go from very local to transnational (such as the immigrant marches in 2006) (see Anderson, 1983; Flores and Benmayor, 1997, Chavez, 2008, p. 14). Visual representations include cultural objects, such as Mexican flags, by a group of protesters or church members praying against SB 1070. They show a camaraderie of shared group members.

Appendix B

Tones of Citizenship (to aid analysis of news texts and images)

(based on L. Chavez's coding of immigration magazine covers, *Covering immigration: Popular images and the politics of the nation*, 2001)

Tone	Description
Affirmative	This type of image "celebrates immigrants, typically tying them to the nation's identity (e.g., America as a nation of immigrants) or present images that appeal for compassion, especially for refugees" (p. 21).
Alarmist	This type of image "suggest problems, fears, or dangers raised by immigration, such as population growth, demographic changes, a lack of assimilation, a breakup of the nation, or the death of the nation…[they] may also feature words such as 'invasion,' 'crises,' and 'time bomb,' that characterize immigration as a threat to the nation or that appeal to fears and anxieties about immigration" (p. 21).
Neutral	This type of image does "not make an obvious statement of affirmation or alarm or were seemingly balanced in their message. Whenever it was not obvious…it was assigned the neutral category, the logic being that it is better to be conservative when in doubt" (p. 22).

REFERENCES

"A commitment to citizenship." (2009, September 25). *The New York Times*. Retrieved from http://www.nytimes.com/2009/09/26/opinion/26sat3.html?_r=1

Adams, A. (1985). *Ansel Adams: An autobiography*. Boston, MA: Little Brown.

Abranjano, M. & Singh, S. (2009). Examining the link between issue attitudes and news source: The case of Latinos and immigration reform. *Political Behavior, 31*(1), 1-30.

"Agencies want more bilingual cops." (2010, Mar. 12). *Miami Herald*. p. A5.

Alexandre, L. & Rehbinder, H. (2008). Watching the 2000 presidential campaign on Univisión and Telemundo. In F.A. Subervi-Vèlez (Ed.), *The mass media and Latino politics* (pp. 154-177). New York, NY: Routledge.

Althaus, S.L., Edy, J.A., Entman, R.M., & Phalen, P.F. (1996). Revising the indexing hypothesis: Officials, media, and the Libya crisis. *Communication*, *13*(4), 407-421.

Alvardo, I. (2010, May 1). Amparan a sus connacionales [They cover their nations]. *La Opinión*. p. 1A.

Anderson, B. (1983). *Imagined communities: Reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism.* London: Verso.

Arcaute, R. & Calle 13. (2010). Latinoamérica. On Entren Los Que Quieran [Enter those who want to] [CD]. Puerto Rico and Miami, FL: Sony Music Latin.

Archibold, R. C. (2010, April 24). U.S.'s toughest immigration law is signed in Arizona. *The New York Times*, A1.

Arellano, G. (2010, July 8). Make a run for the altar. *LA Weekly*. Retrieved from http://www.laweekly.com/2010-07-08/news/make-a-run-for-the-altar/

Aristotle. (1983). *Poetics*. Cames Lord (Translator). Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Aristotle (1959). *Politics*. Harris Racham (Translator). New York, NY: Putnam's Sons.

Anzaldúa, G. (1987). *Borderlands: La frontera*. San Francisco, CA: Aunt Lute.

Arizona et al. v. United States of America. (2012). Supreme Court of the United States (No. 11-82). Retrieved from http://www.supremecourt.gov/opinions/11pdf/11-182b5e1.pdf

Asen, R. (2004). A discourse theory of citizenship. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, *90*(2), 189-211.

Avon, N. (2011, February 4). "Why more Americans don't travel abroad." *CNN*. Retrieved from http://articles.cnn.com/2011-02-04/travel/americans.travel.domestically_1_western-hemisphere-travel-initiative-passports-tourism-industries?_s=PM:TRAVEL

Balko, R. (2007). How the wolves survive. *Reason*, *39*(1). Retrieved from http://reason.com/archives/2007/04/25/how-the-wolves-survive

Barbalet, J.M. (1988). *Citizenship*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.

"Becoming American." (2010, March 24). *Miami Herald*. p. B4.

Benson, M. (2009, December 14). New Arizona law links services, citizenship proof. *Arizona Republic*. pp. B1, B7.

Bennett, T. (1986). The politics of the "popular" and popular culture. In T. Bennett, C.

Mercer, & J. Woollacott (Eds.), *Popular culture and social relations* (pp. 6-21). Milton Keynes & Philadelphia, PA: Open University Press.

Bennett, W.L., Lawrence, R.G. & Livingston, S. (2006). None dare call it torture: Indexing and the limits of press independence in the Abu Gharib scandal. *Journal of Communication*, *56*(3), 467-485.

Berelson, B. (1971). *Content analysis in communication research*. New York, NY: Hafner Publishing Company.

Berger, P.L. & Luckmann, T. (1967). *The social construction of reality*. New York, NY: Anchor Books. (Original work published 1966)

Bermudez, E. (2010, January 10). Quite a gig for day laborers. *Los Angeles Times*. p. B1.

Billeaud, J. (2010, March 3). Leyes anti inmigrantes [Anti-immigrant laws]. *La Opinión*, p. 7A.

Black, E. (1970). The second persona. *Quarterly Journal of Speech, 56,* 109-119.

Black, E. (1999). The second persona. In J.L. Lucaites, C.M. Condit, & S. Caudill (Eds.), *Contemporary rhetorical theory: A reader* (pp. 331-340). New York, NY: The Guilford Press. (Original work published 1970)

Boffelli, S. (2010, May 19). Joe García pide apoyo de todos los partidos [Joe García asks for support from all parties]. *Diario Las Américas*. p. 1B.

Bogart, L. (1972). *Silent politics: Polls and the awareness of public opinion*. New York: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Bosniak, L. (2000). Universal citizenship and the Problem of Alienage. *Northwestern*

University Law Review, 94(3), 447-509.

Bosniak, L. (2006). *The citizen and the alien: Dilemmas of contemporary membership*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Brader, T., Valentino, N.A., Suhay, E. (2008). What triggers public opposition to immigration? Anxiety, Group Cues, and Immigration Threat. *American Journal of Political Science, 52*(4), 959-978.

Branton, R. & Dunaway, R. (2008). English- and Spanish-language media coverage of immigration: A comparative analysis. *Social Science Quarterly, 89*(4), 1006-1022.

Brettell, C.B. (2006). Political Belonging and Cultural Belonging. *American Behavioral Scientist, 50*, 70-99.

"Brewer: Supreme Court's Arizona decision a 'victory for the rule of law.'" (2012, June 25). *Fox News*. Retrieved from http://www.foxnews.com/politics/2012/06/25/brewer-supreme-court-arizona-decision-victory-for-rule-law/.

Brouwer, D.C. (2001). ACT-ing UP in congressional hearings. In R. Asen & D.C. Brouwer (Eds.), *Counterpublics and the State* (pp. 87-109). New York, NY: State University of New York Press.

Brummett, B. (2000). *Reading rhetorical theory*. Orlando, FL: Hancourt College Publishers.

Burke, K. (1950). *A rhetoric of motives*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Burke, K. (1967). *The philosophy of literary form: Studies in symbolic form*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Burke, K. (1969). A rhetoric of motives. Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press. (Original work published 1962)

BurrellesLuce (n.d.). 2008 Top newspapers, blogs, & consumer magazines. Retrieved from http://www.burrellesluce.com/top100/2008_Top_100List.pdf.

Bystrom, D. G., Banwart, M. C., Kaid, L.L. & Robertson, T. A. (2004). *Gender and candidate communications: VideoStyle, webStyle, newsStyle*. New York, NY: Routledge.

Cádiz, A. (2009, December 17). Defienden límites en el acceso de indocumentados a Exchange [Defending limits access to undocumented Exchange]. *La Opinión*, p. 6A.

Cádiz, A. (2010a, February 10). Cae población de indocumentados [Undocumented population falls]. *La Opinión*, p. 1A, 8A.

Cádiz, A. (2010b, March 22). Inmigrantes expresan urgencia por la reforma [Immigrants express urgency for the reform]. *La Opinión*. pp.1A, 12A.

Cádiz, A. (2010c, March 9). Funes descarta pronta reforma de inmigración [Funes Discards upcoming immigration reform]. *La Opinión*. pp. 1A, 8A.

Calafell, B. M., & Delgado, F. P. (2004). Reading Latino/a images: Interrogating Americanos. *Critical Studies in Media Communication, 21*(1), 1-22.

Campbell, K.K. (2005). Agency: Promiscuous and protean. *Communication and Critical/Cultural Studies*, *2*(1), 1-19.

"Center of the storm" (2010, April 24). *Arizona Republic*. pp A1, A8.

Chalmers, K.A., Humphreys, M.S., & Dennis, S. (1997). A naturalistic study of the word

frequency effect in episodic recognition. *Memory and Cognition*, *25*(6), 780-784.

Chardy, A. (2009, December 16). New bill offers path to legality. *Miami Herald*. pp. 1B, 2B.

Chardy, A. (2010a, January 12). Economic impact of legalization debated. *Miami Herald*. pp. 1C, 2C.

Chardy, A. (2010b, January 1). Children chase U.S. dream. *Miami Herald*. p. B1.

Chardy, A. (2010c, May 16). Taking swings at Arizona law. *Miami Herald*. p. A3.

Chardy, A. & Chavez, J.C. (2010, April 28). South Florida immigration rally planned in response to new Arizona law. *Miami Herald*. pp. 1B, 2B.

Charland, M. (1987). Constitutive rhetoric: The case of the peuple québécois. *Quarterly Journal of Speech, 73*(2), 133-150.

Chavez, L.R. (2001). *Covering immigration: Popular images and the politics of the nation*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Chavez, L.R. (2008). *The Latino threat*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

Chavez, M., Whiteford, S., & Hoewe, J. (2010). Reporting on immigration: A content analysis of major U.S. newspapers' coverage of Mexican immigration. *Norteamérica*, *5*(2), 111-125.

Christie, B. (2010, April 16). Golpe al contrabando de indocumentados [Hit to the contraband of undocumented]. *La Opinión*. pp. 1A, 10A.

Cisneros, J.D. (2012). Looking "illegal": Affect, rhetoric, and performativity in Arizona's senate bill. In R.D. DeChaine (Ed.), *Border rhetorics: Citizenship and identity of the US-Mexico frontier* (pp. 133-150). Tuscaloosa, AL: University of Alabama

Press.

Citizenship (n.d.). In *Oxford English Dictionary online*. Retrieved from http://oxforddictionaries. com /definition/english/citizenship.

Citizenship rights and responsibilities (n.d.). *U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services*. Retrieved from http://www.uscis.gov/portal/site/uscis/menuitem. 749cabd81f5ffc8fba713d10526e0aa0/?vgnextoid=4d4a9b66f5e3a210VgnVCM100000b92ca60aRCRD&vgnextchannel=39d2df6bdd42a210VgnVCM100000b92ca60aRCRD.

Cloud, D. (1999). The null persona: Race and the rhetoric of silence in the uprising of '34. *Rhetoric and Public Affairs, 2*(2), 177-209.

Cloud, D. L. (2004). "To veil the threat of terror": Afghan women and the 'clash of civilizations' in the imagery of the U.S. war on terrorism. *Quarterly Journal of Speech, 90*(3), 285-306.

Clutter, A.W. & Nieto, R.D. (n.d.). Understanding the Hispanic culture. *Ohio State University Fact Sheet*. Retrieved from http://ohioline.osu.edu/hyg-fact/5000/5237.html.

Cohen, J., Tsfati, Y., & Sheafer, T. (2008). The influence of presumed media influence in politics. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, *72*(2), 331-344.

Cohen, T. & Mears, B. (2012). Supreme court mostly rejects Arizona immigration law; gov says 'heart' remains. *CNN Politics*. Retrieved from http://www.cnn.com/2012/06/25/politics/scotus-arizona-law

Connaughton, S. L., & Jarvis, S. E. (2004). Apolitical politics: GOP efforts to foster identification from Latinos, 1984-2000. *Communication Studies, 55*(3), 464-481.

Connaughton, S.L. (2005). Invitations for identifications: An organizational communication analysis of democratic and republican parties' attempts to court Latino voters. *Dissertation Abstracts International, 64*(1), 23A. (UMI No. AAT3077626). Retrieved February 15, 2009 from Dissertations and Theses database.

Cooper, J.J. (2010, April 26). Protesters urging action. *Miami Herald*. p. A3.

Cooper, J.J. & Davenport, P. (April 25, 2010). Immigration advocacy groups to challenge Arizona law. *The Washington Post*, http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2010/04/24/AR2010042402200.html.

Cornelius, W.A. (1998). The structural embeddedness of demand for Mexican immigrant labor: New evidence from California. In M. Suárez-Orozco (Ed.), *Crossings: Mexican immigration in interdisciplinary perspective*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Cornelius, W.A. (2009). Ambivalent reception: Mass public responses to the 'New' Latino immigration to the United States. In M.M. Suárez-Orozco & M.M. Páez (Eds.), *Latinos: Remaking America* (pp) Berkeley & Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press. (Original work published in 2002).

Coutin, S.B. (2000). *Legalizing movies: Salvadorian immigrants struggle for U.S. residency*. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press.

Coutin, S.B. & Chock, P.P. (1995). 'Your friend, the illegal': Definition and paradox in newspaper accounts of U.S. immigration reform. *Identities, 21*(1/2): 123-148.

Croom, A.M. (2008). Racial epithets: What we say and mean by them. *Dialogue, 51*, 34-

45.

"Cubans in the United States." (2006, August 25). *Pew Hispanic Center*. Retrieved from http://pewhispanic.org/files/factsheets/23.pdf.

Daniel, T. (2009, December 1). Honduran native fought for immigrants. *Miami Herald*, p. B2.

Davenport, P. & Carlson, M. (2010, April 29). Referendum could hold up immigration law. *Miami Herald*. p. 3A.

Dávila, A. (2001). *Latinos Inc.: The marketing and making of people*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Dávila, A. (2008). *Latino spin: Public image and the whitewashing of race*. New York, NY: New York University Press.

DeChaine, D.R. (2006). Bordering the civic imaginary: Alienization, fence logic, and the Minuteman Civil Defense Corps. *Quarterly Journal of Speech, 95*(1), 43-65.

de la Garza, R., Brischetto, R., & Vaughan, D. (1983). *The Mexican-American electorate: Information sources and policy orientations*. *The Mexican-American electorate series* (Occasional Paper No. 4). Austin, TX: The University of Texas at Austin, Center for Mexican American Studies.

Deluca, K.M. & Peeples, J. (2002). From public sphere to public screen: Democracy, activism, and the 'violence' of Seattle. *Critical Studies in Media Communication*, *19*(2), 125-151.

Dewhurst, S.A., Holmes, S.J., Brandt, K.R., Dean, G.M. (2006). Measuring the speed of the conscious components of recognition memory: remembering is faster thank knowing. *Consciousness and Cognition, 15*, 147-162.

Disuelven a los Minuteman. [Minuteman are dissolved]. (2010, March 30). *Diario Las Américas*, p. 1A, 5A.

Donald, H.M. (2012, November 7). Why Hispanics don't vote for republicans. *The National Review*. Retrieved from http://www.nationalreview.com/corner/332916/why-hispanics- dont-vote-republicans-heather-mac-donald.

Douglas, W. & Lightman, D. (2010, May 1). Immigration debate touches a nerve. *Miami Herald*. pp. 1A, 12A.

Douglas, W. (2010, February 9). Immigration overhaul called a vital issue. *Miami Herald*. Retrieved from http://www.miamiherald.com/

Du Bois, W.E.B. (1962). *The souls of black folk*. New York, NY: Avon. (Original work published in 1903)

Duriau, V.J., Reger, R.K., & Pfarrer, M.D. (2007). A content analysis of the content analysis literature in organization studies. *Organizational Research Methods*, *10*(1), 5-34.

Edelman, M. (1977). *Political language: Words that succeed and policies that fail*. New York, NY: Academic Press.

Edmonds, R., Guskin, E., Rosenstiel, T., & Mitchell, A. (2012). Newspapers: Building digital revenues proves painfully slow. *The State of the News Media 2012*. Retrieved from the Pew Research Center's Project for Excellence in Journalism

website: http://stateofthemedia.org/2012/newspapers-building-digital-revenues-proves-painfully-slow/

Ehrenhaus, P. (2001). Why we fought: Holocaust memory in Spielberg's *Saving Private Ryan*. *Critical Studies in Media Communication*, *18*(3), 321-337.

English TV or spanish radio? US Hispanics prefer english media, switch easily between languages. (2009, January 21). *Ipsos*. Retrieved from http://www.ipsos-na.com/news-polls/pressrelease.aspx?id=4249

Entman, R.M. (1991). Framing U.S. coverage of international news: Contrasts in narratives of the KAL and Iran air incidents. *Journal of Communication*, *41*(4), 6-27.

Entman, R.M. (1992). Blacks in the news: Television, modern racism and cultural change. *Journalism Quarterly*, *69*(2), 341-361.

Entman, R.M. (1993). Framing toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, *43*(4), 51-58.

Entman, R.M. (2004a). *Punctuating the homogeneity of international news; abusing prisoners vs. killing civilians.* Paper presented at the American Political Science Association Annual Meeting, Chicago, IL.

Entman, R.M. (2004b). *Projections of power: Framing news, public opinion, and U.S. foreign policy*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Entman, R.M. & Page, B.I. (1994). The news before the storm: Limits to media autonomy in covering the Iraq War debate. In W.L. Bennett & D. Paletz (Eds.),

Taken by storm: The media, public opinion, and U.S. foreign policy in the Gulf War (pp. 82-104) Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Espenshade, T.J. (1997). Taking the pulse of public opinion toward immigrants. In T.J. Espenshade, (Ed.), *Keys to successful immigration: Implications of the New Jersey experience*. Washington, DC: Urban Institute Press.

Esquivel, P. (2010, May 24). Moving deeper into Arizona's shadows. *Los Angeles Times*. p. A1.

Ethnic media overview. (2004). The state of news media: An annual report on American journalism. Retrieved from http://www.stateofthenewsmedia. com/2004/narrative_ethnicalternative_ethnic.asp?media=9.

Ewen, S. (2001). *Captains of consciousness: Advertising and the social roots of the consumer culture*. New York, NY: Basic Books Press.

"Fact Sheet for SB 1070." (2010, January 15). *Arizona State Senate, Forty-ninth Legislature, Second Regular Session*. http://www.azleg.gov/legtext/49leg/2r/ summary/s.1070pshs.doc.htm.

Faller, M. (2010, May 17). Fact or fiction? *Arizona Republic*. p. C2.

Félix, L. (2010a, January 6). Desmantelan casa de seguridad en Phoenix [Dismantling the safehouse in Phoenix]. *Prensa Hispana*, p. 2C.

Félix, L. (2010b, April 7). Cambios en la ley anti-inmigrante [Changes in the anti-immigration law]. *Prensa Hispana*. p. 1A.

Félix, L. (2010c, May 26). Nowakowski en la Casa Blanca [Nowakowski in the White House]. *Prensa Hispana*. p. 4A.

Félix, L. (2010d, April 28). Se debilitan relaciones entre Sonora y Arizona [Relations weaken between Sonora and Arizona]. *Prensa Hispana*. p. 7A.

Félix, L. (2010e, May 19). 'Es una ley draconiana': Cónsul adjunto del Perú ['It is a draconian law': Deputy consul of Peru]. *Prensa Hispana*. p. 4A.

Félix, L. (2010f, February 17). Los reyes de la pizca [The kings of the pinch]. *Prensa Hispana*, p. 4A.

Ferraresi, M. (2010, April 16). 47 arrested in raids vs. human smuggling. *Arizona Republic*. pp. A1, A13.

Finnegan, C.A. (2005). Recognizing Lincoln: Image vernaculars and nineteenth century visual culture. *Rhetoric and Public Affairs, 8*(1): 31-58.

Fishman, J.A. & Casiano, H. (1969, March). Puerto Ricans in our press. *The Modern Language Journal, 53*(3), 157-162.

Flores, L.A. (2003). Constructing rhetorical borders: Peons, illegal aliens, and competing narratives of immigration. *Critical Studies in Media Communication, 40*(4), 362-387.

Flores, W.A. & Benmayor, R. (1997). *Latino cultural citizenship: Claiming identity, space, and rights*. Boston, MA: Beacon Press.

Ford, H. (2006). *My life and work*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. (Original work published in 1922).

Fortalecerá ley antiinmigrante de Arizona marchas del 1 de mayo [Arizona anti-immigration law will strengthen the May 1 marches]. (2010, April 21). *Prensa Hispana*, p. 6A.

Foss, S. K. (2005). Theory of visual rhetoric. In K. Smith, S. Moriarty, G. Barbatsis, & K. Kenney (Eds.), *Handbook of visual communication: Theory, methods, and media.* (pp. 141- 152). Mahwah, NJ: LEA Publishers.

Fox, G. (1996). *Hispanic nation: Culture, politics, and the constructing of identity*. Secaucus, NJ: Birch Lane.

Friedland, L.A. & Zhong, M. (1996). International television coverage of Beijing Spring 1989: A comparative approach. *Journalism & Mass Communication Monographs*, *156*, p. 1-56.

"Fuerte reaccion contra ley que criminaliza a indocumentados" [Backlash against law that criminalizes undocumented]. (2010, April 24-25). *Diario Las Américas*, pp. 1A, 5A.

Gabaccia, D. (1994). *From the other side: Women, gender, and immigrant life in the U.S. 1820-1990*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.

Gamson, W.A., & Modigliani, A. (1989). Media discourse and public opinion on nuclear power: A constructionist approach. *American Journal of Sociology, 95*(1), 1-37.

Gans, H. (1979). *Deciding what's news*. New York, NY: Random House.

Glassner, B. & Loughlin, J. (1987). *Drugs in adolescent worlds: Burnouts to straights*. New York, NY: St. Martin's Press.

Gitlin, T. (2002). *Media unlimited: How the torrent of images and sounds overwhelms our lives*. New York, NY: Holt Paperback Books.

Gitlin, T. (1980). *The whole world is watching: Mass media in the making and unmaking of the new left*. Berkeley & Los Angeles, CA & London, U.K.:

University of California Press.

Goffman, E. (1974). *Frame Analysis: An Essay on the Organization of Experience*. New York, NY: Harper & Row.

González, D. (2010a, February 21). Questions over drop in migrant population. *Arizona Republic*. pp. B1, B7.

González, D. (2010b, April 3). Audit: ICE oversight of police fell short. *Arizona Republic*. pp. A1, A4.

González, D. (2010c, May 18). Migrant-law fallout harms LDS church outreach. *Arizona Republic*. p. A1, A5.

Gonzalez, J. (2000). *Harvest f empire: A history of Latinos in America*. New York, NY: Viking.

Gonzalez-Barrera, A., Lopez, M.H., Passel, J. & Taylor, P. (2013, February 4). The path not taken. *Pew Hispanic Research Center*. Retrieved from http://www.pewhispanic.org/2013/02/04/the-path-not-taken/

Goodale, G. (2012, January 26). Mitt Romney, the first Mexican-American president? *The Christian Monitor*. Retrieved from http://www.csmonitor.com/USA/Elections/Vox-News/2012/0126/Mitt-Romney-the-first-Mexican-American-president.

Gorman, A. (2010a, July 16). Arizona's immigration law isn't the only one. *Los Angeles Times*. Retrieved from http://latimes.com

Gorman, A. (2010b, March 19). Framework set for federal immigration bill. *Los Angeles Times*. p. AA2.

Gorman, A. & Riccardi, N. (2010, April 28). Calls to boycott Arizona growing. *Los Angeles Times*. p. AA1.

Gramsci, A. (1991). *The prison notebooks 1929-1935*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press. (Original work published in 1957).

Greene, R.W. (2002). Citizenship in global context: Towards a future beginning for cultural studies inspired argumentation theory. In G.T. Goodnight (Ed.), *Arguing Communication and Culture* (pp. 100-101). Washington, DC: National Communication Association.

Gregory, D. (1965). Introduction. In J. Petras (Ed.), *We accuse* (pp. 148-149). Berkeley, CA: Diablo Press.

Grunwald, M. (2013, February 18). The republican savior: Marco Rubio became the new voice of the GOP. *Time*. Retrieved from http://www.time.com/time/covers/0,16641,20130218,00.html

"Grupos hispanos apoyan ley de reforma migratoria." (2009, December 16). *Diario Las Américas*. p. 1A.

Gupta, M.D. (2006). *Unruly immigrants: Rights, activism, and transnational south Asian politics in the United States*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Guskin, E. & Mitchell, A. (2011). Hispanic media: Faring better than the mainstream media. Pew Research Center's Project for Excellence in Journalism. *The State of*

the News Media: An Annual Report on American Journalism. Retrieved from http://stateofthemedia.org/2011/hispanic-media-faring-better-than-the-mainstream/#fn-10167-7

Gutiérrez, F.F. (1977). Spanish-language media in America: Background, resources, History. *Journalism History*, 4(2), 34-41, 65-68.

Haas, E. & Dixon, N. (2008). Illegal immigration is a red herring. *A Rockridge Institute Report*. Berkeley, CA. Retrieved August 4, 2011, from http://www.cognitive policyworks. com/resource-center/rethinking-immigration/illegal-immigration-is-a-red-herring/.

Haas, E. (2008). To respect and protect: Expanding our discourse on immigration. *A Rockridge Institute Report*. Berkeley, CA. Retrieved August 4, 2011, from http://www.cognitivepolicyworks.com/wordpress/wpcontent/uploads/2009/06/Expand-Discourse-Immigration.pdf.

Hadley, E.M. (1956). A critical analysis of the wetback problem. *Law and Contemporary Problems, 21*(2), 334-357.

"Haitian child paroled under special circumstances." (2011). *U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services* (online). Retrieved from http://www.uscis.gov/portal/site/uscis/menuitem.eb1d4c2a3e5b9ac89243c6a7543f6d1a/?vgnextoid=f8f42777302b8210VgnVCM100000082ca60aRCRD&vgnextchannel=f8f42777302b8210VgnVCM100000082ca60aRCRD

Hall, S. (1997a). The work of representation. In S. Hall (Ed.), *Representation: Cultural representation and signifying practices*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Hall, S. (Ed.) (1997b). The spectacle of the "other." In *Representation: Cultural representations and signifying practices* (pp. 223-290). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Hamilton, A., Madison, J., & Jay, J. (1787/2008). *The federalist papers*. Lawrence Goldman (Editor). Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.

Hanisch, C. (1970). The personal is political. In P. Allen & S. Firestone (Eds.), *Notes from the second year: Women's liberation* (pp. 1-12). New York, NY: Radical Feminism.

Hardy, V.K. (2003). *Metaphoric myth in the representation of Hispanics* (Unpublished master's thesis). Georgetown University, Washington, DC. Retrieved May 27, 2010, from <http://www.georgetown.edu/grad/cct/academics/theses/ValerieHardy.pdf.

Hariman R. & Lucaites, J.L. (2007). *No caption needed: Iconic photographs, public culture, and liberal democracy*. Chicago, IL: The University of Chicago Press.

Hart, R.P. & Daughton, S. (2005). *Modern rhetorical criticism* (3rd edition). Boston, MA: Pearson.

Hart, R.P. (1984). The language of the modern presidency. *Presidential Studies Quarterly*, *14*(2), 249-264.

Hasian Jr., M. & Delgado, F. (1998). The trials and tribulations of racialized critical rhetorical theory: Understanding the rhetorical ambiguities of proposition 187. *Communication Theory, 8*(3), 245-270.

Hastings, M. (2012, April 19). The politics of SB 1070. *America's Voice*. Retrieved from

http://americasvoiceonline.org/press_releases/the-politics-of-sb-1070-2/

Hayes, A.F. & Krippendorff, K. (2007). Answering the call for a standard reliability measure for coding data. *Communication Methods and Measures*, *1*(1), 77-89.

Henao, L.A. (2009, December 23). Fleeing war and poverty, Africans find a new home. *Miami Herald*. p. 21A.

Hensley, JJ. (2010, February 9). Migrant-law training on tap. Arizona Republic. Retrieved from http://www.azcentral.com/arizonarepublic/

Highman, J. (2002). *Strangers in the land: Patterns of American nativism, 1860-1925.* New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.

"Hijos estadounidenses de indocumentados serán los más afectados por nueva ley" [American children of undocumented [immigrants] will be affected the most by new law]. (2009, December 4). *Diario Las Américas*, p. 1A, 3A.

"Hispanic Population Trends." (2011). *Statistical Portrait of Hispanics in the United States*. Retrieved from http://www.pewhispanic.org/2013/02/15/hispanic-population-trends/ph_13-01-23_ss_hispanics1/.

Hoerl, K.E., Jarvis, S., & Cloud, D.L. (2009). Deranged loners and demented outsiders? Therapeutic news frames of presidential assassination attempts, 1973-2001. *Communicating and Cultural Critique*, *2*(1), 83-109.

Hofsetter, C.R. & Loveman, B. (1982). Media exposure and attitude consistency about immigration. *Journalism Quarterly, 59*, 298-302.

Holston, J. & Appadurai, A. (1999). "Introduction: Cities and Citizenship." In J. Holston (Ed.), *Cities and Citizenship*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Holub, H. (2010, May 9). Public support for SB 1070 drops. *Tucson Citizen*. Retrieved from http://tusconcitizen.com/view-from-baja-arizona/2010/05/09/public-support-for-sb-drops/.

Hopkins, D.J. (2010). Politicized places: Explaining where and when Immigrants provoke local opposition. *American Political Science Review, 104*, 40-60.

Horwitz, L. & Swyers, H. (2009). Why are all the presidents men? Televisual presidents and patriarchy. In L. Goren (Ed.), *You've come a long way baby: Women, politics, and popular culture* (pp. 115- 134). Lexington, KY: The University Press of Kentucky.

Hsiu-Fang, H. & Shannon, S.E. (2005). Three approaches to qualitative content analysis. *Qualitative Health Research*, *15*(9), 1277-1288.

Hughes, G. (2006). *An encyclopedia of swearing: The social history of oaths, profanity, foul language and ethnic slurs in the English speaking world.* New York, NY: M.E. Sharpe Inc.

Immigrant Policy Project (2009). *National Conference of State Legislatures*. Retrieved from http://www.ncsl.org/default.aspx?tabid=19232

Iyengar, S. & Kinder, D.R. (1987). *News that matters: Television and American opinion.* Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Jaramillo, C. (2010, March 22). Caminata que lleva mensaje unificador [Walk that carries unifying message]. *La Opinión*. pp. 10A, 11A.

Jarvis, S. E., Barberena, L., & Davis, A. (2007). *Communicating citizenship: A necessary conversation*. Paper presented to the National Communication Association, Chicago, IL.

Jarvis, S. E., & Connaughton, S. L. (2005). Audiences *implicadas e ignoradas* in English and Spanish language questions in the 2002 Texas gubernatorial debates. *Howard Journal of Communications*, *16*(2), 1-18.

Jarvis, S.E. & Han, S. (2010). Teaching citizenship: Student-led documentary film projects in the communication classroom. *Communication Teacher, 24*, 35-42.

Jensen, R.J. & Hammerback, J.C. (1998). "Your Tools Are Really the People": The Rhetoric of Robert Parris Moses. *Communication Monograph, 65*(2), 126-140.

"Joe Garcia (D-Fla.)." (n.d.) *Washington Post*. Retrieved from http://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/joe-garcia-d/gIQA72jhAP_topic.html.

Jones, T.D., & Rowling, C. (2006). *Abuse vs. torture: How social identity, strategic framing, and indexing explain U.S. media coverage of Abu Ghraib*. Paper presented at the Southern Political Science Association Conference, Atlanta, GA.

Jones-Correa, M. & Leal, D. (1996). Becoming 'Hispanic': Secondary pan-ethnic identification among Latin American-Origin populations in the United States. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 18*(2), 214-255.

Kaleem, J. (2010, February 20). Faith leaders seek diving intervention. *Miami Herald*. p. 1B.

Kelly, E. (2010a, March 15). Migrant reform could be dilemma. *Arizona Republic*. pp. A1, A8.

Kelly, E. (2010b, May 17). Calderón to visit at a tense time. *Arizona Republic*. pp. A1, A5.

Kendall, B.E. (2008). Personae and nature capitalism: Negotiating politics constituencies in a rhetoric of sustainability. *Environmental Communication, 2*(1), 59-77.

Kenski, H.C. (1996). From agenda-setting to priming and framing. In M.E. Stuckey (Ed.), *The theory and practice of political communication research* (pp. 67-83). Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

Khondker, H.H. (2004). Glocalization as Globalization: Evolution of a sociological concept. *Bangladesh e-Journal of Sociology*, *1*(2), 1-9.

King, D. (2000). *Making Americans: Immigration, race, and the origins of the diverse democracy.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Klapper, J.T. (1960). *The effects of mass communication*. Glencoe, IL: Free Press.

Kossan, P. (2010, May 28). Schools see immigrant families departing. *Arizona Republic*. pp. A1, A6.

Krippendorff, K. (1980). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology.* London & Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Krippendorff, K. (2004a). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Krippendorff, K. (2004b). Reliability in content analysis: Some common misconceptions and recommendations. *Human Communication Research*, *30*(3), 411-433.

Krippendorff, K. (2011). Computing Krippendorff's alpha-reliability. *Annenberg School*

for Communication Departmental Papers (ASC). Retrieved from http:// repository.upenn.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1043&context=asc_papers

Kurtz, J.B. (2001). Condemning Webster: Judgment and Audience in Emerson's 'Fugitive Slave Law.' *Quarterly Journal of Speech, 87*(3), 278-290.

Lakoff, G. & Ferguson, S. (2006). The Framing of Immigration. A Rockridge Institute Report, Berkeley, CA. Retrieved August 4, 2011, from http://www. cognitivepolicyresource-center/rethinking-immigration/the-framing-of-immigration/

Lakshman, N. (2010, April 26). Furore over Arizona immigration bill. *The Hindu*. Retrieved from http://beta.thehindu.com/news/international/article410982. eceworks.com/.

LaWare, M.R. (1998). Encountering visions of Atzlán: Arguments for ethnic pride, community activism, and cultural revitalization in Chicano murals. *Argumentation and Advocacy*, *34*(3), 140-154.

Lee, E. (2006). *How the public perceives corporate crisis situations: Testing third-person effects and corporate reputation in business communication*. Paper presented at the International Communication Association Annual Meeting, Dresden, Germany.

Leff, M. (1986). Textual criticism: The legacy of G.P. Mohrmann. *Quarterly Journal of Speech, 72*(4), 377-389.

Leff, M. & Mohrmann, G.P. (1974). Lincoln at Cooper Union: A rhetorical analysis of the text. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, *60*(3), 346-358.

Lester Roushanzamir, E. &Raman, U. (1999) The global village in Atlanta: A textual analysis of Olympic news coverage for children. *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, *76*(4), 699-71.

López, I.F.H. (1996). *White by law: The legal constructions of race.* New York, NY: New York University Press.

Lopez, M.H. (2010). Latinos and the 2010 Elections: Strong support for democrats; weak voter motivation. *The Pew Hispanic Center* (online). Retrieved May 1, 2012, from http://www. pewhispanic.org/2010/10/05/latinos-and-the-2010-elections-strong-support-for-democrats-weak-voter-motivation/

Lopez, M.H. & Gonzalez- Barrera, A. (2012, October 11). *Latino Voters Support Obama by 3-1 Ratio, But Are Less Certain than Others about Voting*. Washington, DC: Pew Research Hispanic Center. Retrieved from http://www.pewhispanic.org/files/2012/10/2012_NSL_latino_vote_report_FINAL_10-18-12.pdf.

Lopez, M.H., Morin, R., & Taylor, P. (2010). Illegal immigration backlash worries, divides Latinos. Pew Hispanic Center. Retrieved from http://www.pewhispanic.org/2010/10/28/illegal-immigration-backlash-worries-divides-latinos/

Lucas, S. (1990). The stylistic artistry of the declaration of independence. *Prologue: Quarterly of the National Archives, 22*(1), 25-43.

Lucaites, J.L. & Hariman R. (2001). Visual rhetoric, photojournalism, and democratic public culture. *Rhetoric Review*, *20*(1/2), 37-42.

Marczak, J. (2010, May 12). Hilda Solis talks immigration [Web log post]. Retrieved from http://americasquarterly.org/node/1546.

Marrero, P. (2010, April 21). Lluven opositores [Opponents rain]. *La Opinión*. p. 1A.

Marshall, T.H. (1950). *Citizenship and social class and other essays*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Marx, K. (1975). 'On the Jewish question.' *Early Writings*. Harmondsworth, London: Penguin. (Original work published 1843).

McCombs, M.E., Shaw, D., & Weaver, D. (1972). *Communication and democracy: Exploring the intellectual frontiers in agenda-setting theory*. Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum.

McLuhan, M. (1994). *Understanding media: The extensions of man*. Cambridge, MA: Massachusetts Institute of Technology Press.

McQuail, D. (1979). The influence and effects of mass media. In J. Curran, M. Gurevitch, & J. Woolacott (Eds.), *Mass Communication and Society* (pp. 70-93). Beverly Hills, CA: Sage Publications.

McQuail, D. (1994). *Mass communication theory: An introduction* (3rd edition). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Menjívar, C. (2006). Liminal Legality: Salvadorian and Guatemalan immigrants' lives in the United States. *American Journal of Sociology, 111*, 999-1037.

"México solidario con sus paisanos" [Mexico in solidarity with their countrymen]. (2010, May 2). *La Opinión*, p. 6A.

Miller, J.J. (1994). The magazine *Charities* and the Italian immigrants, 1903-14. *Journalism Quarterly, 44*, 91-98.

Mills, C. W. & Gitlin, T. (2000). *The sociological imagination* (40th anniversary Ed.).

New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Mitchell, P. (2005). *Coyote waits: Sexuality, race, and conquest in modernizing New Mexico,1880-1920*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Mitchell, W.J.T. (1994). *Picture theory: Essays on verbal and visual representation*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Mondello, S. (1967). The magazine Charities and the Italian immigrants, 1903-14. *Journalism Quarterly*, *44*, 91-98.

Moody, T. (2009). *When America AIDS: Exploring the persona in presidential HIV/AIDS discourse*. Paper presented to the National Communication Association Annual Meeting, Chicago, IL.

Moore, J. & Pachon, H. (1985). *Hispanic in the United States*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.

Moraga, C. (1995). Art in América con accento. In *Latina: Women's voices from the borderlands*. Ed. Castillo-Speed, L. New York, NY: Touchstone. (pp. 210-220) New York, NY: Touchstone

Morgan, R. (1970). *Sisterhood is powerful: An anthology of writings from women's liberation movement*. New York, NY: Random House.

Murphy, T. A. (2003). Romantic democracy and the rhetoric of heroic citizenship. *Communication Quarterly, 51*(2), 192-208.

Náñez, D.M. (2010, May 1). Migrant law might hurt census outreach. *Arizona Republic*. pp. B1, B6.

Nasser, H. E. (2010, May 24). SB 1070 fallout: Fear of the census. *Arizona Republic*. pp.

A1, A6.

Neuman, R.W., Just, M.R., & Crigler, A.N. (1992). *Common knowledge: News and the construction of political meaning*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Newcomb, A. (2013, January 29). "Los Angeles County 'birth tourism' complaints spike." *ABC Nightline*. Retrieved from http://abcnews.go.com/US/birth-tourism-complaints-spike-los-angeles-county/story?id=18337755

Newcomb, H.M. & Hirsch, P.M. (1983). Television as a cultural forum: Implications for research. *Quarterly Journal of Film Studies*, *8*(3), 45-55.

Nicholas, P. (2010, May 20). Obama slams Arizona law during Calderón's visit. *Los Angeles Times*. p. A3.

Nicholas, P. & Hamburger, T. (2009, December 30). White House to fight for an immigration overhaul. *Los Angeles Times*. p. A1.

"No deportarán a mamá que "no tiene papeles." (2010, May 21). *Diario Las Américas*. p. 1A.

Noelle-Neumann, E. (1974). The spiral of silence: A theory of public opinion. *Journal of Communication*, *24*(2), 43-51.

Nowicki, D. (2010, January 6). Migrant issue could haunt McCain in race. *Arizona Republic*. Retrieved from http://www.azcentral.com/arizonarepublic/

Núñez, C. (2010, May 31). Alzan sus voces por la SB1070 [Raise their voices for SB 1070]. *La Opinión*. p. 7A.

Oboler, S. (Ed.). (2006*). Latinos and citizenship: The dilemma of belonging*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillian.

Ono, K.A. & Sloop, J.M. (2002). *Shifting borders: Rhetoric, immigration, and California's proposition 187*. Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.

Ortega, A.M. (2010, February 23). Caen planes antiimigrantes [Anti-immigrant plans fail]. *La Opinión*, p. 1A.

Oshagan, H. (1996). Reference group influence on opinion expression. *International Journal of Public Research*, *8*(4), 335-354.

Osorio, S. (2010, March 20). Niños de Florida se unen a la marcha por América [Children from Florida unite for the March for America]. *Diario Las Américas*. pp. 1A, 2A.

Outernational (2011). Todos somos ilegales: We are all illegals. On *Todos somos ilegales: We are all illegals* [CD]. New York, NY: Outernational.

Padilla, H. (2010a, April 1). Decenas de niños piden veto de ley [Tens [of thousands] of children plead for veto of law]. *Prensa Hispana*, pp. 1A, 5A.

Padilla, H. (2010b, April 1). "Decenas de niños piden veto de ley" ["Dozens of children ask to veto bill"]. *Prensa Hispana*. p. 1A.

Padilla, H. (2010c, March 10). Llaman a la acción contra propuestas de ley [Call to action against provisions of law]. *Prensa Hispana*. p. 5A.

Padilla, H. & Félix, L. (2010, April 21). Arizona en la desesperanza [Arizona in despair]. *Prensa Hispana*. pp. 1A, 4A.

Padín, J.A. (2005). The normative *mullatoes*: The Press, Latinos, and the Racial Climate on the Moving Immigration Frontier. *Sociological Perspectives, 48*(1), 49-75.

Palumbo-Liu, D. (1999). *Asian/American: Historical crossings of a racial frontier.*

Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

Pan, Z. & Kosicki, G.M. (1993). Framing analysis: An approach to news discourse. *Political Communication*, *10*(1), 55-75.

Pande, K. (2006). The effects of September 11, 2001, on media discourse and public opinion toward immigration (Senior honors thesis). University of Michigan.

Pastor, M. & Marcelli, E. (2000). Men N the hood: Spatial, skill, and social mismatch for male workers in Los Angeles. *Urban Geography, 21*(6), 474-496.

Patterson, T. (1993). *Out of order*. New York, NY: Knopf.

Peña, M. (2010, April 21). McCain arriesga una derrota en las urnas [McCain risked defeat at the polls]. *Diario Las Américas*, pp. 1A, 5A.

Perrin, A. (2006). *Citizen speak: The democratic imagination in American life.* Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Pew Hispanic Center. (2006a, March 30). *America's immigration quandary.* Retrieved from http://people-press.org/reports/pdf/274.pdf.

Pew Hispanic Center. (2006b). *Fact sheet: Modes of entry for the unauthorized migrant population*. Retrieved from http://pewhispanic.org/files/factsheets/19.pdf

"Piden negar ciudadanía a hijos de indocumentados." (2010, May 22). *Diario Las Américas*. p. 1A

Pilkington, E. (2012, September 20). Undocumented Latinos in Arizona fear for children as key clause takes effect. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2012/sep/20/arizona-undocumented-latinos-law.

Portero, A. (2011, Oct. 6). Alabama immigration law: Thousands of Hispanic children

skip school after law is upheld. *International Business Times*. Retrieved from http://www.ibtimes.com/alabama-immigration-law-thousands-hispanic-children-skip-school-after-law-upheld-321803#.

"Prensa Hispana Phoenix." (2012). *Echo Media*. Retrieved from http://www.echo-media.com/mediaDetail.php?ID=6567.

Preston, J. (2010, May 1). Immigration Advocates Rally for Change. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from http://www.nytimes.com/2010/05/02/us/02immig.html?_r=1&adxnnl =1&adxnnlx=1285362045-pcHF0NEzitHZgusq9DI9pQ.

"Proponen en San Francisco, California boicot a Arizona" [Proposed in San Francisco, California boycotts Arizona]. (2010, April 28). *Prensa Hispana*, p. 4B.

"Prop. 187 approved in California." (1994). *Migration News*, *1*(11). Retrieved from http://migration.ucdavis.edu/mn/more.php?id=492_0_2_0

Putnam, R.D. (2000). *Bowling alone: The collapse and revival of American community*. New York, NY: Simon & Schuster.

"Phoenix, Arizona QuickFacts" (2013). *United States Census Bureau*. Retrieved from U.S. Census Bureau website: http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/04/0455000.html

Rau, A.B. (2010, March 20). Arizona may toughen laws on illegal immigration. *Arizona Republic*. pp. A1, A8.

Rau, A.B., Pitzl, M.J., & Rough, G. (2010, April 21). Angst rises as Arizona Gov. Jan Brewer mulls. *Arizona Republic*. pp. A1, A12.

Rau, A.B. & Rough, G. (2010, April 30). 3 lawsuits challenge legality of new law

Arizona Republic. pp. B1, B2.

Reder, L.M., Nhouyvanisvong, A., Schunn, C.D., Angstadt, P., & Hiraki, K. (2000). A mechanic account of the mirror effect for word frequency: A computational model of remember-know judgments in a continuous recognition paradigm. *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Learning, Memory, and Cognition*, *26*(2), 3-10.

"Reforma migratoria enfrenta obstáculos" [Immigration reform faces hurdles]. (2009, December 29). *Diario Las Américas*, pp. 1A, 5A.

Reinhard, B. (2010, May 14). Florida candidates back Arizona immigration law. *Miami Herald*. p. 1A.

Reppen, R. (2001). Review of monoconc pro and wordsmith tools. *Language Learning and Technology, 5*(3), 32-36.

Riccardi, N. (2009, December 12). Crusading sheriff takes on his foes. *Los Angeles Times*. p. A1.

Riccardi, N. (2010a, January 1). New Ariz. Law worries immigrants. *Los Angeles Times*. p. A16.

Riccardi, N. (2010b, April 14). Arizona passes strict border rule. *Los Angeles Times*. p. A1.

Riccardi, N. (2010c, April 21). Governor faces tough choices on Arizona's 2 toughest issues." *Los Angeles Times*. p. A10.

Riccardi, N. (2010d, April 30). First lawsuits are filed challenging Arizona's illegal-immigration law. *Los Angeles Times*. p. A5.

Riccardi, N. (2010e, April 21). Governor faces tough choices on Arizona's 2 toughest issues. *Los Angeles Times*. p. A3.

Riccardi, N. (2010f, April 30). First lawsuits are filed challenging Arizona's illegal-immigration law. *Los Angeles Times*. p. A5.

Rivas-Rodriguez, M. (2003). Brown eyes on the web: Unique perspectives of an alternative U.S. Latino online newspaper. London & New York, NY: Routledge.

Roberts, L. (2010, April 24). Desperation leads Ariz. to police state. *Arizona Republic*. p. B1.

Robertson, S. (2013). Transnational student-migrants and the state: The education-migration nexus. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.

Rodriguez, A. (1999). *Making Latino news: Race, language, class.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Rodriguez, C. (1997). *Latin looks: Images of Latinos and Latinas in U.S. Media*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Rodriguez, C.Y. (2012, November 9). Latino vote key to Obama's re-election. *CNN News*. Retrieved from http://www.cnn.com/2012/11/09/politics/latino-vote-key-election.

Rosaldo, R. (1997). Cultural citizenship, inequality, and multiculturalism. In W.V. Flores and R. Benmayor (Eds), Latino cultural citizenship: Claiming identity, space, and rights. Boston, MA: Beacon Press.

Ruiz, V.L. (1999). *From out of the shadows: Mexican women in twentieth-century America.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

"Salvadoreños: el segundo grupo de inmigrantes en EEUU" [Salvadorians: The second group of immigrants in the U.S.]. (2010, January 9). *Diario Las Américas*, pp. 1A, 2A.

"Sanchez statement on supreme court ruling on the Arizona immigration law." (2012 June 25). Retrieved from http://lorettasanchez.house.gov/press-release/sanchez-statement-supreme-court-ruling-arizona-immigration-law.

Santa Ana, O. (1999). "Like an animal I was treated": Anti-immigrant metaphor in US public discourse. *Discourse & Society, 10,* 191-224.

Santa Ana, O., Morán, J., & Sánchez, C. (1998). A wash under a brown tide: Immigration metaphors in California public and print media discourse. *Aztlán, 23*(2), 137-176.

Scheufele, D.A. & P. Moy. (2000). Twenty-five years of the spiral of silence: A conceptual review and empirical outlook. *International Journal of Public Opinion Research, 12*(1), 3-28.

Schudson, M. (1998). *The good citizen: A history of American life*. New York, NY: Harvard University Press.

Schudson, M. (1995). *The power of the news*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Serrano, R.A. & Linthicum, K. (2010, May 27). Arizona law faces federal challenges. *Los Angeles Times* p. A1.

Simon, R. & Lynch, J.P. (1999). A comparative assessment of public opinion toward immigrants and immigration policies. *The International Migration Review, 33*(2), 455-467.

Singer, A. & Massey, D.S. (1998). The social process of undocumented border crossing. *International Migration Review, 32*, 561-592.

Sombrero (n.d.). In *Merriam-Webster Dictionary*. Retrieved from http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/sombrero.

Sowards, S.K. & Pineda, R. (2013). Immigrant narratives and popular culture in the United States: Border spectacle, unmotivated sympathies, and individualized responsibilities. *Western States Communication Association*, *77*(1), 72-91.

Sprague, M. (2010, June 2). Linda Sanchez says white supremacists groups behind Arizona immigration law. *Whittier Daily News*. Retrieved from http://www.whittierdailynews.com/news/ci_15214185.

Stanfill, M. (2008). *From crazy fans to fan comrades and back again: Variable attitudes of tv producers toward fans and their consequences*. Paper presented at the National Communication Association Annual Meeting, San Diego, CA.

Stenberg, G., Hellman, J., Johansson, M. (2008). The memorability of names and the divergent effects of prior experience. *European Journal of Cognitive Psychology*, *20*(2), 312-345.

Stone, P.J., Dunphy, D.C., Smith, M.S., & Ogilivie, D.M. (1966). *The general inquirer: A computer approach to content analysis*. Cambridge, MA: Massachusetts Institute of Technology Press.

Streitmatter, R. (1999). The Nativist press: Demonizing the American immigrant. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly, 76*(4)*,* 673-683.

Stroud, N.J. (2011). *Niche news: The politics of news choice*. New York, NY: Oxford

University Press.

Stroud, N.J. & de Macedo Higgins, V. (2009) Content analysis. In S. Zhou & WM. David Sloan (Eds.), *Research methods in communication* (pp. 123-143). Northport, AL: Vision Press.

Subervi-Vélez, F.A., Brindel, M., Taylor, J., & Espinosa, R. (2008). Spanish-language daily newspapers and presidential elections. In F.A. Subervi-Vélez (Ed.), *The mass media and Latino politics* (pp. 87-130). New York, NY: Routledge.

Subervi-Vèlez, F.A. & collaborators. (1994). Mass communication and Hispanics. In F. Padilla (Ed.), *Handbook of Hispanic Cultures in the United States: Sociology*. (pp. 304-357). Houston, TX: Arte Público Press.

Subervi-Vèlez, F.A. (Ed.). (2008). *The mass media and Latino politics*. New York, NY: Routledge.

"Suman apoyo contra Arizona." (2010, May 15). *La Opinión*. p. 5A.

Suro, R. (2004). Changing channels and crisscrossing cultures: A survey of Latinos on the News Media. *Pew Hispanic Center*. Retrieved from http://www.pewhispanic.org/files/reports/27.pdf

Svarzman, N. (2010, April 13). Se aleja la reforma migratoria [Immigration reform pushes away]. *Diario Las Américas*, p. 1A.

Taley, M. & Douglas, W. (2010, April 24). Immigration debate in U.S. reignited. *Miami Herald*. p. A1.

Tamayo, J.O. (2010, April 18). El Mariel: 30 years later. *Miami Herald*. p. A1.

Tan, C. & Lee, D. (2010, March 22). Huge border reform march. *Los Angeles Times*.

p. AA1.

Terry, A. (2007). *The call for women's activism in Frederick Douglass's "What to the slave is the fourth of July?"* Paper presented at the International Communication Association Annual Meeting, San Francisco, CA.

"The Sleeping Giant." (n.d.). *Latino Voters*. Retrieved from http://latinovoters.weebly.com/

Thomas, L. (2006). "How they ignore our rights as American citizens": Puerto Rican migrants and the politics of citizenship in the New Deal era. In S. Oboler (Ed.), *Latinos and citizenship: The dilemma of belonging* (pp. 33-58). New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.

Times Topics: Joe Arpaio (2012, August 1). *The New York Times*. Retrieved from http://topics.nytimes.com/topics/reference/timestopics/people/a/joseph_m_arpaio/index.html

Tobar, H. (2010a, January 4). L.A. thrives when Latinos do. *Los Angeles Times*. Retrieved from http://www.latimes.com

Tobar, H. (2010b, February 26). Immigrants also frustrated. *Los Angeles Times*. p. A2.

Truax, E. (2010a, February 6). México pedirá pasaporte a quien llegue de EEUU [Mexico will ask for Passport from those who come to the U.S.]. *La Opinión*, pp. 1A, 6A.

Truax, E. (2010b, March 14). Se refuerzan lazos migratorios [Migration ties are strengthened]. *La Opinión*. p. 3A.

Truax, E. (2010c, Mar. 28). Mensaje de unidad recorre Los Ángeles [Message of unity travels through Los Angeles]. *La Opinión*. p. 1A.

Tuchman, G. (1978). *Making news: A study of the construction of reality*. New York, NY: Free Press.

Turner, B.S. (Ed.). (1993). Contemporary problems in the theory of citizenship. In *Citizenship and Social Theory* (pp. 1-19). Newbury Park, CA; Sage.

Turner, P.K. & Ryden, R. (2000). How George Bush silence Anita Hill: A derridian view of the third persona in public argument. *Argumentation and Advocacy, 37*(2), 86-97.

"Una nación en marcha" ["A nation in marching"]. (2010, May 2). *La Opinión*. pp. 6A, 7A.

United Press International (2010, April 29). Poll: Most Support Arizona Law. *U.S. News*. http://www.upi.com/Top_News/US/2010/04/29/Poll-Most-support-Arizona-immigration-law/UPI-55921272544207/.

"U.S. Census Bureau: Facts about Cuban-Americans." (n.d.). *Cuban American Bar Association*. Retrieved from http://www.cabaonline.com/page/us-census-bureau-facts-about-cuban-americans.

U.S. Census Bureau, Population Division (2006). *Estimates of population change for the United States and States, and for Puerto Rico and state rankings: July 1, 2005 to July 1, 2006. 2006 Population Estimates*. Retrieved from http://www.census. gov/Press- Release/www/2006/statepopest_table1.xls.

U.S. Department of Commerce. (2000). *Unites States Census 2000*. Retrieved from 2009, from http://www.census.gov/main/www/cen2000.html.

Valenzuela, S. (2008). Variations in media priming: The moderate role of knowledge,

interests, news attention, and discussion. *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, *86*(4), 756-774.

"Viven día de unidad" ["Day of unity lives"]. (2010, April 28). *Prensa Hispana*. P. 1A.

"Voices for immigrants." (2009, December 19). *Los Angeles Times*. p. A7.

Waldinger, R. (1997). Black/Immigrant competition re-assessed: New evidence from Los Angeles. *Sociological Perspectives, 40*(2), 365-386.

Wander, P. (1983). The ideological turn in modern criticism. *Central States Speech Journal, 35*, 1-18.

Wander, P. (1984). The third persona: An ideological turn in rhetorical theory. *Central States Speech Journal, 35,* 197-216.

Watanabe, T. (2009, December 20). Beck affirms rule about immigrants. *Los Angeles Times*. pp. A41, A48.

Watanabe, T. (2010, February 11). Illegal immigrant numbers plummet. *Los Angeles Times*. Retrieved from http://www.latimes.com

Watanabe, T. & McDonnell, P. (2010, May 2). Protesters nationwide call for immigration overhaul. *Los Angeles Times*. p. A1.

Wantanabe, T. & Winton, R. (2010, April 30). Mayor backs Ariz. boycott. *Los Angeles Times*. p. AA1.

Weaver, W. & Shannon, C.E. (1963). A mathematical theory of communication. *Bell System Technical Journal*, *27*, 379–423.

White, J.B. (2013, March 4). California GOP seeks news emphasis on Latino outreach.

The Sacramento Bee. Retrieved from http://www.sacbee.com/2013/03/04/5233281/california-gop-seeks-new-emphasis.html.

"Type/token ratios and the standardised type/token ratio." (2010). Wordsmith Tools. Retrieved from http://www.lexically.net/downloads/version5/HTML/index.html?type_token_ratio_proc.htm.

Williams, D.C. & Marin, N. (2010). *Citizen Putin: Presidential argument and the invitation to (democratic) citizenship*. Paper presented at the National Communication Association/American Forensic Association Annual Meeting (Alta Conference on Argumentation), Salt Lake City, UT.

Wyner, T. (1988). *Hispanic USA: Breaking the melting pot*. New York, NY: Harper Row.

VITA

Clariza Ruiz De Castilla was born in Hawthorne, California, in March of 1982. She is the daughter of Clariza Arizaga and Lester Ruiz De Castilla. After completing her work at Notre Dame High School, in Riverside, California, in 2000, she entered the University of La Verne, in La Verne, California. She received the degree of Bachelor of Arts from the University of La Verne in Speech Communication in May, 2004. During the next year she taught English and Spanish in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. In January of 2005 she entered the Graduate School of California State University, Los Angeles, and was graduated with a Master of Arts in Communication Studies during the summer of 2007. In August of 2007 she entered the Graduate School of the University of Texas, Austin. She has taught college level communication courses at California State University, Los Angeles, the University of Texas, Austin, and St. Edward's University and has published and co-published book chapters in the field of communication.

Permanent address (or email): clarizaruizdc@gmail.com

This dissertation was typed by the author.